



University of Glasgow | Department of Central & East European Studies



crcees
Centre for Russian, Central and East European Studies



Eesti Instituut

International Student Symposium

Perspectives on Estonia: Present, Past and Future

*Department of Central and East European Studies,
University of Glasgow*

28-29 February 2008

Paper Title & Abstracts

The CRCEES is hosted at the University of Glasgow and is an inter-institutional Centre of Excellence funded under the Languages Based Area Studies initiative. For more information visit: <http://www.gla.ac.uk/crcees>



Arts & Humanities
Research Council



Scottish Funding Council
Promoting further and higher education

HIGHER EDUCATION
FUNDING COUNCIL



Agnes Aljas

University of Tartu, Institute of Journalism and Communication

Cultural changes in Transitional Society. Change in Estonian work culture based on the example of the office workers at one company.

Everyday life for people is strongly tied to the ambient political, economic, social and cultural situation. The systematic changes of social and economic environment in Estonia, which occurred in the 1990s, as well as the following developments influenced everyone's daily and also working life, which constituted an integral part of the former.

Working lives and working take up the greater part of the day, week and year for most of the working-age population. Working life has a central role in social life. Work is not just a way of earning a living but also a shaper of social status, consumer preferences, health and family life.

The working lives of Estonian people have already for years been shaped by conventions prevalent elsewhere in the world. The world's economy became truly global and open in the last decades of the 20th century in connection with the development of infrastructure and communications technology.

The context of the global economy arrived in Estonia immediately at the beginning of the 1990s. The precise extent of its impact has also depended on the orientation of jobs and companies. In my presentation, I look at what role the global economy plays in Estonian companies owned by foreign capital, as illustrated by Saku Brewery.

In my presentation, I focus on the changes in the plant taking place on the macro level, examining at the impact they had on the working world of office workers: from one aspect, the changes associated with transformation from a state enterprise to a privately held company and belonging to an international corporate group, and from another aspect, the impact of internal changes within the group – the effect of management from the "Baltic group" and Lithuania.

The presentation is based on materials from a master's thesis defended in 2006 at the University of Turku, Finland, in the field of ethnology, which dealt with changes in Estonian work culture and adaptation to changes as viewed from the perspective of administrative staff. Sources for the master's thesis and presentation comprised interviews conducted in the course of field work.

Craig Allardice

University of Glasgow

Estonian tourism in the post-independence era: Does the Soviet past have a place in the market?

This presentation is centred around research conducted to complete my undergraduate dissertation over the last two years.

Estonia's accession to the European Union (EU) in May 2004 can be seen as symbolic of the 'success' of its ideological and geopolitical transformation in the post-Soviet era. In a sense, the transition from illegal Soviet annexation to restoration of 'Western' and/or 'European' participation is complete in the 'political memory' of many Estonians, and in the inclusive mindset of the present Western political consensus. The challenge that now faces Estonia - in common with the nine other former Communist states in the current phases of EU expansion - is the imperatives of economic development in a competitive environment. While the EU may have

been 'sold' to Estonia and Estonians on the merits of the protection it can afford a prospective member state, there is little doubt that the opportunities the EU presents come with the inherent risks of entering a new and competitive marketplace. In addition, recent events have clearly demonstrated that Estonian nationalism and identity are undergoing a continuing process of change in a debate, which is far from settled (if one could conceivably argue that such debates are ever truly settled, take 'Britishness' for example). Nevertheless, the Estonian context is in an evolutionary process which is producing more dramatic junctures and schisms compared to fellow recent EU accession members.

With this in mind, this study will focus on the tourism industry, as an area both of potential growth and Union-wide - indeed, global - competition. This sector of the economy has the advantage (in terms of academic analysis) of revealing issues of identity and nationalism, which may not necessarily be as obvious in other economic fields. This study aims to analyse how Estonia views itself in terms of marketing its Soviet past. In other words, to what degree does Estonia harness its Soviet history and legacy as a consumer product? Indeed, do Estonians - particularly those whose role it is to market the country and its culture to the wider world - even view the Soviet past in such black and white economic terms?

We will examine case studies of Estonian tourist attractions. By looking at particular instances, such as Paldiski (former Soviet navy and nuclear submarine base), Narva (predominantly Russian-speaking town on border crossing with Russian Federation), and Sillamäe (a former 'closed town' in Soviet times) resurrected recently as a kind of model Stalinist village, we will be able to assess the ways in which the Soviet past is being marketed - indeed if it is at all - and the problems faced by those trying to market their place as either 'modern' or 'historically Soviet'. In contrast, we will also look at attractions which react to the past, such as the *Museum of Occupations* in Tallinn. The study will examine closely how the 'spirit' or 'identity' of these areas of (potential?) tourism development is portrayed in marketing media. Furthermore, we will investigate the extent to which any centralised, co-ordinated marketing attempts to reconcile the conflicting identities of these developments.

