AUSTRALASIAN VETERINARY BOARDS COUNCIL/AMERICAN VETERINARY MEDICAL ASSOCIATION COUNCIL ON EDUCATION/ROYAL COLLEGE OF VETERINARY SURGEONS

REPORT OF EVALUATION
UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW
SCHOOL OF VETERINARY MEDICINE

Date of site visit
March 7-12, 2021

Site Team
Dr. Andrew Parks, Co-Chair, COE Site Visitor
Prof. Stephen May, Co-Chair, RCVS Site Visitor
Dr. Richard E. Hill Jr., COE Site Visitor
Dr. Doug Roberts, CVMA Site Visitor
Ms. Amanda Boag, RCVS Site Visitor
Mr. Alex Berry, RCVS Site Visitor
Dr. Cheryl Scudamore, RCVS Site Visitor
Prof. Glen Coleman, AVBC Site Visitor
Dr. Anthea Fleming, SAVC Site Visitor

Observer
Dr. Philip Kieffer, COE
Dr. Sheila Allen, COE Staff
Ms. Kirsty Williams, RCVS

Staff
Dr. Karen Martens Brandt, AVMA-COE
Dr. Linda Prescott-Clements, RCVS
Mr. Jordan Nicholls, RCVS
Mr. Kieran Thacker, RCVS

PRINCIPAL UNIVERSITY ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICERS

Vice-Chancellor and Principal
Prof. Sir Anton Muscatelli

Vice-Principal and Head of College of Medical, Veterinary & Life Sciences
Prof. Iain McInnes

Head of School, SVM
Prof. Ewan Cameron
Standard 1, Organization

The college must develop and follow its mission statement.

Intent: A well-developed mission statement is helpful in communicating the values and purpose of the college, as long as it is followed and reflected in the actual practices of the college.

What to look for: Evidence of overall teaching, research, and service commitment; commitment to professional DVM program or equivalent; commitment to provide instruction and clinical opportunities for students in a wide variety of domestic species, including food animal, equine, and companion animal; commitment to excellence in program delivery.

The college has a well-developed mission statement that is followed.

Comments:
The school has a clear vision/mission statement displayed prominently on its website. Wording in the self-evaluation report matches that published.

Dean’s Comments:
The proposal to manage the small animal as a wholly owned subsidiary company of the University has been put on hold for the foreseeable future. Issues around recruitment and retention of clinical staff are being addressed through an enhanced market supplement policy for clinical staff that is more competitive with external salaries.

An accredited college of veterinary medicine must be a part of an institution of higher learning accredited by an organization recognized for that purpose by its country’s government.

Intent: The COE is recognized by the US Department of Education and Council on Higher Education Accreditation as a programmatic accreditor and does not evaluate independent veterinary colleges. Institutional accreditation in the United States, provincial recognition in Canada, and governmental recognition in other countries provides a measure of institutional quality assurance and accountability beyond the college level.
What to look for: The institutional accrediting body has been identified; the accreditation status of the university is provided; deficiencies noted by the accreditor that may impact compliance with the Standards of Accreditation are being addressed adequately.

The college is part of an institution accredited or federally recognized for this purpose. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Comments:
The school is part of a College of Medical Veterinary and Life Sciences within the University of Glasgow. The University of Glasgow has degree awarding powers, and its overall standards and quality were confirmed in a recent institutional audit.

A college may be accredited only when it is a major academic administrative division of the parent institution and is afforded the same recognition, status, and autonomy as other professional colleges in that institution.

Intent: Effective veterinary colleges are complex, multidisciplinary, and resource intensive. Access to senior institutional leaders is essential to ensure ongoing needs are fully appreciated and adequate resources are made available to sustain the teaching, research, and service mission of the college.

What to look for: A flow chart indicating the position of the college of veterinary medicine in the university structure; lines of authority and responsibility are shown; names and titles of principal administrative officers are provided to the level of college.

The college is a major academic administrative division of the university afforded the same recognition, status, and autonomy as other professional colleges. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Comments:
The school is a discrete organizational structure within the College of Medical Veterinary and Life Sciences. The Head of School has clear leadership responsibility for the school and the Head of School’s voice is heard at college and university levels. The school has comparable autonomy with other professional schools. The Head of School has discretion particularly with regard to non-pay budgets, but the Head of School’s submissions regarding faculty/staffing needs are seriously considered in all discussions related to university-level personnel decisions.

The chief executive officer or dean must be a veterinarian. This individual must have overall budgetary and supervisory authority necessary to assure compliance with accreditation standards. The officer(s) responsible for the professional, ethical, and academic affairs of the veterinary medical teaching hospital(s) or equivalent must also be (a) veterinarian(s).
Intent: Veterinary medicine is a unique, multidisciplinary health profession. Decisions affecting the education of veterinarians are best understood and administered by veterinarians.

What to look for: A flow chart of the organizational design of the college, listing names, titles (deans or chief executive officer, associate/assistant deans, directors, department heads, etc.), academic credentials, and assignments of the college administrators. Verify that the dean and chief academic officer of the Hospital (or the individual with senior leadership responsibility for the clinical programs) are veterinarians.

The dean and academic head of the veterinary teaching hospital are veterinarians. ☒ ☐ ☐

Comments:
The Head of School is a veterinarian registered with the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons, the United Kingdom licensing authority. As noted above, the Head of School within the College of Medical Veterinary and Life Sciences, has considerable discretion in relation to the non-pay budget and a meaningful voice at university level around faculty/staffing needs and numbers.

There must be sufficient administrative staff to adequately manage the affairs of the college as appropriate to the enrollment and operation.

Intent: Administrative staff (including administrators) play an essential role in all phases of college operation. The administrative staff and structure must be adequate to support students and faculty and fulfill the teaching, research and service mission of the college.

What to look for: Description of the role of administrators (deans, associate/assistant deans, directors, department heads, including academic credentials), faculty, support staff, and students in the governance of the college; listing of major college committees including committee charge, appointment authority, terms of service (term length/rotation), and current members.

College committee structure, representation, and function are adequate to meet the operational needs of the college effectively. ☒ ☐ ☐

Sufficient administrative staff is present to support the operational needs of the college. ☒ ☐ ☐

Does the college plan to change its current organization? ☒ ☐ ☐

Intent: Accreditation site visits represent a snapshot of current conditions. However, program sustainability can be positively or negatively impacted by planned organizational changes.
What to look for: A rationale and summary of planned organizational changes including timelines and how the planned changes are expected to improve the existing conditions or address anticipated future needs.

Comments:
The school has clear administrative support structures relating to the delivery of the three strands of its mission, namely education, research, and clinical services. Since the last visit, there has also been considerable change in relation to the design and delivery of the BVMS program. Regarding the future, the school is looking at changing the business structure of its small animal hospital, but this is on hold due to the short-term focus on the pandemic.

The college must create an academic environment that does not discriminate and seeks to enhance diversity, consistent with applicable law. Diversity may include, but is not limited to, race, religion, ethnicity, age, gender, gender identity, sexual orientation, cultural and socioeconomic background, national origin, and disability.

Intent: The college must have policies and activities that demonstrate the value of a diverse culture within the institution and the workplace outside the institution.

What to look for: policies and procedures, activities, recruiting strategies and other evidence to show that a diverse culture is valued.

Policies and procedures and college activities demonstrate an institutional value and commitment to promoting a diverse academic and workplace environment. ☒ ☐ ☐

Comments:
The school has been recognized for its equality, diversity, and inclusivity policies and activities through the Athena Swan Program. It also has a Senior Faculty Champion in this area, and all senior managers are supportive of this work. While considerable focus was originally on gender issues (and this continues), work is now much broader, occurring within United Kingdom legal frameworks. Funding for five extra student places has been gained; these are designated and specifically allocated in support of widening participation.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 1? ☒ ☐ ☐
Standard 2, Finances

**Finances must be adequate to sustain the educational programs and mission of the college.**

Intent: Veterinary colleges must have adequate, sustainable financial resources to fulfill the teaching, research, and service mission.

What to look for: Documentation and data including a financial summary and analysis of actual revenues and expenses for the past five years; actual or projected revenues and expenses for current year; and actual or projected revenues and expenses for next year. Financial analyses must demonstrate adequate, sustainable financial resources to fulfill the teaching, research, and service mission.

| Analysis of revenues and expenditures for the past five years | Y MD N |
|***************************************************************|**********|
| demonstrate adequate, sustainable financial resources to fulfill the teaching, research, and service mission | ☒ ☐ ☐ |

Financial resources are adequate and deployed efficiently and effectively to:

| Support all aspects of the mission, goals, and strategic plan | Y MD N |
|***************************************************************|**********|
| Ensure stability in the delivery of the program | Y MD N |
| Allow effective faculty, administrator, and staff recruitment, retention, remuneration, and development | Y MD N |
| Maintain and improve physical facilities, equipment, and other educational and research resources | Y MD N |
| Enable innovation in education, inter-professional activities, research and other scholarly activities, and practice | Y MD N |
| Measure, record, analyze, document, and distribute assessment and evaluation activities | Y MD N |
| Ensure an adequate quantity and quality of practice sites and preceptors are provided to support the curriculum, as needed | Y MD N |

Comments:

The school finances as shown, are sufficient to adequately support the requirements for the School to meet its mission and achieve its objectives for veterinary education including the provision of necessary clinical services (on-site and distributed).

