

WEB COPY

Court

Minute of Meeting held on Wednesday 7 October 2015 in the Senate Room

Present:

Mr Dave Anderson Employee Representative, Professor George Baillie Senate Assessor, Mr Graeme Bissett Co-opted Member, Mr Ken Brown Co-opted Member, Ms Heather Cousins Co-opted Member, Dr Carl Goodyear Senate Assessor, Mr Liam King SRC President, Mr Brian McBride General Council Assessor, Dr Morag Macdonald Simpson General Council Assessor, Ms Margaret Anne McParland Employee Representative, Mr David Milloy Co-opted Member, Ms Margaret Morton Co-opted Member, Professor Anton Muscatelli Principal, Mr David Ross General Council Assessor (Convener of Court), Dr Duncan Ross Senate Assessor, Ms Lesley Sutherland General Council Assessor, Professor Paul Younger Senate Assessor

In attendance:

Ms Ann Allen (Director of Estates & Buildings), Ms Christine Barr (Director of Human Resources), Professor John Briggs (Clerk of Senate), Professor James Conroy (Vice-Principal Internationalisation), Professor Jon Cooper (Vice-Principal Innovation & Knowledge Exchange), Professor Frank Coton (Vice Principal Academic and Educational Innovation), Mr Robert Fraser (Director of Finance), Professor Neal Juster (Senior Vice-Principal), Ms Deborah Maddern (Administrative Officer), Mr David Newall (Secretary of Court), Professor Roibeard O Maolalaigh (Head of College of Arts and Vice-Principal)

Apologies:

Members: Mr Marvin Karrasch SRC Assessor, Professor Karen Lury Senate Assessor, Cllr Pauline McKeever Glasgow City Council Representative, Mr Murdoch MacLennan Chancellor's Assessor

Attendees: Professor Anne Anderson (Head of College of Social Sciences and Vice-Principal), Professor Muffy Calder (Head of College of Science & Engineering and Vice-Principal), Professor Anna Dominiczak (Head of College of Medical, Veterinary and Life Sciences and Vice-Principal), Professor Miles Padgett (Vice-Principal Research)

CRT/2015/1. Announcements

Liam King was welcomed back, now in his capacity as SRC President. Marvin Karrasch, SRC Assessor, had been unable to attend his final meeting of Court. Christine Forde, Senate Assessor, had demitted office in July. Court's thanks to them for their contributions to Court were recorded.

CRT/2015/2. Minutes of the meetings held on Wednesday 24 June 2015

The minutes were approved.

CRT/2015/3. Matters Arising

With regard to minute CRT/2014/45.4, *Socially Responsible Investment Policy – Fossil Fuels*,

Paul Younger reported that Anglo American had discontinued financial support for a course of study.

CRT/2015/4. Report from the Principal

CRT 2015/4.1 Student Admissions including RUK.

Court noted details of student admissions figures for 2015 entry, for Undergraduate and Postgraduate (PGT/PGR), Home, RUK and International students. Court noted the very positive outcome in the context of fierce competition for recruitment. The position on international student recruitment in the future remained uncertain, given the UK government's potential restricting of visas; the sector continued to lobby strongly in this area.

CRT 2015/4.2 Universities Superannuation Scheme USS.

A revised benefit structure for USS had been developed, to address the deficit in the scheme and to mitigate the risk that contribution rates would become unaffordable for employers and employees. The proposal had been that final salary accruals cease as at 31 March 2016, with benefits built up before this date being protected. Future defined benefits would be grown in the Career Revalued Benefits section of the scheme, up to a threshold of £55k. Any pensionable salary over this threshold would be pensioned through a new Defined Contribution section of the scheme. There had been a statutory consultation process, which had run from 16 March to 22 May.