The final area of exploration will attempt to present a vision of future tourism marketing policy. This section will attempt to establish whether the conflicting identities of tourist attractions in Estonia can be reconciled to provide a more comprehensive offer for the international consumer. Can Estonian national identity develop to a point where financial and economic gain can be made from the commoditisation of the Soviet past?

Iain Atkinson

University of Glasgow

Comparing and contrasting the cultural and social development of the Russian-speaking minority in Estonia with that of ethnic Estonians in the post-Soviet period.

This presentation seeks to establish whether or not the cultural and social development of the Russian-speaking minority in Estonia in the post-Soviet period has been markedly disadvantaged *vis-à-vis* that of ethnic Estonians. This will be done via particular reference to the citizenship status of Russian-speaking non-Estonians and a study of the language environment of post-Soviet Estonia. Moreover, this presentation will examine both the legacy of Estonia as an SSR and the EU accession

process as they have been instrumental in determining the position of the Estonian authorities towards Estonia's Russian-speaking minority in the post-Soviet period.

This presentation first examines the creation of a Russian-speaking minority in Estonia: how it was created and what its consequences were for Estonia in the immediate post-Soviet period. This section will focus chiefly on the resettlement patterns of Soviet citizens in Estonia and why, with the advent of independence, such a gulf existed between ethnic Estonians and Russian-speaking non-Estonians.

This presentation will then move on to discuss the approach of the Estonian authorities to the integration of Estonia's Russian-speaking minority into post-Soviet Estonian culture and society. At this point it will become clear how pervasive the legacy of Soviet occupation remains to be in post-Soviet Estonia and how this has had bearing on the Estonian authorities' attempts to integrate Russian-speaking non-Estonians into post-Soviet culture and society in the period prior to the EU accession process. The consequences of Estonia's journey from an SSR to an EU member state for Estonia's Citizenship, and Language Laws will also be discussed.

Ben Hiscox

University of Glasgow

How did the Russian and British media differ in their reaction to the "Bronze Soldier Crisis" of spring 2007?

Since the collapse of the USSR there has been a great deal of conflict between Estonia and the Russian Federation, over issues as diverse as Estonia's treatment of its large Russian minority and its membership of "Western" organisations, such as NATO and the EU. Perhaps the most spectacular incidence of this occurred in the April and May of last year, when the relocation of the so-called "Bronze Soldier" war memorial in central Tallinn sparked a diplomatic row that made Estonia front-page news throughout Europe. During and after the events of "Bronze Night" the two rival sides took very different views of the causes of the trouble, and of the deeper meaning of the statue itself, highlighting a clash between different ideologies and perspectives of the past. In this talk, I shall look at how the Russian and British media reacted to these events, to see how they were perceived outside Estonia. To do this I have looked at the English language archives of various Russian media outlets, most notably the news agency ITAR-TASS (the Information Telegraph Agency of Russia), the newspaper *Pravda* and *The Current Digest of the Post-Soviet Press*. I have compared the way these media presented the events in Tallinn and beyond with what was reported in the English language media, including the BBC, a number of British newspapers as well as the English language press in Estonia itself, most notably *The Baltic Times*. I believe that by looking at how the media of different countries presented the issues in a different way it will be possible to acquire a better understanding of the confrontation that occurred in the spring of 2007.

Tobias Hoch

University of Helsinki, Department of Finno-Ugrian Studies

Copterline's helicopter crash – media war in Finnish & Estonian press?

Fourteen passengers and crew died 10.8.2005, when a helicopter of the commercial operator *Copterline* crashed into the sea on a scheduled flight bound to Helsinki four

minutes after take off from Tallinn. Among the passengers were eight Finns including the crewmembers, four Estonians and two U.S. citizens.