The Head of School has appropriate levels of autonomy with evidence of a collaborative, flexible relationship in terms of the annual planning cycle noted.
The allocation of resources for the upcoming five years appears to be realistic and is based on the income and expenditures of the last five years. The school provided additional information on contribution that the school is expected to make to the wider university budget level (see Section 2 Finance Slides for VBR.pdf) documenting that the contribution level of the school has remained relatively static in the face of increased clinical income. The importance of an ongoing positive relationship between the college and the school is emphasized to ensure the contribution level remains at or close to this point.

It is noted that the estimated annual cost/student of providing veterinary education has increased substantively over the last five years; the consideration of efficiencies in program delivery is important to ensure this does not continue to escalate to unsustainable levels.

A substantial percentage of the school’s income comes from international student fees. The increase in revenue from this source over the next five years presumes similar numbers of international students will be recruited. This must be closely monitored as it becomes clearer how the appetite for international travel and education is impacted post pandemic.

The research revenue is low partly due to the organizational structure since the transition of research active faculty to the Research Institutes, meaning research revenue does not sit in the school’s budget. It is important that over time this does not impact on the importance the school places on ensuring adequate research opportunities for its students and staff.

**Additional Reporting:**
The School must update the Council on the pandemic’s impact on revenue from international student fees and the School’s response.

---

**Colleges with non DVM undergraduate degree programs must clearly report finances (expenditures and revenues) specific to those programs separately from finances (expenditures and revenues) dedicated to all other educational programs.**

**Intent:** It is important to evaluate the impact non DVM, undergraduate degree programs offered by the college have on the professional program.

**What to look for:** Clear reporting of the expenditures and revenues specific to non DVM, undergraduate degree programs offered by the college and impact on the DVM program.

Non DVM undergraduate degree programs offered by the college do not adversely affect resources available to deliver the professional program.  

Y ☒ MD ☑ N ☐

Non ☒ ☐ ☐

**N/A ☐**

**Comments:**
The school runs a small number of other programs notably a BSc and some Masters programs. These programs are of much smaller scale than the BVMS and their delivery does not adversely affect the BVMS program.
Clinical services, field services, and teaching hospitals must function as instructional resources. Instructional integrity of these resources must take priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations.

Intent: Efficient operation of clinical services is highly encouraged, but must not take precedence over the educational mission of the college.

What to look for: Evidence that adequate resources for instruction and clinical opportunities are provided for students in a wide variety of domestic species, including food animal, equine, and companion animal; commitment to excellence in program delivery.

Clinical services, field services, and teaching hospitals function as instructional resources.

Instructional integrity of these resources takes priority over financial self-sufficiency of clinical services operations (educational objectives take priority).

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 2?

Additional information cited:
Section 2 Finance Slides for VBR.pdf
Standard 3, Physical Facilities and Equipment

All aspects of the physical facilities must provide an appropriate learning environment. Safety of personnel and animals must be a high priority. Classrooms, teaching laboratories, teaching hospitals, which may include but are not limited to ambulatory/field service vehicles, seminar rooms, and other teaching spaces shall be clean, maintained in good repair, and adequate in number, size, and equipment for the instructional purposes intended and the number of students enrolled.

Administrative and faculty offices and research laboratories must be sufficient for the needs of the faculty and staff.

An accredited college must maintain an on-campus veterinary teaching hospital(s), or have formal affiliation with one or more off-campus veterinary hospitals used for teaching. Appropriate diagnostic and therapeutic service components including but not limited to pharmacy, diagnostic imaging, diagnostic support services, isolation facilities, intensive/critical care, ambulatory/field service vehicles, and necropsy facilities to support the teaching hospital(s) or facilities must be provided to support the teaching hospital(s) or facilities with operational policies and procedures posted in appropriate places.

Intent: Colleges must have adequate and appropriate physical facilities to facilitate interaction among administration, faculty and students. The physical facilities must meet legal standards and be safe, well maintained, and adequately equipped. Colleges must demonstrate compliance with relevant institutional practices and the American Disabilities Act to provide appropriate access to learning and clinical facilities for students with disabilities.

What to look for:
Evidence that all aspects of the physical facilities provide an appropriate learning environment for the number of students enrolled, including students with disabilities. Effective biosecurity and safety measures are in place and regularly monitored.

Classrooms, teaching laboratories, teaching hospitals, which may include but are not limited to ambulatory/field services vehicles, seminar rooms, and other teaching spaces are:

- Clean and well maintained
- Adequate in number, size, and equipment for the instructional purposes intended
- Adequate in number, size, and equipment for the number of students enrolled.
Administrative and faculty offices and research laboratories are sufficient for the needs of faculty and staff. 

Adequate on-campus veterinary teaching hospital(s), or formal affiliation with one or more adequate off-campus veterinary hospitals are provided for teaching.

Diagnostic and therapeutic service components, including but not limited to the following are available that reflect contemporary standards and provide an adequate learning environment:

- Pharmacy

- Diagnostic imaging

- Diagnostic support services

- Isolation facilities

- Intensive/critical care

- Ambulatory/field service vehicles

- Necropsy facilities.

Effective college and/or institutional biosecurity officer/committee and safety officers responsible for clinical and research facilities in place.

Evidence that building materials, especially flooring and wall surfaces are in good repair, promote animal and personnel safety, and can be adequately disinfected for infectious disease control.

Operational policies and procedures are posted in appropriate places.

Protocols (SOP's) for Isolation units or other biosecurity areas are posted or readily accessible.

If Isolation units do not have separate external entrances, appropriate protocols for admission of isolation patients are in place.
Evidence of appropriate controlled substance management and auditing in the hospital pharmacy, at distributed dispensing sites in clinical facilities and in ambulatory facilities, including policies related to student access to/use of controlled substances.

Evidence of safe handling of chemotherapeutic/cytotoxic drugs.

Evidence of regular monitoring of radiation safety.

Evidence of regular monitoring (at least annually) of formaldehyde levels in anatomy laboratories and compliance with OSHA or other state regulations.

Evidence that learning and clinical facilities are accessible to disabled students.

Comments:

Standard 3 was assessed via video presentations with added comments from school staff. While this process is aligned with pandemic-related accreditation site visit practices, this is an interim substitute for an on-site assessment for compliance with the Standard. An on-site Physical Facilities and Equipment review of both the school and the distributed sites within 18 months is critical to the assessment process. Specifically, the safety and biosecurity aspects (such as compliance with operational policies and procedures) need to be reviewed and observed directly, along with observations of the physical facility and equipment to ensure they are well maintained and adequately equipped.

The improvements to the Teaching Complex (comprising the Mary Stewart and McCall Buildings and a linked annex) appear to improve primary teaching facilities and related student interaction space.

A new Small Animal Hospital which holds RCVS-accredited Veterinary Hospital and Emergency Service Clinic status is operational. In the footprint of the old small animal hospital a new clinical skills facility was built, expanding opportunities for student learning.

Postmortem and diagnostic laboratory facilities are currently adequate for student teaching. A new postmortem facility and reconfiguration of the existing space to provide a large animal cadaver surgery facility as part of the clinical skills facility is planned for 2023.

An extensive review of Health and Safety policies and procedures (e.g., SOPs and risk assessments) revealed varying formats and indications that some were not reviewed annually or were dated years ago without a recent review. The school’s Statement on Standard Operating Procedures indicates that the governance of school process and procedures is through the school committee structure. Staff indicated that additional oversight was at the level of the school senior management.
We received information that an ambulatory vehicle did not have a means to secure the controlled drug lockbox. Evidence was provided that the controlled drug lockbox was secured to the vehicle during the site visit.

Notes from discussions and reviews with distributed sites used for core teaching were available for review. The agenda, format, and meeting notes varied considerably (examples: names of participants were not consistently recorded; there wasn’t a consistent set of agenda topics).

A disability access report with costing is available for the McCall and Jarrett buildings on the Garscube campus.

**Dean’s Comments:**

A new process will be informed by the School Quality Enhancement Committee but is likely to involve an annual submission from the School Health of Safety Committee to the School Executive. Such a report will serve as a checklist that all safety reviews have been conducted according to a standard predetermined schedule and will include a record of completed actions.

