

WEB COPY

Court

Minute of Meeting held on Wednesday 19 June 2013 in the Senate Room

Present:

Mr David Anderson General Council Member, Ms Susan Ashworth Employee Representative, Mr Ken Brown Co-opted Member, Mr Peter Daniels Co-opted Member, Dr Robin Easton Co-opted Member, Professor Christine Forde Senate Member, Dr Marie Freel Senate Member, Mr James Harrison SRC President, Mr Brian McBride General Council Member, Mr Alan Macfarlane General Council Member, Mr Donald Mackay SRC Member on Court, Mr Murdoch MacLennan Chancellor's Representative, Professor William Martin Senate Member, Ms Margaret Morton Co-opted Member, Professor Anton Muscatelli Principal, Dr Alan Owen Senate Member, Mr David Ross General Council Member (Convener of Court), Professor Michael Scott-Morton Co-opted Member, Professor Adrienne Scullion Senate Member, Dr Donald Spaeth Senate Member, Mr Kevin Sweeney General Council Member

In attendance:

Ms Ann Allen (Director of Estates & Buildings), Professor Anne Anderson (Head of College of Social Sciences and Vice-Principal), Mr Ian Black (Director of Human Resources), Professor John Briggs (Clerk of Senate), Professor John Chapman (Head of College of Science & Engineering and Vice-Principal), Professor Frank Coton (Vice-Principal Learning & Teaching), Mr Robert Fraser (Director of Finance), Professor Neal Juster (Vice-Principal Strategy & Resources), Ms Deborah Maddern (Administrative Officer), Mr David Newall (Secretary of Court), Professor Murray Pittock (Head of College of Arts and Vice-Principal), Dr Dorothy Welch (Deputy Secretary) (for item 48.1)

Apologies:

Members: Rt Hon Charles Kennedy MP Rector, Cllr Matt Kerr Glasgow City Council Assessor, Ms Margaret Anne McParland Employee Representative, Professor Miles Padgett Senate Member

Attendees: Professor Steve Beaumont (Vice-Principal Research & Enterprise), Professor Anna Dominiczak (Head of College of Medical, Veterinary and Life Sciences and Vice-Principal)

CRT/2012/44. Announcements

Court welcomed Jacquie Dowd, who was attending the Court meeting in place of Margaret Anne McParland, and the SRC President-elect Jess McGrellis, to the Court meeting.

James Harrison, Billy Martin, Alan Owen, Adrienne Scullion and Ian Black were attending their final meeting of Court. Court thanked them for their contributions to Court and wished them well in the future.

CRT/2012/45. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 April 2013

The minutes were approved.

CRT/2012/46. Matters Arising

There were no matters arising.

CRT/2012/47. Strategic Plan Update/Key Performance Indicators and Budget 2013/14

Professor Neal Juster, Vice Principal Strategy and Resources, provided an update on progress against the University's Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) in the 12 months to June 2013. The KPIs were described in the University's strategic plan: *Glasgow 2020: A Global Vision*. Court noted the KPIs and related details.

Court received the annual update of the capital plan 2013-2023. The capital plan was flexible and responsive and would be impacted significantly by the new Estates Strategy expected in June 2014, where the Western Infirmary development would feature significantly. The Capital Plan forecast £222.4m of capital and revenue spending on estates development projects through to 2016-17 and an additional £78.2m on estates operations costs.

Court received a briefing on the 2013/14 University Budget and financial forecasts.

The 2013-14 budget outlined a management accounting surplus of £2.9m on activity based in Glasgow, rising to £4.0m after net income from overseas income (SIT and UESTC collaborations) was included. The projected surplus was lower than the target surplus (of £10m per annum) due to various staffing costs; the impact of increased staffing for REF purposes, pension auto-enrolment, inflation and promotion and funding to support UGPS deficit. The £15.1m projected increase in staffing costs was partly offset by an expected £14.8m increase in tuition fee income from home, RUK and international students.

The financial forecasts project management accounting surpluses of £6.2m, £16.1m and £18.0m on activity based in Glasgow in 2014-15, 2015-16 and 2016-17 respectively. Projected surpluses rose to £8.2m, £18.1m and £20m after net income from overseas income was included.

The budget and financial forecasts were based on a number of assumptions and risks. Salary inflation costs were projected at 1% for 2013-14 and 2% for each subsequent year. In order to achieve the projected surpluses, tuition fee income from overseas students was expected to increase incrementally to £80m per annum (2016-17) from £52.2m in 2012-13. International student targets had been thoroughly reviewed in a bottom-up and top-down method. In particular further growth was projected in the business school and in medical and vet subjects. The University was mindful of the need to have a balance of countries represented in its overseas student population and not to rely overly on a single market. It was noted that refinements were being made to student surveys to obtain more granulated data on the student experience to ensure that actions could be taken to address any issues. In addition, an analysis of staff:student ratios was being undertaken as part of a scheduled review of the strategic plan.