Within two hours of the accident the Estonian government decided to accept help offered by Finnish authorities. Finland deployed a group of divers and her coast guard vessel *Merikarhu*. Divers searched the scene, located the wreck and found that passengers and crew in the hull of the helicopter on the sea bed, in 45 metres of water. The Finns started leading the entire rescue operation, co-operating with their Estonian counter parts. Their first aim was to recover the bodies from the wreck, which took several days and turned out to be much more difficult than anticipated. At some stage the body of the perished pilot got lost and it took a week to finally recover his body. The rescue teams' work was front-page news in the Finnish and Estonian media for many days. Criticism towards the work of the rescue teams and authorities was one of the main subjects dealt with by the media. Why were the Finns in charge of a rescue operation in Estonia? Were Estonians ready to handle a rescue operation of this size by themselves? Were Finns arrogant and Estonians undereducated? Could Estonia have managed the rescue operation better without foreign help?

In my work I analyze how criticism against the rescue team's work and the authorities of both countries was reflected in newspaper articles. I analyze articles during the period 11. –18.8.2005 published by the Estonian newspapers Postimees, Õhtuleht and the Finnish newspapers Helsingin Sanomat, Turun Sanomat, Iltalehti and Iltasanomat. In my analysis I draw special attention to the means of influencing readers by using wording and attitudes towards the other country. I try to find out how objective the articles are towards the authorities, the rescuers and other involved parties.

Uku Lember

Central European University, Budapest

Domesticating the Soviet Regime: Autobiographic Experiences of the “Post-war” Generation in Estonia.

The presentation is based on the author's MA thesis in which he studied the autobiographical accounts of the Estonian “post-war” / ”thaw” generation (born in 1940-1959). Reading of the fifty published or archived life stories of “ordinary” Estonians, collected by the Estonian Literary Museum and Estonian National Museum, was focused on possible tensions between the simultaneous domestication of and resistance to the Soviet regime. It is a research of a generation, without assuming the presence of any “common generational experience.” Empiric grounds are found in “random selection” – the first fifty life stories of local Estonian population that dealt with ideological dilemmas were included (however, deportation, emigration and non-native stories were excluded). Epistemologically, it was assumed that an overwhelming majority of the life stories of “ordinary people” are normally written with a sincere subjective truth-orientation.

The author argues that, based on the autobiographies written in the 1990s, the paradigms of “everyday resistance” and “double-mindedness,” which have been employed by scholars formerly, do not reflect well the life experience of people living during the Khrushchev and Brezhnev era. Indeed, autobiographies contain much more the “domestication” of the regime than any conscious “resistance” to it. Traces of the “domestication” can be followed, both, in the ways how people write about their Soviet experience and in the unexpectedly high level of cultural trauma that many autobiographers had suffered in the course of the 1990s. Nevertheless, it was also

found that the attitude of the “ordinary” people towards the Communist regime and their personal ideological choices varied greatly and there seems to be no meaningful way for establishing a neither a causal generational “mentality pattern” nor a class- or education-based patterns about the ideological choices of the “post-war” generation.

Raili Nugin

University of Tallinn

Success – a term for individual or society

Success is a socially constructed and constantly reconstructed term with lots of cultural connotations in social sciences, media and individual interpretation. Its emergence and the frequency of its use depends on various social indicators. One could expect that during the time of rapid transitions in societies the term ‘success’ emerges very strongly into discourse. During the change the social mobility (both upwards and downwards) is high, economic capital is usually redistributed and that leads to temptation of labelling the losers and winners. Another social process influencing the emergence of the word ‘success’ into discussion circles is individualisation. The increase of personal responsibility leads easily to comparison as to ‘who has really made it’ and while ‘making it,’ who really succeeded more than others?

No doubt, there can be and are other factors influencing the usage of the term success, but in my view, these are the most important processes that have brought ‘success’ as a term strongly into the term map of the post-communist transitional countries like Estonia. Both societies have recently faced rapid social transitions as well as processes of individualisation (Vogt: 2005). However, the monopol of conceptualising ‘success’ is mostly in the hands of social scientists when they try to determine social groups who are ‘successful.’ In this paper I focus on how those considered successful define success and how is this compatible with sociological literature. Here, a specific age group is under scope – those who were on the threshold of their adult lives after the fall of communism. According to statistical data, the social mobility of this age group has been relatively high and they can also be considered successful in material terms. Conducting in-depth qualitative interviews with 10 (“successful”) middle-class members of this age group I asked whether they considered themselves successful and how did they conceptualize success. According to the data, there is a clear tendency to perceive success broader than just by the position on social ladder or material wealth. These criteria are not altogether absent from their definition of success, but many of them point out the material and career based success-definition as a social definition and detach their personal definition from it.