A standardized template will be developed and used for formal annual review meetings with partner practices at distributed sites, minutes and actions of these meetings will be submitted to the BVMS program board for consideration as part of the annual calendar.

**Suggestions:**

Continued progress on the proposed new postmortem building to modernize and improve these facilities and increase the clinical skills unit capacity is encouraged.

A comprehensive review of Health and Safety oversight policies at the level of school Senior Management is suggested.

The school is encouraged to develop a standardized format for the annual review of the distributive sites (e.g., agenda and notes).

The school is encouraged to implement any upgrades suggested in the disability access report.

**Additional Reporting:**

The school must update the accrediting bodies on any changes to the timeline for the completion of the new postmortem building.

---

**Facilities for the housing of animals used for teaching and research shall be sufficient in number, properly constructed, and maintained in a manner consistent with accepted animal welfare standards. Adequate teaching, laboratory, research, and clinical equipment must be available for examination, diagnosis, and treatment of all animals used by the college.**

**Intent:** Teaching and research animals must be maintained and cared for in accordance with the accepted animal welfare standards including the Animal Welfare Act.
What to look for: Evidence that the housing and care provided for teaching and research animals is consistent with the Animal Welfare Act and other accepted animal welfare standards, for example, an appropriately functioning Institutional Animal Care and Use Committee (IACUC) is in place, favorable USDA inspection reports, and AAALAC accreditation (not required). Evidence that the college/institutional biosecurity/safety committee is appropriately structured and functions effectively are covered in 3.7 above.

Housing for teaching and research animals provides sufficient space that is properly constructed and maintained in accordance with accepted animal welfare standards. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Adequate teaching, laboratory, research, and clinical equipment are available for examination, diagnosis, and treatment of all animals used by the college. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Adequate safety and facilities management plans are in place and followed. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Comments:
The school’s annual review revealed that cattle handling areas at the Cochno Farm needed to be reconfigured to facilitate a safe environment. In response to this report, these areas were retired and new facilities were constructed.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 3?

YES MD NO ☒ ☐ ☐
Standard 4, Clinical Resources

Normal and diseased animals of various domestic and exotic species must be available for instructional purposes, either as clinical patients or provided by the institution. While precise numbers are not specified, in-hospital patients and outpatients including field service/ambulatory and herd health/production medicine programs are required to provide the necessary quantity and quality of clinical instruction. The program must be able to demonstrate, using its assessment of clinical competency outcomes data, that the clinical resources are sufficient to achieve the stated educational goals and mission.

It is essential that a diverse and sufficient number of surgical and medical patients be available during an on-campus clinical activity for students’ clinical educational experience. Experience can include exposure to clinical education at off-campus sites, provided the college reviews these clinical experiences and educational outcomes. Further, such clinical experiences should occur in a setting that provides access to subject matter experts, reference resources, modern and complete clinical laboratories, advanced diagnostic instrumentation and ready confirmation (including necropsy). Such examples could include a contractual arrangement with nearby practitioners who serve as adjunct faculty members and off-campus field practice centers. The teaching hospital(s) shall provide nursing care and instruction in nursing procedures. A supervised field service and/or ambulatory program must be maintained in which students are offered multiple opportunities to obtain clinical experience under field conditions. Under all situations students must be active participants in the workup of the patient, including physical diagnosis and diagnostic problem oriented decision making.

Intent: The clinical resources available through the veterinary college should be sufficient to ensure the breadth and quality of outpatient and inpatient teaching. These resources include adequate numbers and types of patients (e.g., species, physiologic status, intended use) and physical resources in appropriate learning environments.

What to look for: Documentation and analysis of caseload in the Teaching Hospital, Ambulatory/Field Service, Herd/Flock Programs, and Off-campus Facilities for the past five years; Analysis must demonstrate the availability of adequate, sustainable numbers of diseased animals to fulfill the teaching, research, and service mission. The number and variety of normal animals must be consistent with student enrollment. Assess the college response to increasing/decreasing medical resources and efforts to maximize the teaching value of each case across the curriculum. Core off-campus clinical sites must provide an appropriate learning environment.

There are adequate numbers of normal and diseased animals; analysis of five-year caseload data are consistent with student enrollment.
There is an adequate mix of domestic and exotic animal species.

There are adequate numbers of in-hospital patients and outpatients.

There is adequate access to a reasonable number of surgical and medical patients.

There are adequate number of patients available for instructional purposes, either as clinical patients or provided by the institution.

Core off-campus clinical experiences occur in settings/field practice centers that provide:

- Consistent and appropriate access to subject matter expertise
- Adequate reference resources
- Access to modern and complete clinical laboratories
- Sufficient access to advanced diagnostic instrumentation and ready confirmation (including necropsy)
- Appropriate numbers of adjunct faculty members.

Students have multiple opportunities to obtain clinical experience under field conditions.

Students are active participants in the workup of the patient including physical diagnosis and diagnostic problem oriented decision making and client communication.

**Comments:**

Clinical resources for companion animals (small animal and equine) are good and represent a balance of primary care and referral practice. Students have multiple opportunities to gain experience in a range of clinical settings and are active participants in the work-up of patients.

In order to enhance the students’ experience with pigs, the school has greatly increased the numbers of pig carcasses available for necropsies. The school has also recently entered into an agreement with the Garth Pig Practice (pig specialty practice with 11 pig veterinarians) for the provision a 5th year Selective in pig practice. This selective will be available to one Professional Phase student per block.
The school has a range of measures to access clinical resources for production animal teaching and collectively these currently provide an adequate resource. The school is encouraged to continue to explore areas to reinforce resilience in clinical case material provision for this area.

A meaningful proportion of clinical resource provision occurs at distributed sites (e.g., CVG, MBM, PDSA, SSPCA).

It was learned that some students had not completed some of the assessments in animal handling prior to attending a relevant pre-clinical, extra mural study session (see also Standard 10).

**Dean’s Comments:**

All extra mural study (EMS) places are formally approved by the School. In future such approval will only be granted where the student has completed the relevant core species-based training and assessment in safe handling. This policy will apply to incoming first year students in September 2021.

**Suggestions:**

The school is encouraged to continue to explore areas to reinforce resilience in clinical case material provision for production animal teaching.

**Medical records must be comprehensive and maintained in an effective retrieval system to efficiently support the teaching, research, and service programs of the college.**

A comprehensive medical records system is maintained and kept in an effective retrieval system for major species.

**Comments:**

The medical records system used on campus (StringSoft) was demonstrated by faculty and students, is comprehensive and is easily searchable by various categories including diagnosis. Students routinely make entries into the medical records and can access the medical records from off-campus. Students do not enter financial information; clinicians should continue to make efforts to involve students in these discussions.

**Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 4?**
**Standard 5, Information Resources**

Timely access to information resources and information professionals must be available to students and faculty at core training sites. The college shall have access to the human, digital, and physical resources for retrieval of relevant veterinary and supporting literature and development of instructional materials, and provide appropriate training for students and faculty. The program must be able to demonstrate, using its outcomes assessment data, that students are competent in retrieving, evaluating, and efficiently applying information through the use of electronic and other appropriate information technologies.

Intent: Timely access to information resources and information professionals is essential to veterinary medical education, research, public service, and continuing education.

What to look for: Evidence that the college provides adequate access to the human, digital, and physical resources for students, faculty, staff, and graduate students for information retrieval and the development of instructional materials.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Access to information resources for students and faculty is adequate on and off-campus.</th>
<th>Y MD N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The qualifications of personnel who support learning and information technology resources for faculty and students are adequate.</td>
<td>Y MD N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to personnel who support learning and information technology resources for faculty and students is adequate.</td>
<td>Y MD N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access to qualified personnel necessary for development of instructional materials is adequate.</td>
<td>Y MD N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The college provides adequate access to the information technology resources necessary for development of instructional materials.</td>
<td>Y MD N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The college provides adequate resources (training, support) for students to improve their skills in accessing and evaluating information relevant to veterinary medicine from sources in various media.</td>
<td>Y MD N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students demonstrate skills in retrieving, evaluating, and applying information through information technologies</td>
<td>Y MD N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Current plans for improvement are adequate, if indicated.

**Comments:**
The school makes use of a comprehensive Virtual Learning Environment (VLE) utilizing the Moodle and Mahara platforms, but there are some concerns around the search facilities in Mahara and whether it may limit its functionality.

The hospitals make use of StringSoft as a system for client relationship and case management.

There is adequate Wi-Fi access at all the onsite hospitals, and at the distributed sites there is either Wi-Fi or dedicated internet access. Support is offered from the central IT structure, with technicians available to attend to issues at distributed sites, and a full-time technician on the Garscube campus.