Court approved the 2013/14 Budget and four year financial forecasts, and the updated capital plan 2013-2023. Court thanked Professor Juster and his colleagues for their work on these areas.

CRT/2012/48. Report from the Principal

CRT/2012/48.1 Pensions Scheme

As Court had heard at previous meetings, the chair of the Trustees of the UGPS had advised the University in late 2012 that the UK's Pensions Regulator had raised concerns regarding the UGPS deficit recovery plan, the deficit having increased significantly because of the low rate of return applying to Government bonds. The Trustees had commissioned an independent review of the strength of the University's financial covenant and a review of arrangements for funding the deficit. The Trustees had subsequently asked the University to increase substantially its financial commitment to the pension scheme. Court had established an expert working group to

provide advice on the matter, to review proposals for addressing the current UGPS deficit, and to consider the future benefit structure of UGPS.

The Senior Management Group, the Pension Trustees and the Court working group had had a series of discussions on this issue, including considering a number of options for the structure of a future scheme. SMG members had also briefed the relevant campus trade unions. Court had received a background briefing at the pre-Court meeting on 19 June. The recommendations to Court arising from the process had been circulated to Court. A letter from JULC and copies of minutes of consultative meetings with the unions had also been circulated.

The proposal being made to Court was to retain the current Defined Benefit (DB) scheme for existing members, with changes in the benefits structure to bring it in line with USS. These changes included increasing the retirement age in line with the state retirement age, increasing the employee contribution rate to 7.5% and sharing any future cost increases in an agreed ratio. This was seen as being the most equitable approach under the circumstances, and protected the generous benefits of existing members at an affordable cost. The scheme did however carry unacceptable levels of risk for the University and the proposal was that it would be closed to new entrants to be replaced by a Defined Contribution (DC) scheme with an employer contribution of 10% and an employee contribution of 5%. In addition, the future of the DB scheme would be tied to any future changes to USS such that all employees in existing schemes would be on comparable terms and conditions without further review being required. The details of the transition to this new set of benefits would be subject to consultation with employees, but some tapering of savings would be required. All current members would be given the option to switch into the new DC scheme and the auto-enrolment arrangements would not be affected. The changes would be implemented during 2014.

The chair of the working group, Ken Brown, noted that if Court was minded to agree the principles being recommended at the current meeting, then this would also have the advantage of addressing the scheme's deficit over time.

Dr Welch explained that the required consultation with staff representatives would take place over the summer months in the event that Court approved the recommendations of the working group. Were there to be significant matters raised during this consultative process, for example proposals for a radically different approach that had not been considered by the group, there was scope for some flexibility and Court might be further briefed in the autumn. Ian Black noted that the requirements were for consultation not negotiation. Jacquie Dowd commented that there had been no opportunity given during the process to date for staff to make counter-proposals and union members had not seen figures at consultative meetings and expressed concern that any ongoing consultation would be about implementation rather than providing an opportunity for any substantive changes to what was being proposed. Ken Brown commented that existing staff who were currently not in the scheme had had the opportunity to join the scheme but seemed unlikely to do so if they had not already acted; the proposals would affect new entrants and not such existing staff. Court was being asked to agree clear principles that would apply going forward, to new entrants. Margaret Morton and David Anderson expressed support for the process to date, for the depth of analysis undertaken and for the clear proposals that had been presented. Court noted that if substantive different proposals emerged over the summer that the SMG wished to consider then this was not precluded.

The recommendations from the working group, in summary that the benefits under the existing scheme should be brought into line with those under USS, and that the existing scheme should be continued for existing members but closed to new entrants and a new Defined Contribution Scheme offered to new entrants, were approved by Court and as such a consultation exercise with staff representatives would take place over the summer months. Existing scheme members, and potential members (eligible staff who were currently not enrolled) would be contacted to update them on proposed changes to the scheme.

Ken Brown and the Court working group were thanked for their work.

CRT/2012/48.2 SFC Grant Award

Details of the 2013/14 SFC grant award would be circulated to Court when full details were available, although meaningful comparisons with previous years' allocations were difficult given the different methodology used and the increased use of incentive schemes.