Following the consultation, the final position was that the new USS arrangements would be introduced in phases from 1 April 2016. The timing of these phases was still being discussed by USS and employers. The key features, once fully implemented, would be:

- Career Revalued Benefits (CRB) for all members on salary up to £55,000. Pension would be built up based on 1/75th of salary per year. The lump sum would be 3/75ths of salary. This was a change from the current basis of pension being built up based on 1/80th of salary per year and the lump sum being 3/80ths of salary.
- A Defined Contribution section for members based on salary above £55,000.
- An option for all members to make additional contributions to the Defined Contribution section of the scheme and to claim an additional 'matched' 1% from the employer contributions, provided the member contributed an additional 1%.

To fund the changes to the USS, employee contributions would rise from 7.5% (Final Salary members) or 6.5% (CRB members), to 8% of salary. The University would also pay more, contributing 18% of an employee's earnings to his/her pension, up from 16%.

CRT 2015/4.3 Living Wage

Earlier in the year, Court had heard that work had been initiated to explore the potential for the University to become a Living Wage accredited employer. The Living Wage (set by the Living Wage Foundation) was a voluntary rate that employers could choose to commit to paying, was the same for all workers over the age of 18, and was based on the cost of living and the "minimum income standards" required for a basic, but adequate, standard of living.

All University employees were already paid at this level, but steps had been taken in relation to casual workers (largely student assistants), who were now also paid the Living Wage, and to

contractors on campus, whom the University had encouraged to commit to paying the Living Wage. Formal confirmation had been received in August of accreditation as a Living Wage Employer.

CRT 2015/4.4 Joint Educational Initiatives in China

Negotiations had taken place earlier this year with the Chinese Ministry of Education with regard to the formation of a Joint Educational Institute (JEI) in Engineering with the University of Electronic Science and Technology of China (UESTC). A delegation had visited the UK on the 18 June to consolidate the agreement. At the UK-China Education Summit in London in September, Professor Li Yanrong, President of UESTC, and the Principal had signed a Memorandum of Agreement in the presence of the Minister for Education China and UK Ministers and government officials, confirming the commitment to establish the JEI.

In July, the First Minister had observed the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding between the University and Nankai University, marking the inauguration of the University of Glasgow-Nankai University Joint Graduate School, the first postgraduate higher education programme to be set up on a Chinese university campus in partnership with a UK institution. The School had opened in August, with its first intake of postgraduates.

CRT 2015/4.5 University Rankings and Awards

Court noted recent details of rankings and awards, including a fall back from 55th to 62nd place in the QS World University Rankings and a rise from 95th to 76th place in the THE World Rankings, the highest position ever. The University was continuing to monitor where improvements or changes might be effected, in the context of the overall strategic plan.

In July, the University had been named Institution of the Year at the inaugural Herald Higher Education Awards. In August, the University had been ranked top in Scotland and third in the Russell Group in the National Student Survey 2015, as measured by overall satisfaction. The results had also placed 15 of the University's subject areas in the UK's top ten. In September, the University had received the award of a 5*Plus rating in the QS Stars University Ratings, the first UK university to achieve this.

CRT/2015/4.6 Key Activities

Court noted a summary of some of the main activities in which the Principal had been involved since the last meeting of Court, covering internal and external activities beyond daily operational management and strategy meetings. The activities were under the broad headings of: Academic Development and Strategy; Internationalisation activities; Lobbying/Policy Influencing and Promoting the University; Internal activities and Communications.

CRT/2015/5. Report from the Secretary of Court

CRT/2015/5.1 Court Strategy Day

Court noted a report of the Strategy Discussion Day held on 30 September, which had included a substantial session on the Campus Estate Strategy, and briefing sessions on E-Learning and on Student Recruitment and Marketing. With regard to the Campus Estate Strategy, there had been briefings on: the overall management of the programme; the progress of specific projects; the funding strategy; and arrangements for ongoing review and reporting, during the last of which sessions Court had agreed that the following arrangements should be put in place:

i) Review

A Panel of experts should be established, who will be responsible for: a) undertaking Gateway Reviews in respect of each major project; and b) conducting an annual review of the whole programme. This annual review will conclude with a report to the Principal, which will then be discussed at SMG and at Court.