There is redundancy built in to the StringSoft and Moodle/Mahara platforms, with multiple servers and power supplies employed to limit outages as much as possible.

Cybersecurity is a priority, and the systems are protected with up-to-date software and protocols.

IT accessibility is ensured for widening participation and/or disabled students with the short-term hardware loan system through the central university, as well as functionality on Moodle where settings (such as contrast and font size) can be adjusted as needed.

Training in digital wellbeing, managing online distractions, managing social media and a professional online presence is offered through the faculty as well as student bodies.

New online resources are developed by faculty and students on an ongoing basis, with the help of peer support as well as the Learning Technology Specialist, and resources developed specifically during the pandemic have been found to be useful and will continue to be used going forward. The development process for new resources includes evaluation of their usefulness in teaching and learning.

Online exams have been mandated by the University during the pandemic, and an online proctoring system will be in place by the next set of exams.

**Suggestions:**

The online platform (Mahara) should be evaluated in terms of usefulness and user-friendliness to staff and students, to ensure that the best platform is utilized.

---

**Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 5?**

YES MD NO
The number of professional degree students, DVM or equivalent, must be consistent with the resources and the mission of the college. The program must be able to demonstrate, using its outcomes assessment data, that the resources are sufficient to achieve the stated educational goals for all enrolled students.

Intent: Accredited colleges must have sufficient resources to accommodate the number of students enrolled and meet the stated mission.

What to look for: Evidence that the facilities, number of faculty and staff, and pre-clinical/clinical resources are sufficient to meet student needs. Analyze five-year trends for enrollment, the percent minorities, and the number of students in other educational programs offered by the college.

Facilities, number of faculty and staff, and pre-clinical/clinical resources are sufficient to meet student needs. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Colleges should establish post-DVM/VMD programs such as internships, residencies and advanced degrees (e.g., MS, PhD), that complement and strengthen the professional program and not adversely affect the veterinary student experience.

Intent: Post-DVM training programs and the presence of interns, residents, and graduate students enrich the learning environment for professional students.

What to look for: The number of post-DVM students over the last five years and evidence of appropriate integration of interns, residents, and graduate students into the education of professional students. On clinical rotations, there should be sufficient caseload to support the education of professional students and interns and residents with appropriate balance between professional student and intern exposure to, and opportunity to participate in, entry-level clinical skills/competencies.

College has established post-DVM/VMD programs such as internships, residencies and advanced degrees (e.g., MS, PhD), that complement and strengthen the professional program and do not adversely affect the student experience. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

Comments:
Both internship and residency opportunities exist in the small animal hospital, equine hospital, pathology department, and the production animal department. The number of interns and residents have increased over the past five years. Residents are expected to complete a Master of Veterinary Medicine degree in conjunction with their residency program. Faculty at the school
also act as supervisors to PhD candidates and are involved with Masters students in other departments within the University of Glasgow. The training of BVMS students by interns and residents is supervised by Faculty. Residents become trained as DOPS assessors. Many of the PhD students have undergone formal training as graduate teaching assistants.

**Student support services must be available within the college or university. These must include, but are not limited to, appropriate services to support student wellness and to assist with meeting the academic and personal challenges of the DVM program; support for students with learning or other disabilities; and support extra-curricular activities relevant to veterinary medicine and professional growth.**

The college or parent institution must provide information and access to counseling services regarding financial aid, debt management, and career advising. Career advising must include selection of clinical experiences.

**Intent:** To ensure student support services are readily available and adequate.

**What to look for:** Evidence that the college provides adequate student services for the number of students enrolled, including registration, testing, mentoring/advising, counseling (career and mental health), tutoring, services for students with disabilities, financial aid, debt management, peer assistance, and clubs and organizations.

Adequate student support services are available within the college or university, including mental health counseling, career and financial advising. Y MD N ☒ ☐ ☐

**Comments:**

The student support services provided by the school and the University of Glasgow are wide ranging and readily available to the BVMS students.

Students commented that they feel well supported by the school, and that they have good access to both formal and informal support from staff.

The site team received a number of comments regarding a positive working environment during rotations. However, the 2018 Septennial review of the BVMS flagged a concern regarding a negative learning environment in the small animal hospital and the site team also received comments from more than one source, that some students experienced negative comments and disrespectful treatment in the small animal specialty services rotations and a similar concern was expressed about the equine hospital rotations. The commenters perceived that there was limited response by the school to these comments. School Officials stated that they were aware of the general concerns and it was a work in progress.

**Suggestions:**

The school should review the clinical learning environment and the processes to respond to concerns, in order to ensure a consistent, positive learning environment.
Additional Reporting:
The school must update the accrediting agencies on the outcome of the review of the negative learning environment in hospital rotations.

The college must promote an inclusive institutional climate that fosters diversity within the student body, consistent with applicable law.

Intent: Accredited colleges must demonstrate through policies, procedures, and activities that a diverse student body is valued.

What to look for: Evidence that the college has policies and procedures in place that are enforced to promote diversity and inclusion within the student body.

The college has policies and procedures in place that are enforced to promote diversity within the student body.  

Y MD N

☒ ☐ ☐

In relationship to enrollment, the colleges must provide accurate information for all advertisements regarding the educational program by providing clear and current information for prospective students. Further, printed catalog or electronic information, must state the purpose and goals of the program, provide admission requirements and procedures, state degree requirements, present faculty descriptions, provide an accurate academic calendar, clearly state information on educational cost and debt risk, for the college. The college must provide information on procedures for withdrawal including the refund of student’s tuition and fees as allowable. Information available to prospective students must include relevant requirements for professional licensure.

Intent: Accredited colleges must provide accurate, complete information for recruiting purposes. The college catalog should provide accurate admission requirements and procedures, withdrawal processes, financial aid information, licensure requirements, and an accurate academic calendar.

What to look for: Evidence the college provides accurate, complete information for recruiting purposes on its web site, catalog, and advertisements covering area listed below.

College provides clear and current information for prospective students.  

Printed catalog or electronic information:  

Y MD N

☒ ☐ ☐

States the purpose and goals of the program
| Provides admission requirements and procedures | Y MD N |
| States degree requirements | Y MD N |
| Presents faculty descriptions | Y MD N |
| States information on tuition and fees | Y MD N |
| States procedures for withdrawal | Y MD N |
| Gives necessary information for financial aid programs | Y MD N |
| Provides an accurate academic calendar | Y MD N |
| Includes relevant requirements for licensure. | Y MD N |

**Comments:**
The school and University of Glasgow website amply provides all of the above-mentioned information for an individual considering application to and enrollment in the school.

**Each accredited college must provide a mechanism for students, anonymously if they wish, to offer suggestions, comments, and complaints regarding compliance of the college with the Standards of Accreditation. These materials shall be made available to the Council annually.**

Intent: This is a USDE recognition requirement. It represents another method to help ensure that the evidence gathered for accreditation decisions is complete.

What to look for: A reasonable mechanism for students to comment anonymously regarding the college’s compliance with the 11 Standards of Accreditation. If comments have been received – how has the college responded?

College provides a mechanism for students, including anonymous means, if students wish, to offer suggestions, comments, and complaints regarding compliance of the college with the Standards of Accreditation.
Student comments have been made available to the Council annually.

Comments:
In addition to the physical feedback boxes and Quick Response (QR) code opportunities in the Mary Stewart Building, a link to the AVMA or RCVS for submitting anonymous comments is found in the BVMS Common Room on their Moodle website under the tab entitled “Reporting & Feedback”.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 6?
Standard 7, Admission

The college must have a well-defined and officially stated admissions policy and a process that ensures a fair and consistent assessment of applicants.

Intent: Accredited colleges are expected to have a fair and unbiased admission policy (selection process and minimum criteria) that is clearly stated and easily accessible for prospective students.

What to look for: The admissions process should be standardized as much as possible to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and consistently. The admissions process and minimum criteria for acceptance must be clearly stated in the college catalogue and web site.

The college has a well-defined admissions policy that is fair and unbiased:

The selection process is fair and unbiased

Academic performance criteria indicate reasonable potential for successful completion of the professional curriculum.

The admissions policy is clearly stated and readily accessible.

Comments:
The school’s admissions policy is clearly outlined on the University website. The academic standards are outlined below and are in line with all other schools of veterinary medicine in the United Kingdom. Details about efforts to reduce bias and improve diversity are described below.

The policy must provide for an admissions committee, a majority of whom must be full-time faculty members. The committee must make recommendations regarding the students to be admitted to the professional curriculum upon consideration of applications of candidates who meet the academic and other requirements as defined in the college’s formal admission policy.

Intent: A properly appointed faculty committee is expected to be responsible for developing and implementing the admissions process and criteria, and making recommendations regarding the candidates admitted to college.