The main changes in SFC income included: 200 extra places to support widening participation (£1m), 122 new PGT funded places (£850k), and a £2.5m Global Excellence Grant to improve international research. This was partly offset by a reduction in the Knowledge Transfer Grant (£400k) and the removal of funding for the graduating cohort of RUK students.

CRT/2012/48.3 University Rankings

Court noted details of recent University rankings tables.

CRT/2012/48.4 Key Activities

Court noted a summary of some of the main activities in which the Principal had been involved since the last meeting of Court, covering internal and external activities beyond daily operational management and strategy meetings. The activities were under the broad headings of: Academic Development and Strategy; Internationalisation activities; Lobbying/Policy Influencing and Promoting the University; Internal activities and Communications.

CRT/2012/49. Report from the Secretary of Court

CRT/2012/49.1 Governance Discussion Day 31 May

A report containing recommendations and proposed actions arising from the Court Governance discussion had been circulated. Court approved the recommendations in the document and noted that a large part of the actions would be taken forward over the coming months, with an update to the October meeting of Court. The working group which would look further at the composition of Court would report to October Court. Court agreed that the working group would comprise the senior Senate Assessor (Donald Spaeth), the SRC President (Jess McGrellis), an Employee Representative (Susan Ashworth) and three lay members of Court (David Ross (convener of working group), Alan Macfarlane, Margaret Morton).

CRT/2012/49.2 Post-16 Education (Scotland) Bill

Court had been briefed on the contents of the Post-16 Education Bill, and had submitted comments on it to the Education & Culture Committee. Section 3 of the draft bill placed a requirement on universities to comply with principles of good governance and management practice, as determined by Scottish Ministers. The University had supported a suggested amendment to that part of the Bill, as proposed by Universities Scotland, having the impact that, instead of the above, universities would in future be required to comply with a Code of Good Governance practice, as developed by the HE sector. The amended Bill now required universities to comply with principles of good governance, as determined by the SFC. The bill as drafted would also give a government minister the authority to determine, as a condition of funding, the nature of a University's requirements in relation to widening access.

Court would receive a further update on the Bill, and on the progress of the Scottish Code of Good HE Governance, at the October meeting.

CRT/2012/49.3 Vice-Principal (Learning & Teaching)

At the beginning of the meeting, Court approved a recommendation from the Principal that Professor Frank Coton's appointment as Vice-Principal (Learning & Teaching) be extended for a second term of four years, through until 31 December 2017.

CRT/2012/49.4 Nominations Committee

The Nominations Committee had met in April, as there were a number of Court and Committee membership items for discussion. Court approved the following recommendations made on the Nominations Committee's behalf:

i) Co-opted members

In their absence from the meeting, Court approved a recommendation that Ken Brown's and Margaret Morton's terms on Court continue for a further 4 years from 1 January 2014.

Court also approved their continuation as (respectively) chair and member of the Finance and Estates Committees.

Peter Daniels and Robin Easton would end their second term on Court on 31 December 2013 and Michael Scott Morton would end his second term on Court on 31 March 2014. Court approved a recommendation that an advertisement seeking co-opted members of Court be drawn up, with the aim of recruiting three suitably qualified members with particular expertise in, respectively, finance, estates and academic (specifically research and/or knowledge transfer) matters. The advertisement, to be placed in publications including specialist media, would include both generic and specific criteria, and mention the additional possibility of service on one of the Finance Committee, Estates Committee or Research Planning & Strategy Committee.

ii) Chancellor's Assessor

Murdoch MacLennan's period of office as a member of Court would expire on 31 December 2013. Court noted that the Chancellor had invited him to serve for a second term of four years, and this had been accepted.

iii) Audit Committee

There was one current vacancy on the Audit Committee. Court agreed that an advertisement be placed to attract a qualified accountant onto the Audit Committee, to fill this existing vacancy.

iv) Estates Committee

In her absence from the meeting, Court approved a recommendation that Margaret Morton be appointed as Chair of the Estates Committee from 1 January 2014.

v) Remuneration Committee

Court had agreed as part of the recent governance discussions that this Committee should be further augmented by the appointment of an external lay member. Court agreed that the position should be advertised.

vi) Nominations Committee

The Lay Member vacancy that would arise from Robin Easton leaving Court in December 2013 would be filled once the new co-opted members of Court were appointed. Although not discussed by the Nominations Committee itself, Court had also agreed as part of the recent governance discussions that this Committee should be augmented by one (further) lay member, in addition to the appointment to the Committee of the SRC President. The further lay member would be identified as soon as possible in discussion with Court members.

vii) Court Procedural Review Group

The CPRG would be convened for Tier 2 cases under the Management of Organisational Change policy, to scrutinise proposals and, from the October to June Court meetings each year, recommend to Court the actions Court should take; during the summer months, the CPRG would decide on Tier 2 cases without automatic reference to Court.