David Preece

University of Glasgow

Estonian reactions to Human Rights violations in Mari El

The fall of the Soviet Union led to a more favourable climate for the Finno-Ugric minority of the Republic of Mari El to expand the sphere of their cultural activity. In

education, literature, media and politics, the Mari were able to act more freely than under communism.

However, this period of relative cultural freedom was short lived, and by the end of the 1990's the Mari were facing a backlash. The year 2001 saw the killing of several Mari journalists, as Leonid Markelov's government attempted to drive Mari language and culture out of public life.

Following Markelov's re-election in 2005, another spate of attacks on journalists and cultural leaders was carried out, with the government failing to investigate the attacks properly, and many more key figures among the Mari feared for their safety. A government witch-hunt led to many opposition supporters losing their jobs, the Mari language remained under threat, and the Mari nation was in a precarious situation.

Among foreign nations, these events were paid most attention by the Finno-Ugric nations outside of Russia: Estonia, Finland and Hungary. The activities of these nations play a key role in the support of the Mari culture, through cultural initiatives and exchanges, political activism, and diplomatic efforts to bring the plight of the Mari to the attention of Europe and the world.

In my presentation, I will outline my plan and some early findings for my MSc dissertation, and explore how Estonian society has reacted to the events in Mari El, with a look at political and cultural responses and initiatives, and at coverage in the media.

Ada-Charlotte Regelmann

University of Glasgow

Integration as Social Interaction Process – The Case of Estonian- and Russian-speakers in Estonia

The approach to the phenomena, which I apply in my PhD, is rooted in a structure-agency perspective and addresses social integration in relation to nation-building processes in Estonia. Focus is laid on the main ethno-linguistically different groups of Estonian- and Russian-speakers. I understand integration as resulting from social interaction between members of several groups, such as an ethno-linguistic minority and the majority in society. It has been suggested that there are three major patterns of integration in an interethnic setting, mutual integration, assimilation, and accommodation within a common framework. Three dimensions can be distinguished along which these integration processes take place, including legal-political, socio-economic, and cultural-linguistic processes. Social integration, however, reflects mainly cultural, psychological and social aspects of community life. Surely, structural constraints on socially embedded strategies of adaptation largely define the outcomes of social integration, pointing out that the connection between these two levels requires particular attention. In my research I address the conditions in which the minority community finds itself in the given society, such as integration policies, socio-economic conditions, and work and residence patterns. Furthermore, I analyse the sorts of social capital facilitating social integration, concentrating on individual resources of members of the minority group, such as familiarity with the majority's culture, language, or priority system. Also, I examine minority strategies to advance their interests in the larger society.

In the poster I would like to address this general framework of my research and ask, how societal structures influence agency preferences, which, in the context of status change, result in value transformation that once again impact societal institutions. The

poster, then, aims at providing a framework for discussing perspectives of an ethnolinguistically integrated Estonia.

Andrei Shirjajev

University of Tallinn

Perspectives of Russian Autonomous Project in Contemporary Estonia

The status of linguistic Russians in former Republic of the USSR had been never defined. In process of the Soviet Union collapse none a "quadratic nexus" side was vitally interested in question settlement:

- linguistic Russians have no resources and political experience;
- titular majorities use their "threatening presence" for own ethnic identity strengthening;
- Russia was caught in internal struggle for power;
- Western moderators were anxious only about "ethnic peace and stability".

Integration into "Euro-Atlantic" cultural space presupposed adaptation of Western standards in minorities' issue: granting to subordinated groups official minorities' status in conjunction with a certain level of autonomy. But in Estonia the active discussion was dropped around 1993. Both projects of Russian autonomy: territorial and cultural were rejected and ethnic control regime was fortified instead (With the new Law on Citizenship of 1995 it reached own apogee). Though the needs of EU accession generated society Integration program in 1997 it was assimilatory in essence.

Logically against "Estonian assimilatory" project should be logically set off "Russian autonomous" project. And it did. In 2006 a group affiliated with Russian party of Estonia galvanised the project of Russian Cultural Autonomy. But levels of promotion activity and public and governmental support predict the fail as in 1989, 1993, 1996 and 1999.

This presentation analyses factors working *pro and contra* of autonomy project emergence. Special accent is made on experience of Hungarians in neighbouring Hungary states. Their status bears a strong resemblance to status of Russians in former USSR republics. In this context Hungarian "Minorities' Act" and Status Law, practice of bilateral agreements with neighbours are analysed as samples to follow. Differences between Russians and Hungarians working against autonomy are also analysed.