What to look for: The majority of the admissions committee must be full-time faculty members. Adequate training should be provided for committee members and others involved in the selection process to ensure applicants are evaluated fairly and
consistently. Rotating terms for committee members is considered best practice. Recommendations for admission to the college are made by the admissions committee according to the stated criteria. The admissions committee should periodically evaluate the success of the admissions process.

Admission policy provides for an admissions committee.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

Majority of the admission committee are full-time faculty members.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

An adequate training program is in place to ensure the admissions process is conducted fairly and consistently for all applicants.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

Committee makes recommendations regarding the students to be admitted to the professional curriculum.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

Candidates recommended meet the academic and other requirements defined in the college's formal admission policy.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

Five-year trends for applicant/position and offers made/acceptances are stable.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

Five-year trends for absolute and relative student attrition are consistent with the mission of the college.

Y MD N
☒ ☐ ☐

The admissions committee periodically assesses the success of the selection process to meet the mission of the college.

YES NO
☒ ☐

Comments:

The school has an Executive Admissions Committee of which the majority of the members are full-time faculty members. Additionally, it has an Admissions Panel, which is a substantially larger body and includes practitioners as well as faculty that conduct interviews. All members of these bodies have been required to take training in unconscious bias and diversity prior to participation, and many have been observers of interviews before participating themselves. The practitioners interviewed, who took part in the process and had been doing so for many years, were very enthusiastic about participating and felt that their involvement was a very valuable contribution to the process.

Candidates are screened to ensure that they meet the published minimum entrance criteria before being invited for interviews. The interview is a three-part process involving an online ethical reasoning test followed by two in person (virtual during the pandemic) interviews, one to determine personal traits and one to determine practical experience and awareness of the profession. There are minor modifications in the process for international students.
The applications by both domestic and international students have held steady and may even have shown a recent uptick, and attrition has decreased over the last six years.

Progression is determined by successful passing of practical assessments and end of year examinations. Students may have repeated opportunities to pass the practical assessments and two opportunities to pass the end of year examinations. However, students who are perceived as performing poorly are flagged with a “cause for concern” and counseled by staff as soon as identified. Similarly, students on clinical rotations who are perceived to be performing poorly and identified and flagged with a “cause for concern” for similar counseling and assistance.

The admissions committee meets to review its process annually. Changes that have been made based on this review include introduction of the ethical reasoning test and changing the way the interview rubric scores have been incorporated into the selection process.

The college must demonstrate its commitment to diversity and inclusion through its recruitment and admission processes, as consistent with applicable law. The college’s admissions policies must be non-discriminatory, as consistent with applicable law.

Intent: The college must demonstrate its commitment to a diverse student body through its admissions policies and procedures

What to look for: A commitment to a diverse student body, as is consistent with applicable laws

The admissions policies and procedures demonstrate a commitment to a diverse and inclusive student body

YES NO ☒ ☐

Comments:

The school is actively engaged in ensuring that the students entering the class reflect the population within the constraints permitted under UK law. These efforts are focused on ensuring that those under-represented groups are recruited into the applicant pool; this entails identifying students as early as S4 in high school and assisting them all the way through the application process up to the point at which the admissions panel screens applicants. The school participates in a number of programs to enhance widening participation and was given five additional funded places by the Scottish Funding Council to reflect this. The school has made further application for additional widening participation places on an access program. Additionally, funding for five places by the Scottish Funding Council has been reserved for students at a socio-economic disadvantage.

Students with disability are assessed as permitted under UK law, in that if reasonable accommodations can be made for the disability, students are accepted.

Subjects for admission must include those courses prerequisite to the professional program in veterinary medicine, as well as courses that contribute to a broad general education. The goal of pre-veterinary education shall be to provide a broad base upon which professional
Intent: The goal of pre-veterinary education shall be to provide a broad base upon which professional education may be built, leading to lifelong learning with continued professional and personal development.

What to look for: The pre-veterinary curriculum includes requirements to prepare students for the professional curriculum, as well as a broad base for professional and personal development and lifelong learning.

Subjects for admission include courses prerequisite to the professional program in veterinary medicine.

Subjects for admission include courses that contribute to a broad general education.

Comments:

United Kingdom applicants are expected to have achieved expected grades in Scottish Highers (the educational systems equivalent of A levels) in chemistry and biology, plus physics or mathematics, or A-levels in chemistry and biology, and a third subject, preferably a science. International students already enrolled in undergraduate education are expected to have a 3.4 GPA. While it is not indicated on the website, a broad range of subjects is expected of United Kingdom applicants at the GCSE level.

Factors other than academic achievement must be considered for admission criteria.

Intent: Effective veterinarians have a number of attributes unrelated to academic performance. Accredited colleges are required to consider other factors that contribute to the ability of their graduates to be successful members of the profession.

What to look for: Non-academic factors must be included in the selection process, for example, experience with animals and an understanding of veterinary medicine, effective interpersonal skills, leadership experience, economically disadvantaged background, etc.

Factors other than academic achievement are considered for admission.

Selected candidates meet academic and non-academic requirements as defined in the college's formal admission policy.

Transfer policies are academically appropriate and the five year trend for admittance is reasonable based on available resources.

Comments:
A variety of skills, interests, and achievements unrelated to veterinary medicine are incorporated into the admissions decision; examples would include Duke of Edinburgh Awards, accomplishments in sport or the arts, and charity work. In addition to the aforementioned academic qualifications, at least two weeks of experience with a veterinarian is required.

The school does not accept transfer students.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 7?  

[ ] YES  [ ] MD  [ ] NO
Standard 8, Faculty

**Faculty numbers and qualifications must be sufficient to deliver the educational program and fulfill the mission of the college.**

Intent: Accredited veterinary colleges must have a cohort of faculty members with the qualifications and time needed to deliver the curriculum and to meet the other needs and mission of the college.

What to look for: Evidence that the number of faculty with appropriate qualifications in each functional area are adequate to deliver the didactic and clinical curriculum and fulfill the mission of the college.

The curricular responsibilities of faculty lost over the last five years have been replaced through faculty renewal, other appropriate personnel, or mitigated by curricular change.  
Faculty numbers and qualifications in each functional area are sufficient to deliver the educational program and fulfill the mission of the college.

Comments:
With the change in the curriculum that was introduced almost immediately after the last accreditation site visit, there was a significant increase in the number of faculty required to instruct small groups, in particular for the clinical skills labs that are held throughout the first four years of the curriculum. In response to this need, the number of faculty positions in the school has increased from 67 to 93, the majority of whom are on the Academic Clinical track. That said, the school is experiencing difficulties in recruiting/retaining clinical specialized faculty in certain disciplines in common with other schools of veterinary medicine.

**Participation in scholarly activities is an important criterion in evaluating the faculty and the college. The college shall give evidence that it utilizes a well-defined and comprehensive program for the evaluation of the professional growth, development, and scholarly activities of the faculty.**

Intent: A comprehensive faculty evaluation program stimulates continuous professional development.

What to look for: Evidence that promotion and tenure policies and procedures and annual performance review process include consideration of professional growth, development, and scholarly activity, for example, student and peer course evaluations, publications, research funding, etc.
The college utilizes a well-defined and comprehensive program for the evaluation of professional growth, development, and scholarly activities of the faculty.

Appropriate weight is assigned to teaching, research and service activities for career advancement.

Comments:
Faculty indicated that both evaluation and mentoring were good, and that credit was given for all activities they performed. Faculty regularly have the opportunity to attend, and have presented at, various different conferences on both veterinary and medical education, the cost of which is covered by the school, including international conferences.

**Academic positions must offer the security and benefits necessary to maintain stability, continuity, and competence of the faculty.**

Intent: Accredited colleges must provide adequate security and benefits to maintain a stable group of core faculty to provide continuity and assure ongoing faculty competence.

What to look for: Evidence that security and benefits are adequate to attract and retain competent faculty, for example, competitive salary and benefit packages, adequate start-up funds, support for professional activities, such as, scientific meetings, invited presentations, sabbatical leave, development in methods of effective teaching.

Faculty turnover the last five years is within normal limits (typically < 10%).

Adequate professional development opportunities are available for faculty growth.

Academic positions offer adequate security and benefits to attract and retain qualified faculty.