Court approved a recommendation for membership of this group as follows, the individuals being willing to serve: one lay member of HR Committee (Alan MacFarlane); one other lay member (not a member of HR Committee) (Kevin Sweeney); one Senate Assessor (Donald Spaeth). This membership would be supplemented on each occasion by the relevant Head of College/Head of University Services.

CRT/2012/49.5 Court Convenership

In his absence from the meeting, Court approved a recommendation that David Ross be reappointed as Convener for the period 1 January 2014 to 31 July 2016.

CRT/2012/49.6 Introduction of New University Complaints Procedure

The Scottish Public Services Ombudsman (SPSO) required the University, along with all other Scottish HE Institutions, to introduce a new Complaints Procedure by the end of August 2013. The University was required to be compliant with the Model Complaints Handling Procedure, which was now a condition of the SFC funding agreement.

Court approved the introduction of the new complaints procedure, to come into force on 12 August 2013, on publication of the University Calendar 2013-14.

CRT/2012/49.7 Glasgow University Union

GUU's officers were undertaking an independent review of the culture within the GUU, following complaints made by two visiting women speakers about sexist abuse at this year's Glasgow University Union (GUU) Ancients Debating Championship. The review panel was expected to report in August and details would be provided to Court in October.

CRT/2012/49.8 Senate Assessors on Court

The following had been elected to Court until 31 July 2017:

Professor Nicholas Jonsson (College of Medical, Veterinary & Life Sciences Professorial member)

Dr Duncan Ross (College of Social Sciences non-Professorial member)

Professor Karen Lury (College of Arts Professorial member)

CRT/2012/49.9 SRC Elections

The following candidates had been successful in the Spring 2013 SRC elections and would take up sabbatical officer posts on 1st July 2013:

President	Jess McGrellis
VP Education	Oli Coombs
VP Student Support	Louise Graham
VP Student Activities	Breffni O'Connor

CRT/2012/49.10 Heads of School

The following appointments had been made:

College of Social Sciences

School of Law (current Head Professor Rosa Greaves)

Professor Mark Furse from 1 August 2013 for a period of two years

Professor Iain MacNeil to be Deputy Head of School from 1 August 2013 for two years and then Head of School for four years from 1 August 2015 with Professor Furse as his deputy for a period to be agreed

College of Arts

School of Modern Languages and Cultures (current Head Professor John Macklin, acting Head Dr Barbara Burns)

Professor Kathryn Crameri from 1 January 2014 until 31 July 2017

School of Critical Studies (current Head Professor Nigel Leask)

Professor Jeremy Smith from 1 January 2014 until 31 July 2017

The following Senate Assessor would serve on the appointing Committee for a Head of School where a vacancy was occurring in July 2013:

College of Social Sciences

School of Social and Political Sciences (current Head Professor Mike French)

Professor Adrienne Scullion will be the Senate Assessor on the appointing committee

CRT/2012/49.11 Resolutions

The following Resolutions had been approved. They related to academic matters including degree regulations, and had been drafted in the Senate Office, incorporating comments from the General Council:

RESOLUTION NO. 382-2 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 382 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN DENTAL SCIENCE

RESOLUTION NO. 507-4 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 507 - DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

RESOLUTION NO. 552-7 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 552 - GENERIC REGULATIONS FOR THE AWARD OF MASTERS DEGREES GAINED BY THE SUCCESSFUL COMPLETION OF TAUGHT POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES

RESOLUTION NO. 557-6 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 557 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF RESEARCH

RESOLUTION NO. 558-3 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 558 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE

RESOLUTION NO. 564-9 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 564 – CODE OF ASSESSMENT FOR UNDERGRADUATE AND TAUGHT POSTGRADUATE PROGRAMMES

RESOLUTION NO. 565-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 565 – FITNESS TO PRACTISE

RESOLUTION NO. 570-2 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 570 – APPEALS CODE

RESOLUTION NO. 582-2 – GENERIC REGULATIONS FOR THE AWARD OF DEGREES GAINED BY THE SUCCESSFUL COMPLETION OF UNDERGRADUATE PROGRAMMES

RESOLUTION NO. 583-1 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS

RESOLUTION NO. 583-2 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS

RESOLUTION NO. 583-3 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS

RESOLUTION NO. 585-1 – DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF DIVINITY

RESOLUTION NO. 586-1 – DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF DIVINITY (MINISTRY)