In addition to the work of the Panel of experts:

- the full capital plan will be reviewed annually by Finance Committee and Court as part of the annual budget process; and*
- a small panel of senior designers will undertake a design review of the Masterplan, reporting to Estates Committee.*

ii) Reporting

- As already agreed, all business cases over £25M will come to Court, after being considered by Finance Committee.*
- Estates Committee will receive presentations on all major projects at key design stages, and will monitor performance in implementing the overall programme.*
- A Court Working Group will be formed, including lay members, students and staff representatives and professional officers, to support Court in the ongoing work on the Estates Strategy and Capital Plan. At key points, the Working Group will discuss investment proposals, and test business cases prior to their being forwarded for committee approvals.*

CRT/2015/5.2 Higher Education Governance (Scotland) Bill

Publication of the HE Governance (Scotland) Bill had been in June. Parliamentary scrutiny would run through until the first quarter of 2016. Calls for evidence, from the Scottish Government's Finance and Education & Culture Committees, had been issued over the summer and responses to both had been submitted following consideration by the Court Governance Working Group. Certain aspects of the Bill, particularly in relation to the possibility of Ministerial involvement in governing institutions, continued to cause concern in the sector, and further co-ordinated representations would be made in the coming months.

Court would continue to be kept informed.

CRT/2015/5.3 Governance of Subsidiaries

Court received a paper on the governance of University subsidiaries, which had been drafted followed an internal audit. The audit had made four recommendations, one of which had been that 'The university will implement a formal, risk-based governance structure for each of its subsidiaries. This should be proportionate to the risks posed by each entity'.

Court approved a proposed structure, based on a tiered approach which took into account factors including annual turnover and risk assessment.

In response to a question about potential liabilities, such as contractual liabilities, being incurred by individual companies, it was agreed that there would be standard powers through the Memorandum and Articles, but that, for each new subsidiary, Court should agree a schedule of powers that would be reserved to Court, depending on the nature of the activity.

CRT/2015/5.4 Court Procedural Review Group: Library

At its meeting in June, Court had agreed changes to the remit and membership of the Court Procedural Review Group (CPRG). On Court's behalf, the group considered proposals on organisational change, and, since June, it had the authority to instruct management to take

forward Organisational Change proposals. Alternatively, it might decide not to authorise the proposals, and/or to refer them to Court for discussion.

The CPRG had considered one item of business since the last meeting of Court. This had been a proposal from the University Library, which involved restructuring the support service offered at evenings and weekends, with a view to reducing cost and providing a better-fitting structure. The proposal involved 43 current positions no longer being required. These were part-time roles, with a total FTE of 5.83. Having considered the proposal, the CPRG had authorised management to take forward implementation in consultation with the relevant campus trade unions. Court noted that the student experience should not be affected by the changes and that there should not be any impact on data used for league tables. The Secretary of Court agreed that he, the Director of the Library and the SRC President would meet to discuss any impact on students, arising from the changes.

CRT/2015/5.5 Nominations Committee business

i) Court and Committees

Court approved a recommendation from the Nominations Committee, which had conducted interviews on the previous day, that Ms Elizabeth Passey be confirmed in the appointment of Convener of Court. Ms Passey would formally take up her position as Convener from 1 August 2016, as a Co-opted member. This would be for a four year period, with an option of reappointment, at Court's discretion, for a second term of office. The appointment was being made in advance of David Ross's retirement in July 2016, to give an opportunity for shadowing, to include observing at a Court meeting or meetings and observing the main Committees.