Comments:
Faculty turnover is in the range of 10%. No concerns about job security were expressed and it was noted that the University non-salary benefits were reportedly generous compared to the private sector; however, that wasn’t always appreciated because the salaries reportedly paid to private practice veterinarians in certain specialties were significantly higher than those at the University. The latter has contributed to significant difficulties in both recruitment and retention, difficulties that are not unique to the University of Glasgow. Because the University pay structure is relatively rigid in relation to grade, retention through salary increases is limited, but the school is able to make use of 10-15% salary supplements in certain areas.
The faculty, by and large, declare that the requirements for advancement are clearly outlined, and that there is support and guidance for faculty starting at grades 7 and 8. There is an Early Career Development Program and there are numerous courses available on campus for faculty to take advantage of, regarding different aspects of their development. All faculty are required to complete a Postgraduate Certificate in Academic Practice. The junior and mid-career faculty also indicated that promotion from grade 7 to 8 was readily attained by following the criteria, but the jump to grade 9 was significantly more difficult, at least in part because of their time commitments and ability to pursue appropriate scholarship. The workloads of some of the clinical faculty appear to be very high, which may contribute to this situation and may give rise to tension at times in the hospital.

Furthermore, it was mentioned by academic staff that there were ceilings for some employees within the school, because of lack of opportunity to obtain qualifications needed for advancement.

**Dean’s Comments:**

The school has developed an enhanced salary market supplement policy designed to improve retention and recruitment of specialized clinicians.

---

**The college must cultivate a diverse faculty through its hiring policies and retention practices, consistent with applicable law. The college must demonstrate its ongoing efforts to achieve parity in advancement opportunities and compensation.**

*Intent:* Accredited colleges must demonstrate a commitment to diversity among the faculty.

*What to look for:* Policies and procedures in recruiting and retention activities that promote a diverse faculty.

The college demonstrates that it values faculty diversity through its recruitment and retention policies.

*Y MD N*

*Comments:*

It is clear both from the composition of the faculty and the Silver Athena SWAN status that the school has attained, that the school has demonstrated its core value to promote diversity within the constraints of UK law.

---

**Part-time faculty, residents, and graduate students may supplement the teaching efforts of the full-time permanent faculty if appropriately integrated into the instructional program.**

*Intent:* To ensure adequate full-time, permanent faculty members are present to effectively supervise teaching assignments of part-time faculty, residents, and interns. Whereas colleges may need to engage part-time faculty or locums for didactic teaching or clinical rotations, to meet curricular objectives, it is important to assess plans for hiring permanent faculty to provide this instruction, especially in core disciplines, so that there is stability so students have regular access to this disciplinary expertise.
What to look for: Evidence that full-time, permanent faculty provide adequate supervision of part-time faculty, residents, and interns. If part-time faculty are used, evidence that there is stability/consistency of curricular contributions and that there are plans to replace these faculty with permanent faculty. If residents and graduate students are used in instruction of professional students, evidence that they are appropriately mentored in effective teaching and not solely responsible for student grades for didactic and clinical courses/rotations.

- Full-time, permanent faculty ensure supplementary teaching efforts by part-time faculty, residents, and graduate students are appropriately integrated into the instructional program. "Y MD N"
- The amount of the core curriculum delivered by part-time faculty does not impact the effectiveness or quality of the educational program and that student access to this disciplinary expertise is not compromised. "☒ ☐ ☐"

**Comments:**

The teaching of the BVMS curriculum is almost entirely provided by permanent members of the school faculty, approximately 10% of whom are currently part-time (these are faculty who have the potential to return as full-time faculty as opposed to outside part-time or adjunct appointments), and a small number of guest lecturers cover topics for which the school does not currently have sufficient expertise, e.g., exotics. Residents and PhD students are encouraged to enhance their career development by demonstrating in various disciplines within the school and many PhD students have undergone formal graduate teaching assistant training at the university. As such, the combination of these instructional resources appears to be used relatively seamlessly.

**Additional Reporting:**

Update the council on the school’s efforts to recruit/retain clinical specialized faculty in certain clinical and para-clinical disciplines such as small animal surgery, neurology, clinical and anatomic pathology, and internal medicine and the school’s consideration of operating its small animal clinical services using a company structure.

- Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 8? "☒ ☐ ☐"
**Standard 9, Curriculum**

**The curriculum shall extend over a period equivalent to a minimum of four academic years, including a minimum of one academic year of hands-on clinical education. The curriculum and educational process should initiate and promote lifelong learning in each professional degree candidate.**

Intent: Adequate coverage of the material necessary to educate a competent veterinarian requires a minimum of four academic years, including at least one academic year of hands-on clinical education.

What to look for: The curriculum extends an equivalent of four academic years, including a minimum of one academic year of hands-on, clinical education.

The curriculum extends an equivalent of four academic years; including a minimum of one academic year of hands-on, clinical education.  

---

**Comments:**

A new veterinary curriculum (BVMS) has been implemented since the last accreditation site visit, with the first cohort graduating in 2018. The BVMS is a five-year program, and clinical training commences in the first week of the program and is embedded in each semester. The final year is dedicated to clinical training.

---

**The curriculum in veterinary medicine is the purview of the faculty of each college, but must be managed centrally based upon the mission and resources of the college. There must be sufficient flexibility in curriculum planning and management to facilitate timely revisions in response to emerging issues, and advancements in knowledge and technology. The curriculum must be guided by a college curriculum committee. The curriculum as a whole must be reviewed at least every seven (7) years. The majority of the members of the curriculum committee must be full-time faculty. Curriculum evaluations should include the gathering of sufficient qualitative and quantitative information to ensure the curriculum content provides current concepts and principles as well as instructional quality and effectiveness.**

Intent: The curriculum must be established by a competent faculty and managed centrally by the dean’s office in conjunction with an appropriately configured faculty curriculum committee according to the stated mission of the college. The curriculum requires regular review and management by the curriculum committee based on the collection and analysis of sufficient qualitative and quantitative evidence.

What to look for: The curriculum is regularly reviewed and managed by an appropriately configured faculty curriculum committee (e.g., staggered terms of appointment or rotating membership). A holistic review of the curriculum that has occurred within the last seven years or is currently in review. This does not require the curriculum to be revised, but that all facets of the curriculum, as one unit, reviewed. Curricular review should include the
collection and analysis of sufficient qualitative and quantitative data to ensure curricular revisions promote instructional quality and effectiveness and include current concepts and principles necessary to meet societal needs.

The majority of the members of the curriculum committee are full-time faculty.

The curriculum is regularly reviewed and managed (revised), as indicated, by the dean’s office in conjunction with an appropriately configured college curriculum committee.

Adequate process for assessing curricular overlaps, redundancies, omissions.

Comments:
The BVMS Program Board has primary accountability for management of the curriculum and includes student representation. There is a comprehensive approach to evaluating the curriculum, including annual program reviews and septennial reviews (most recently in 2018), and there were numerous examples of adjustments being made to the curriculum in response to such evaluations. Students are actively engaged at various points in the review processes.

New Faculty appointments are required to complete a postgraduate certificate in academic practice, and are able to progress to Masters or Doctorate level qualifications in education. External assessors, teachers based in distributed sites and post graduate teachers (specifically residents and interns) receive induction into assessment and teaching, but this appears variable in nature. The School has developed a proposal to develop online training resources for external teachers and supervisors, based partly on existing materials (from the Master of Advanced Practice in Veterinary Nursing).

Suggestions:
The school is encouraged to develop and implement the proposed online introduction to teaching module for external and post graduate contributors to the teaching program and ensure that once implemented, the module is consistently completed.

The curriculum must provide:

a. an understanding of the central biological principles and mechanisms that underlie animal health and disease from the molecular and cellular level to organismal and population manifestations.

b. scientific, discipline-based instruction in an orderly and concise manner so that students gain an understanding of normal function, homeostasis, pathophysiology, mechanisms of
health/disease, and the natural history and manifestations of important animal diseases, both domestic and foreign.

c. instruction in both the theory and practice of medicine and surgery applicable to a broad range of species. The instruction must include principles and hands-on experiences in physical and laboratory diagnostic methods and interpretation (including diagnostic imaging, diagnostic pathology, and necropsy), disease prevention, biosecurity, therapeutic intervention (including surgery), and patient management and care (including intensive care, emergency medicine and isolation procedures) involving clinical diseases of individual animals and populations. Instruction should emphasize problem solving that results in making and applying medical judgments.

d. instruction in the principles of epidemiology, zoonoses, food safety, the interrelationship of animals and the environment, and the contribution of the veterinarian to the overall public and professional healthcare teams.

e. opportunities for students to learn how to acquire information from clients (e.g. history) and about patients (e.g. medical records), to obtain, store and retrieve such information, and to communicate effectively with clients and colleagues.

f. opportunities throughout the curriculum for students to gain an understanding of professional ethical, legal, economic, and regulatory principles related to the delivery of veterinary medical services; personal and business finance and management skills; and gain an understanding of the breadth of veterinary medicine, career opportunities and other information about the profession.

g. Opportunities throughout the curriculum for students to gain and integrate an understanding of the important influences of diversity and inclusion in veterinary medicine, including the impact of implicit bias related to an individual’s personal circumstance on the delivery of veterinary medical services

h. knowledge, skills, values, attitudes, aptitudes and behaviors necessary to address responsibly the health and well-being of animals in the context of ever-changing societal expectations.

i. fair and equitable assessment of student progress. The grading system for the college must be relevant and applied to all students in a fair and uniform manner.