RESOLUTION NO. 597-2 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS (SOCIAL SCIENCES)

RESOLUTION NO. 603-2 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 603 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF DENTAL SURGERY

RESOLUTION 605-4 – AMENDMENT TO RESOLUTION 605 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF SCIENCE AND DEGREE OF MASTER IN SCIENCE

RESOLUTION NO. 606-2 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 606 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF VETERINARY MEDICINE & SURGERY

RESOLUTION NO. 607-1 – AMENDMENT TO RESOLUTION 607 - DEGREES OF BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN VETERINARY BIOSCIENCES AND MASTER IN SCIENCE IN VETERINARY BIOSCIENCES

RESOLUTION NO. 609-3 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 609 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF ARTS (SCOTTISH AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE) AND BACHELOR OF SCIENCE (SCOTTISH AGRICULTURAL COLLEGE)

RESOLUTION NO. 620-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 620 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE (DENTAL SCIENCE)

RESOLUTION NO. 628-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 628 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF NURSING

RESOLUTION NO. 637 – DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN MEDICAL SCIENCE (MEDICAL HUMANITIES)

RESOLUTION NO. 645 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF RESEARCH

CRT/2012/50. Reports of Court Committees

CRT/2012/50.1 Finance Committee

CRT/2012/50.1.1 Budget 2013/14 and four year forecast

Court had approved the 2013/14 Budget and four year financial forecasts, under item CRT/2012/47. *Strategic Plan Update/Key Performance Indicators and Budget 2013/14.*

CRT/2012/50.1.2 Building projects

Court noted Finance Committee's support of the refurbishment of laboratory space in the Gregory Building and of revised expenditure relating to the South Glasgow Hospital (Teaching & Learning Facility), reflecting a decision to develop a 4th floor of the building to accommodate the Stratified Medicine Innovation Centre.

CRT/2012/50.1.3 Joint Graduate School

Court noted Finance Committee's approval of the development of a Joint Graduate School with Nankai University, and noted that costings including contingencies had been examined thoroughly.

CRT/2012/50.1.4 Expenses Policy

Court noted Finance Committee's approval of revisions to the Expenses Policy.

CRT/2012/50.1.5 Financial reports

Court noted Finance Committee's receipt and noting of financial performance and debtors' reports, both at 30 April.

CRT/2012/50.2 Estates Committee

Court noted Estates Committee's approval of the capital plan, of a capital project relating to the South Glasgow Hospital (Teaching and Learning Facility), and of a number of Capital Expenditure applications, relating to Asset Maintenance - Provision of Data Centre Resilience in the sum of £705k; Refurbishment of Gregory Building Laboratories 306/308/209 in the sum of £1.05m; McCall Building Roof Replacement in the sum of £660k.

CRT/2012/50.3 Joint Meeting of Finance and Estates Committees

Court noted that the Finance and Estates Committees have recently held a joint meeting at which approval was given to the submission of a Heritage Lottery Fund bid, by Glasgow City Council, relating to the development of the Kelvin Hall. The initiative involves a partnership between the University of Glasgow and Glasgow Life to jointly develop the Kelvin Hall as a world-class centre for collections, research, teaching and public engagement. Court had been briefed on this business at its meeting on 10 April, and recalled that, if taken forward, the Kelvin Hall development would involve a substantial financial investment by the University, estimated at £11.4M. It was noted that this investment was dependent upon the commitment of other partners, and subject to satisfactory agreement of contractual terms with the City Council and Glasgow Life.

CRT/2012/50.4 Human Resources Committee

Court noted the report from the Human Resources Committee.

CRT/2012/50.5 Audit Committee

Court noted the report from the Audit Committee.

CRT/2012/50.6 Health, Safety and Wellbeing Committee

Court approved the broadcast of the Stress Management Policy and noted the report from the Health, Safety and Wellbeing Committee.

CRT/2012/51. Report from the Rector

In the absence of the Rector, there was no report.

CRT/2012/52. Communications from Meeting of Senate 6 June 2013

Communications from the meeting of Senate held on 6 June were noted by Court. Senate had discussed constitutional and governance matters relating to its operation; and academic governance and decision-making following the Restructuring. It had received briefings on,

and had approved, the E-Learning strategy, the draft Transnational Education Strategy and the new University complaints procedure; it had also received updates on the University budget, the Estates Strategy, management of teaching space, and on Outcome Agreements.

Court's attention was drawn in particular to the request for nominations for honorary degrees in 2014.

CRT/2012/53. Any Other Business

There was no other business.

CRT/2012/54. Date of Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Court will be held on Wednesday 9 October 2013 in the Senate Room