There were also a number of Court and Court Committee vacancies, with recruitment currently taking place through the Nominations Committee, for positions comprising: two co-opted members on Court, a Remuneration Committee lay member, an Audit Committee external (non-Court) member, an Estates Committee external (non-Court) member, and two GU Holdings external members, further to Court's approval of revised Terms of Reference for this company. Court would be kept informed, with recommendations for appointments following shortly.

ii) Equality and Diversity Committee EDSC

The EDSC was an executive group, chaired by the Principal, and to date it had not had a lay governor present. Given her interest and expertise in this area, Lesley Sutherland had attended the Committee for the last two meetings and, following approval by the Nominations Committee, had now joined as a member of the EDSC, for the same period as her membership of Court, currently to 31 July 2018.

iii) Audit Committee chair

Following approval by the Nominations Committee, Dr Paul Brady had been re-appointed as chair of the Audit Committee from 1 August 2015 to 31 July 2016.

iv) Court Procedural Review Group CPRG

At Court's June 2015 meeting, it had been agreed to expand the CPRG to include three, rather than two, lay members. Ken Brown and Morag Macdonald Simpson had already been members and both had confirmed they were willing to continue. Following approval by the Nominations Committee, David Milloy had been appointed as the third lay member of the

group. The remaining two members of the CPRG were the Senior Senate Assessor (Duncan Ross) and another Senate Assessor (Karen Lury) as nominated by the Senior Senate Assessor.

v) Remuneration Committee

Ken Brown had agreed to chair the Remuneration Committee, following the death of David Anderson. A recommendation for the chairship in the longer term would follow via the Nominations Committee; in the meantime Mr Brown was willing to continue in the role.

CRT/2015/5.6 Ordinance relating to Membership of Court

Ordinance 206 had been approved by the Privy Council in July 2015. Its impact was to increase the number of co-opted positions on Court from 5 to 9, to reduce the number of Senate Assessors from 7 to 6 and to reduce the number of General Council Assessors from 5 to 2. As previously agreed by Court, the change in composition would take place in a phased manner as vacancies arose. In Session 2015/16, Court would have 7 co-opted members, 6 Senate Assessors and 4 General Council Assessors.

CRT/2015/5.7 Ordinance relating to Membership of the General Council

Membership of the General Council was currently governed by an Ordinance, which listed categories of members. The Ordinance included provisions relating to graduates whose degrees were either jointly awarded in conjunction with other institutions, or awarded by another institution whose degrees were validated by the University. These categories needed to be updated to reflect changes that had been made in recent years to the portfolio of collaborative programmes.

Court agreed that to generalise such categories would be the preferred way forward, so that they could cover any such joint awarding/validation arrangements in operation from time to time, meaning that future requirements for amendments would be kept to a minimum. The Privy Council would therefore be asked for an early view on the feasibility of making the Ordinance more flexible, with any formal processes to follow, to involve Court and the normal consultations for an Ordinance change.

CRT/2015/5.8 Court Business 2015/16

Court noted: Standing Orders for Court including appendices with details of Court committee dates for this session; the Statement of Primary Responsibilities; and the Schedule of Court Business for the coming year.

The attendance lists for meetings of Court and its committees for 2014/15 had been reviewed; there were no outstanding issues to report in connection with this.

CRT/2015/5.9 Senate Assessor on Court

Professor Christine Forde had demitted office, at 31 July 2015. Senate was in the process of appointing an Assessor to replace her.

CRT/2015/5.10 Queen Margaret Union – Constitutional Changes

On Court's behalf, the Secretary of Court had approved minor changes to the constitution of the Queen Margaret Union.

CRT/2015/5.11 Appointments of Head of School

College of MVLS - School of Life Sciences

Professor Simon Guild had been appointed as Head of the School Life Sciences for 4 years from 1 October 2015.

College of Social Sciences - School of Social and Political Sciences

Professor Michele Burman had been appointed as Head of the School of Social and Political Sciences from 1 September 2015 to 31 July 2017

CRT/2015/6. Learning & Teaching Strategy

Professor Frank Coton updated Court on the Learning and Teaching Strategy, including performance against Key Performance Indicators, which were noted by Court, in particular the maintenance of an excellent student satisfaction rate in the NSS.