Intent: Accredited veterinary colleges must prepare entry level veterinarians with sufficient understanding of basic biomedical sciences, clinical sciences, and effective clinical and professional skills to meet societal needs.

What to look for: Evidence that the curriculum provides all the curricular elements listed in the standard.
Stated curricular objectives are appropriate and clearly integrated into individual courses.

The curricular digest indicates courses and rotations as a whole provide appropriate rigor and sequence to meet curricular objectives and the mission of the college.

Curricular changes since the last accreditation site visit reflect appropriate curricular review and management.

Self-identified curricular weaknesses have been or are being addressed by the curriculum committee in a timely manner.

Preceptor and externship programs are effectively managed and evaluated by faculty to ensure educational objectives are met.

Curriculum content provides current concepts and principles that underlie animal health and disease.

Curriculum covers mechanisms from the molecular and cellular level to organismal and population manifestations.

Evidence of students’ understanding of normal function, homeostasis, pathophysiology, mechanisms of health/disease, and the natural history and manifestations of important domestic animal diseases is adequate.

Evidence of students’ understanding of normal function, homeostasis, pathophysiology, mechanisms of health/disease, and the natural history and manifestations of important foreign animal diseases is adequate.

Curricular delivery is rooted in scientific, discipline-based instruction.

Evidence of high quality and effective instruction in theory and practice of medicine and surgery applicable to a broad range of species is adequate.

Instruction includes principles and hands-on experience in physical and laboratory diagnostic methods and interpretation (including diagnostic imaging, diagnostic pathology, and necropsy).

Instruction includes principles and hands-on experience in disease prevention.

Instruction includes principles and hands-on experience in biosecurity.

Instruction includes principles and hands-on experience in therapeutic intervention (including surgery).

Instruction includes patient management and care (including intensive care, emergency medicine and isolation procedures).
Instruction includes principles and hands-on experience involving clinical diseases of individual animals and populations.

Instruction emphasizes problem-solving that results in making and applying medical judgments.

Instruction includes principles of epidemiology, zoonoses, food safety, the interrelationship of animals and the environment, and the contribution of the veterinarian to the overall public and professional healthcare teams.

Instruction allows for opportunities for students to learn how to acquire information from clients (e.g. history) and about patients (e.g. medical records).

Instruction allows for opportunities to obtain, store and retrieve medical records information, and to communicate effectively with clients and colleagues.

Opportunities throughout the curriculum for students to gain an understanding of professional ethical, legal, economic, and regulatory principles related to the delivery of veterinary medical services; personal and business finance and management skills; and gain an understanding of the breadth of veterinary medicine, career opportunities and other information about the profession.

Opportunities throughout the curriculum for students to gain an understanding of the influence of diversity and inclusion in veterinary medicine, and the impact of implicit bias related to personal circumstance in the delivery of veterinary medical services.

Opportunities throughout the curriculum for students to gain an understanding of the breadth of veterinary medicine, career opportunities and other information about the profession.

Curriculum provides for knowledge, skills, values, attitudes, aptitudes, and behaviors necessary to address responsibly the health and well-being of animals in the context of ever-changing societal expectations.

Assessment of student progress is fair and equitable.

Adequate procedures in place to uphold academic standards.

The grading system is relevant and applied to all students in a fair and uniform manner.

Comments:

A feature of the new curriculum is its ‘spiral’ approach to the development of program learning outcomes, meaning that students revisit topics and skills as they progress through the program, increasing the clinical focus as they do so. Clinical and professional knowledge and competencies are developed across the five years of the program.

Each year of the program consists of one course. In the first four years, each course comprises a series of 6-7 modules, each consisting of three weeks of teaching and a week of consolidation, as
well as practical and clinical skills training offered through small group rotations. The final year consists of six core clinical rotations and two elective rotations. The curriculum relies heavily on small group teaching and a high level of coordination between different areas of the school and is labor-intensive to deliver.

Students receive two grades for each year; one which reflects knowledge and understanding and one which reflects competency assessment. The grading system is applied to all students uniformly. Summative assessment occurs almost entirely at the end of the course/year. For example, theory exams spread over six hours at the end of the academic year determine 85-100% of the grade for knowledge and assessment. Grades for competence are based on OSCEs and submission of an ePortfolio. The latter contributes 10% of the competency grade in years 2 and 4, and 100% of the competency grade in final year. Several hurdle assessments supplement these summative assessment tasks, e.g., DOPS or direct observation of procedural skills, and continual assessment tasks such as quizzes and reports that occur throughout the modules.

Students recognize the curriculum design, its learning benefits for them, and their role in its co-creation.

The pivot to online teaching and assessment in response to the COVID-19 Pandemic was done successfully, and students reported feeling supported during this transition and they valued the online learning resources that had been developed. The school intends to maintain and expand on these resources.

Areas for improvement in business and finance teaching have been identified by students and employers of graduates. Students engage in invoice preparation in primary care clinical rotations only.

Students and employers expressed a desire for additional instruction in “difficult conversations” with clients.

Of the 24 weeks of core clinical rotations (in ‘normal times’) there are seven weeks of primary care rotations (four weeks Small animal, two weeks Production animal and one week Equine). Of the 21 weeks of the core clinical rotations (in COVID times) there are six weeks of primary care rotations (four weeks Small animal, two weeks Production animal). Students expressed a desire for more primary care caseload-based training. The school is actively investigating strategies to increase primary case load in small animal and equine rotations.

A process for embedding clinical reasoning in the curriculum is ongoing.

**Dean’s Comments:**

The school has already extended its business and finance teaching in response to previous employers’ surveys. There is finance training in BVMS year 1-4 and a number of rotations involved or expose the students to invoicing.

The school was surprised by this comment and wonders if the comment from “students and employers” may be out of date. Communications skills training use an extensive bank of scenarios that cover how to handle a variety of “difficult conversations” (a list of over 30 scenarios is available and this is reviewed annually).
Suggestions:

The school is encouraged to review the development of clinical communication skills, including “difficult conversations” with clients.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 9? YES MD NO ☒ ☐ ☐
AVMA Standard 10, Research Programs

The college must maintain substantial research activities of high quality that integrate with and strengthen the professional program. The college must demonstrate continuing scholarly productivity and must provide opportunities for any interested student in the professional veterinary program to be exposed to or participate in on-going high-quality research. All students must receive training in the principles and application of research methods and in the appraisal and integration of research into veterinary medicine and animal health.

Intent: The research standard serves to ensure student exposure to performance of high quality research and ability to acquire, evaluate, and use new knowledge. The development and maintenance of a community of scholars enhances the educational experience for students. DVM students must be introduced to how new knowledge is developed and disseminated and have access to participation in coursework and career development in research.

What to look for: The existence of a college research program that is adequate in scope and quality to expose students to high quality research. Examples of learning objectives may include acquisition and evaluation of scientific literature, experimental and non-experimental design, critical analysis of data, scientific writing including writing of research proposals and submission of manuscripts for publication, and hands-on experience in bench, clinical, or field research.

Objective metrics indicate substantial, high quality level of faculty research activity, for example:

- Number of individual faculty members within each department involved in research (total research FTE)
- Number of publications in refereed scientific journals, book chapters, case-reports
- Regular participation and presentation of original research in scientific meetings, poster sessions, publication of abstracts
- Involvement in external research panels, commissions, and advisory or editorial boards
- Number and amount of competitive, extramural research funding
- National and international research awards received.
DVM program learning objectives demonstrate emphasis on which of the following:

- Acquisition and evaluation of scientific literature
  - YES ☒ NO □
- Experimental and non-experimental research design
  - YES ☒ NO □
- Critical analysis of data
  - YES ☒ NO □
- Scientific writing.
  - YES ☒ NO □

Students have had opportunities to do which of the following:

- Write research proposals
  - YES ☒ NO □
- Submit manuscripts for publication
  - YES ☒ NO □
- Hands-on experience in bench, clinical, or field research
  - YES ☒ NO □
- Interaction with graduate students.
  - YES ☒ NO □

Evidence that students learn to acquire, evaluate, and use new knowledge.

Evidence of student involvement in research after graduation.

Adequate student exposure to performance of high quality research.

**Comments:**

Due to the constraints of the pandemic, there was no opportunity to experience the school’s Research facilities and the standard was assessed based on written evidence and a limited video tour. An on-site review of the school and Research Institute facilities will be scheduled within 18 months.