Tina Tamman

University of Glasgow

A full circle: Ambassador August Torma (1895-1971)

August Torma (called Schmidt at the time) was one of the men who helped to build the first Republic of Estonia. He arranged for loyal Estonian soldiers to be sent back from northern Russia in 1919 during the War of Independence when they were badly needed at home. He became one of the first Estonian military attaches whose job in Kaunas was to promote the idea of independent Estonia and to collect intelligence. The country was as yet unrecognised internationally and therefore vulnerable. In the

early 1920s he assumed a diplomatic role and rose quickly through the ranks to postings in Rome, Geneva and London.

He was in London in 1940 when the Soviets overran Estonia. Torma lost his job, his income, his homeland. He had been at the birth of his country and now he saw its demise.

Being a very private man, he did not keep a diary and we know little about his thoughts and feelings. We can only wonder whether he sometimes felt that events were repeating themselves. The collapse of Tsarist Russia had in the 1920s brought messy problems of assets, citizenship and spying to his desk at the Estonian Foreign Ministry; World War II and Soviet occupation involved him in similar concerns in London.

Torma died in London in 1971, twenty years before Estonia regained its independence, over thirty years before it joined the European Union. Torma had been the Estonian representative at the League of Nations, full of hope in the 1930s that it would guarantee peace for his country, while required to handle questions ranging from Abyssinia to prostitution. Today's Estonia relies on the EU and NATO in a similar vein. Are there perhaps lessons to be learnt from Torma's lifetime?

Berk Vaher

University of Tartu

How to Write 21st Century? Residual and Emergent Estonian Literatures in the Multimedia Age

According to Raymond Williams, the dominant values of any given culture are complemented by "residual" and "emergent" features, the former being extant from a previous social formation and the latter consisting in "new practices, new significances and experiences". Williams goes on to point that literature is largely perceived as "residual" rather than "emergent".

In recent Estonian literature, there is a controversy between the avid media coverage of the newcomers of the late 1990s and the current debates over the lack of broader public knowledge of the newer literature. Could it be that by presenting themselves as "new", the young authors made the statement that the bulk of the readers rejects in literature, preferring it to hold "residual" values amidst tumultuous social and economic changes?

Indeed, reverting to the "residual" has been helpful to many a fresh literary career, not only in more traditional fiction/poetry but also in the definitely "emergent" hip hop culture, some representatives of which have made claims on "poetic" credibility by performing in the vintage poetry reading mode. Yet there remains the quandary of writing pertinently about the "emergent" technological and epistemological experiences. Whereas "residual" writing succeeds in relating to the past or to the anachronistic fantasy worlds, the present remains open to innovative literary approaches. A few populist ventures have all but failed to make a lasting impression, while the more austere avant garde is by and large perceived to be "beyond literature". As the late 1990s generation of writers increasingly shifts their activities into the boundary areas with other disciplines (music, film, performance art), one wonders whether there can be any properly "emergent" kind of "pure" literature at all. The youth literary magazine "Värske Rõhk", ushering in an even younger generation of writers, is as yet reinforcing the question rather than presenting a solid response.

Katre Väli

University of Tartu

Oral Presentations of Poetry Reflecting Changes in Estonian Society.

I would like to introduce a marginal genre, the inquiry into the field of poetry theatre. Most interesting notions in the transformational process of the static, complex, written poetic text into the dynamic, dialogical, oral drama text are voice, oral expression, the change of meanings, and the creation of roles. The actor may either concentrate on the poet's biography or try to find the essence from the text itself or from the period of its appearance.

The field of poetry theatre is rather unresearched, there are few theoretical texts. I have focused on the traditions of the presentation of written texts, how one communicates with the audiences during various historical eras. Nowadays poets have become more and more actors, they present their texts themselves. Therefore poetry slams, literature festivals etc are abundant.

In my paper I try to explain why poetry theatre has been popular during certain periods, how do the styles of performing poetry on the stage vary and how is it connected to general political, social, cultural changes in the society. For example in Estonia during the years 1920-1940 poets mostly concentrated among small closed groups; during the Soviet occupation the poetry theatre was a way of national rebellion, performances combined texts from many poets and the stress was on the hidden message of freedom. As a counterforce declamation of soviet poems was demanded by the leaders, all sorts of competitions took place. Nowadays poetry theatre is mainly about the life of poets, the person behind the texts, his/ her captivating and tragic life story. Poetry is a very intimate genre, thus the question of stereotypic depiction of poets emerges.

The study of oral presentation of poetry combines theatre semiotics, drama theory, performance analysis, folcloristics and other fields.