Highlights in the Learning and Teaching sphere in the past year included investment in online programmes, with several courses launching in 2015/16 and more planned for the following year. The Recognition of Excellence in Teaching framework had been accredited, with a pilot having run and a wider roll-out scheduled for the coming year. The New Staff training programme had been accredited, and embedded as part of the Early Career Development Programme. The EVASys system for gathering in-course student feedback had been implemented across the University. The Early Secondary Programme (widening access) scheme has been implemented and was now being expanded. With regard to estate development, design work was underway for the Learning and Teaching Hub, the Library refurbishment was continuing, and new configurations for teaching and learning spaces were being trialled.

The Learning and Teaching Strategy 2015-2020 underpinned all activity. It had been developed in consultation with the University community, and was aligned with the University Strategic Plan. Key aspects were: Focussing on Enhancement, through reviewing, reflecting on and developing teaching practice, processes and facilities - all of which involved input from the student body; Fostering critical thought and investigative learning, putting the fundamental relationship between teaching and cutting-edge research at the heart of a transformational learning experience; Inclusiveness, including promoting access and opportunity; and Providing a supportive environment.

Court noted that the quality of the physical environment and IT infrastructure was essential to the successful implementation of the strategy, and that regular analysis of student needs, including consultation with students, was undertaken to this end.

The strategy was aligned with the University Strategic Plan workstreams, in the areas of: Empowering People, where activity included initiatives relating to recognition and reward of teaching, and development and professional recognition of staff; Agility, including improved teaching and information support systems, and developing physical infrastructure; and Focus, on areas such as curricular innovation and internationalisation of the curriculum.

Court thanked Professor Coton for the briefing.

CRT/2015/7. Reports of Court Committees

CRT/2015/7.1 Finance Committee

CRT/2015/7.1.1 Finance Committee Remit

The Remit of the Committee required to be updated to take account of changes agreed to approval processes for very large capital projects. A new section had been proposed, to add that projects requiring expenditure above £25M must be referred to Court for final decision, with a recommendation from Finance Committee.

Court approved the change.

CRT/2015/7.1.2 Capex applications and current programme of capital works

Finance Committee had received two capex applications for additional funding for the Quantum Technology Hub (additional expenditure of £1.85M) and the Acre Road Wind Tunnel facility (additional expenditure of £222.5k). The two projects had presented distinct challenges but there had been similarities in that both could be categorised as smaller, technically complex projects which had required significant technical expertise to brief. Both applications had been approved by Finance Committee, but with a request that a review be performed of any other smaller projects currently under way.

CRT/2015/7.1.3 Endowment Investment Report

Court noted an endowment investment report as at 31 July 2015.

CRT/2015/7.1.4 Financial reports

Court noted an overview of performance as at 31 July 2015.

The report was noted.

CRT/2015/7.2 Audit Committee

The Committee had received reports on recent internal audits. No reports had been classified as critical or high risk.

The Committee had received an update on IT Penetration Testing, noting an assessment (re-test) based on an exercise undertaken in 2014, covering threats posed to the University's internet-facing infrastructure. The large majority of actions had been satisfactorily addressed. The exercise would be repeated annually. The Committee had received a report on Research Misconduct cases, noting that two formal investigations relating to research misconduct were undertaken during the 2014/15. The Committee also noted that a review of the University's policies and procedures for promoting good research practice and investigating breaches of research integrity was being undertaken.

The report was noted.

CRT/2015/7.3 Estates Committee

CRT/2015/7.3.1 Estate Strategy and Capital Programme

Court noted the progress made in respect of the Estate Strategy and Capital Programme.

CRT/2015/7.3.2 CapEx applications

Court noted and endorsed Estates Committee's approval of CapEx applications in respect of: Acre Road Wind Tunnel facility in the additional sum of £222.5k; and Quantum Technology Hub in the additional sum of £1.85M.

The report was noted.

CRT/2015/7.4 Human Resources Committee

The HR Director had provided an update to the Committee highlighting a number of substantive areas including the National Pay negotiations, the USS consultation, the current year's Performance & Development Review process, the University's application for accreditation as a Living Wage employer, and initiatives underway on reward and diversity.