The research structure within the College of Medical, Veterinary and Life Sciences results in a concentration of primary research staff, research income and outputs within the associated Research Institutes (RI). Affiliates from RI teach as a part of the school program and some school staff are affiliates within the RIs so high-quality research activity is represented between
the combined faculty. Students are also explicitly exposed to research via Blue Sky lectures and the externally funded INSPIRE program.

Within the school, clinical research activities are constrained by time pressures of the curriculum and service work, but development of the new curriculum has afforded staff within the school opportunities to develop an educational research focus. In addition, efforts are made to pair research active clinical faculty with researchers in the RIs.

Learning objectives for the undergraduates require students to critically analyze data, write literature reviews, research proposals and case reviews.

There is no mandatory requirement for students to be involved in hands-on research but there are voluntary opportunities for student engagement in research via summer research projects, EMS projects, selectives and intercalation. The numbers of students involved in hands on research and publication remains at a relatively low level but those that are interested in research careers are well supported.

Scholarship funds provide support for students and early career researchers.

There is a lack of readily accessible information on undergraduate students’ research outputs including publications, research awards and progression to postgraduate programs.

**Suggestions:**

The school is encouraged to increase undergraduate involvement in hands-on research programs and take steps to ensure that the school and the RIs continue to work together to provide research opportunities for students and faculty.

The school is encouraged to improve collection of data relating to student presentations, awards, publications and entry into research programs after graduation and publicize that information to the student body.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 10?
Outcomes of the veterinary medical degree program must be measured, analyzed, and considered to improve the program. New graduates must have the basic scientific knowledge, skills, and values to provide entry-level health care, independently, at the time of graduation. Student achievement must be included in outcome assessment. Processes must be in place to remediate students who do not demonstrate competence in one or more of the nine competencies.

The college should have in place a system to gather outcomes data on recent graduates to ensure that the competencies and learning objectives in the program result in relevant entry level competencies.

The college must have processes in place whereby students are observed and assessed formatively and summatively, with timely documentation to assure accuracy of the assessment for having attained each of the following competencies:

1. comprehensive patient diagnosis (problem solving skills), appropriate use of diagnostic testing, and record management
2. comprehensive treatment planning including patient referral when indicated
3. anesthesia and pain management, patient welfare
4. basic surgery skills and case management
5. basic medicine skills and case management
6. emergency and intensive care case management
7. understanding of health promotion, and biosecurity, prevention and control of disease including zoonoses and principles of food safety
8. ethical and professional conduct; communication skills including those that demonstrate an understanding and sensitivity to how clients’ diversity and individual circumstance can impact health care
9. critical analysis of new information and research findings relevant to veterinary medicine

The Council on Education expects that 80% or more of each college’s graduating senior students sitting for the NAVLE will have passed at the time of graduation.*

*The Council will calculate a 95% exact binomial confidence interval for the NAVLE scores for colleges whose NAVLE pass rate falls below 80%. Colleges with an upper limit of an exact 95% binomial confidence interval less than 85% for two successive years will be placed on Probationary Accreditation. Colleges with an upper limit of an exact 95% binomial confidence level less than 85% for four successive years will, for cause, be placed on Terminal Accreditation.

Intent:
Outcomes of the DVM program must be measured, analyzed, and acted upon, as needed, to maintain compliance with the standards of accreditation and promote continuous program improvement.
What to look for:
Student achievement during the pre-clinical and clinical curriculum and after graduation must be included in outcome assessment. Evidence produced through outcomes assessment data collection and analysis must demonstrate that new graduates have the basic scientific knowledge, skills, and values to provide entry-level health care, independently, at the time of graduation.

Learning objectives for each of the nine listed competencies and a summary of the analysis of evidence-based data collected for each of the nine competencies must demonstrate graduates are prepared for entry-level practice. Evidence that there is a process to provide remediation for those students who have not demonstrated competence in one or more of the nine competencies. Evidence of student learning outcomes for the nine clinical competencies must be obtained and that students are observed and assessed formatively and summatively. Evidence that outcomes assessment results have been used to improve the curriculum are required for compliance.

Outcome assessment includes evidence of student achievement during the:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre-clinical years</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical years</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>After graduation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Outcome assessment includes evidence that students and graduates at the time of graduation, have achieved:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The program’s stated learning outcomes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic scientific knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entry-level clinical skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Values to provide entry-level health care independently.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Direct and indirect evidence exists for student competency in:
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skill / Competency</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive patient diagnosis (problem solving skills)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate use of clinical laboratory testing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Record management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive treatment planning including patient referral when indicated</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patient welfare</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anesthesia and pain management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic surgery skills, experience, case management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basic medicine skills, experience, case management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emergency and intensive care case management</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health promotion, disease prevention/biosecurity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zoonoses and food safety</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client communications</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ethical conduct</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication skills including those that demonstrate and understanding and sensitivity to how clients’ diversity and individual circumstance can impact health care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Critical analysis of new information and research findings relevant to veterinary medicine.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence that students have been assessed formatively and summatively.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Evidence of a process for remediation of students who have not demonstrated attainment of each of the clinical competencies.  

Y MD N

证据

Evidence of plan to reverse negative trend(s) if and when necessary.

Adequacy of NAVLE School Score Report within expected range of NAVLE passing percentages.

If applicable, adequate explanation and corrective remediation measures for decrease in NAVLE passing percentages.

N/A

Evidence of assessments of educational preparedness and employment satisfaction of:

Graduating seniors

Alumni at some post-graduation point.

Employers of graduates

Program Outcomes:

Five-year trends in student attrition rates within reason.

If applicable, adequate explanation and corrective remediation measures for increase in student attrition rates.

N/A

Five-year trends in one-year post-graduation employment rates.

If applicable, adequate explanation and corrective remediation measures for decrease in employment rates.

N/A

Evidence of assessments of faculty, instructors, interns, residents.

Evidence of assessments of adequacy of clinical resources, facilities and equipment.

Institutional Outcomes:

Evidence of evaluation of college progress
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Requirement</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>N</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Adequacy of resources and organizational structure to meet the educational purposes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriateness of outcomes assessed that are meaningful for the overall educational process</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence that outcome findings are used by the college to improve the educational program.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Comments:**

The school has a comprehensive process in place to gather outcomes data, and provided several examples where the analysis of such data led to adjustments in curriculum or assessment strategies to enhance the quality of the program and graduate outcomes. Employers of the school’s graduates provided very positive feedback in relation to their skills and preparedness to practice.

There is a comprehensive process for mapping attainment and assessment of clinical competencies across the program, and the assessment of these through Direct Observation of Procedural Skills, OSCEs, and assessment of performance on clinical rotations and EMS, through end of rotation grades. Students are required to collate attainment of competencies, and their reflections arising from their learning experiences, in an ePortfolio. The professional phase portfolio, including evidence of all of the preceding, is the basis for the competence grade awarded to students in final year.

Students receive a performance assessment at the completion of each final year clinical rotation, or within a week of its conclusion. Students identified as having performance issues are issued with a “cause for concern” notice which triggers a process to remediate the deficiencies – the “cause for concern” notice and certification that the deficiency has been addressed must be included in the professional phase portfolio. Deficiencies are discussed at the point they are identified in the rotation, but there is no systematic process for providing each student with mid-placement feedback on their performance. This risks students’ capacity to maximize the learning value of the placements.

The mapping of attainment of underpinning knowledge is less granular, largely reflecting the fact that theory is assessed summatively at the end of each year of the program in a series of 2-3 written examinations. Students need to gain a passing grade for the combined theory exams, as opposed to a minimum performance being required in any component. This creates a particular challenge in the area of Veterinary Public Health. A student could potentially receive passing grades for knowledge and understanding in BVMS3 and BVMS4 without actually passing the veterinary public health components of these examinations. Students do complete continual assessment tasks during the Veterinary Public Health – Aspects of Food Safety module in BVMS3 but, although these must be completed to a satisfactory standard, they do not contribute to the final grade for knowledge and understanding in this course.

The school advised the site team that they are reviewing the program’s reliance on very large end-of-year summative assessment tasks.
Deficiencies (Minor):
The college must have processes in place whereby students are observed and assessed formatively and summatively, with timely documentation to assure accuracy of the assessment for having attained each of the following competencies:
7. understanding of health promotion, and biosecurity, prevention and control of disease including zoonoses and principles of food safety.

Directives:
The school must ensure that documentation exists that all students have attained competence in food safety and veterinary public health.

Suggestions:
The school should consider the addition of mid-rotation formative feedback in all rotations.

Overall, can the college be said to be in compliance with Standard 11?

YES MD NO
CLASSIFICATION OF ACCREDITATION

The University of Glasgow School of Veterinary Medicine is granted Accredited status with a minor deficiency in Standard 11 Outcomes Assessment.