The Committee had received an update on the launch of the new University Strategy and the progress being made in relation to the three central work streams; and an update on the activities of the HR function within the College of MVLS and the strategic challenges within its people agenda. The Committee had also received an update of the key HR data, in particular information about absence management. The policy was currently under review by HR and the Trade Unions.

The report was noted.

CRT/2015/7.5 Health, Safety and Wellbeing Committee

The Committee had discussed whether Glasgow should follow the lead of most other UK universities in banning the smoking of e-cigarettes within university premises, agreeing that in order to maintain an enjoyable and comfortable working environment for staff and students, the Committee would recommend to Court that it prohibit the smoking of e-cigarettes within University buildings.

Court approved the recommendation.

The Committee had reviewed standard reports on Occupational Health activities and on accidents that had occurred in recent months. The Committee had also received an update on departmental health & safety management audits, and on the extent to which recommendations from these had been addressed by departments. The Committee had noted that certain departments had several recommendations still outstanding, and the relevant members of the Committee had agreed to speak in each case with the department head to stress the importance of addressing these promptly.

The report was noted.

CRT/2015/7.6 Remuneration Committee

The Remuneration Committee had considered a paper from the Director of HR, seeking to establish the Voluntary Severance (VS) Scheme on a fresh footing, creating a Voluntary Severance Panel to consider all cases for VS, and addressing the governance requirements that had emerged over the last 2 years through the Scottish Code of Good Governance in Higher Education and the Scottish Funding Council's revised Financial Memorandum.

Court approved a recommendation from the Committee to approve the terms of the Voluntary Severance Policy.

The report was noted. Court also noted that Remuneration Committee would meet again on 7 October, at which meeting it would conduct the annual review of the SMG salaries. The proposed method of reviewing senior management salaries had been approved at a meeting of Court held on 30 September.

CRT/2015/8. Communications from Meeting of Council of Senate held on 1 October 2015

Council of Senate had approved an extension of the appointment of Professor John Briggs in the role of Clerk of Senate until 21 July 2018.

Council of Senate had received briefings on the Internationalisation Strategy 2015-20 and on the Learning & Teaching Strategy 2015-20. The Council had also received an update on the University Strategy and the implementation of the improvement programme that had been developed.

Council of Senate had discussed the HE Governance (Scotland) Bill, with members' concerns expressed about the future implications of the proposed legislation.

Council of Senate had received a report from the Honorary Degrees Committee concerning recommendations for the conferment of honorary Degrees in 2016.

In line with the previously agreed arrangement with Senate to allow members of Court to submit observations on nominations for honorary degrees, the Clerk of Senate John Briggs advised Court of the 2015/2016 nominations, on a confidential basis. Members of Court could contact the Clerk of Senate should they have observations to make.

The Communications from the Council of Senate were noted.

CRT/2015/9. Annual report for SFC – Institutional-led Review of Quality and Governing Body Statement of Assurance

Court had received a copy of the University's draft annual report to the Scottish Funding Council (SFC) on institution-led review of quality for AY 2014-15. The contents were specified by the SFC. The statement summarised review activity undertaken by the University of its provision for students, i.e. Periodic Subject Reviews (PSR), Graduate School Reviews and the University Services Administrative Review Programme (ARP) carried out in respect of student-facing University services. Information concerning review activity carried out at the University by Professional, Statutory or Regulatory Bodies was also included.

Having noted details of how the University assured the effectiveness of arrangements for maintaining academic standards and quality, Court agreed that the required statement of assurance could be signed off by the Convener of Court

CRT/2015/10. Any Other Business

Court members would shortly start to receive daily summary media reports, and the campus e-news publication. The clerk would contact members to establish who wished to receive Court papers electronically.

CRT/2015/11. Date of Next Meeting

Court Wednesday 7 October 2015

The next meeting of the Court will be held on Wednesday 16 December 2015 at 2pm in the Senate Room.