UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

Court

Minute of Meeting held on Wednesday 12 December 2007
in The Senate Room

Present:
Mr Norman Berry General Council Assessor, Dr Olwyn Byron Senate Assessor, Professor John Briggs Senate Assessor, Professor Andrew Christie Co-opted Member, Mr Peter Daniels Co-opted Member, Ms Barbara Duffner Co-opted Member, Dr Robin Easton Co-opted Member, Professor Mike French Senate Assessor, Dr Martin Macauley Senate Assessor, Mr Alan Macfarlane General Council Assessor, Mr Jim Mackechnie Glasgow City Council Assessor, Dr Laura Martin Senate Assessor, Ms Mhairi Wilson SRC President, Mr David Ross General Council Assessor, Mr Alex Ross Employee Representative, Sir Muir Russell Principal, Professor Michael Scott-Morton Co-opted Member, Professor Mona Siddiqui Senate Assessor, Mr Kevin Sweeney General Council Assessor, Mrs Joy Travers Chancellor's Assessor (Convener), Ms Jennifer Wightwick, SRC Assessor

In attendance:
Professor Steve Beaumont (Vice-Principal Research & Enterprise), Mr Ian Black (Director of Human Resources), Mr Steve Egan (HEFCE), Mr Robert Fraser (Director of Finance), Miss Jan Hulme (Academic Secretary) (from item 4.2), Mr Jim McConnell (Director of Estates and Buildings), Ms Deborah Maddern (Administrative Officer), Professor Andrew Nash (Clerk of Senate), Mr David Newall (Secretary of Court), Mr Tom O’Connell (chair of Audit Committee) (to item 4.2), Ms Susan Stewart (Director of Corporate Communications)

Apologies:
Members: Professor Keith Millar Senate Assessor, Mr Mordechai Vanunu Rector
Attenders: Professor John Coggins (Vice-Principal Life Sciences & Medicine), Professor Neal Juster (Vice-Principal Strategy & Resources), Professor Andrea Nolan (Vice-Principal Learning & Teaching)

CRT/2007/11. Announcements

Court welcomed Ms Jennifer Wightwick, the new SRC Assessor, and Dr Olwyn Byron, a new Senate Assessor, to their first meeting as members of Court. Court also welcomed Mr Tom O’Connell, chair of the Audit Committee, who was attending to speak to item 4.2 on the Audit Committee, and Mr Steve Egan from HEFCE, who was attending as an observer.

CRT/2007/12. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 10 October 2007

The minutes were approved.
CRT/2007/13. Matters Arising
There were no Matters Arising.


CRT/2007/14.1 Scottish Government’s Spending Review
Court heard that the results of the Scottish Government's Spending Review announcement had contained unwelcome news for the universities, which had made an ambitious proposal for funding, involving a real increase in resources of £168M over the coming three years. In response, the Government's announcement had promised just £27M. The Cabinet Secretary had subsequently made clear that the Government recognised the contribution universities made to the country's economic wellbeing and had indicated that Higher Education would be afforded priority should further funds become available. The exact impact on the University's finances would be known in March 2008, when the Funding Council announced the distribution of grant funds for 2008/09 among institutions.

CRT/2007/14.2 Research Assessment Exercise
Court heard that the University had made its submission to the Research Assessment Exercise (RAE) at the end of November and that the submission was the outcome of many months of careful work in reviewing the University's research performance and deciding how best to reflect it in the return to the Funding Councils. The outcomes of the exercise, due in the latter part of 2008, would have an important impact on the University's reputation and on its funding. Court echoed the Principal’s thanks to Professor Beaumont and to many other university colleagues who had contributed to this important exercise.

Court heard that the results of the RAE would be available in about a year’s time. It noted that at this stage it was not possible to predict progression against other institutions or the impact on the University’s funding.

CRT/2007/14.3 International Student Recruitment
Court was advised that the Senior Management Group had reviewed the University's performance in the current year in recruiting overseas students, which had been below target. The present figures were not the final ones and would improve in the coming months as a result of second semester registrations, but there would nevertheless be an adverse impact on financial performance in 2007/08. The overall trend was that numbers had risen in recent years, but had now flattened out. Work was ongoing to review the international recruitment strategy in light of this. Court noted that measures had been taken to improve response times to applicants.

CRT/2007/14.4 Investing in Excellence
Court noted that the Director of the Development & Alumni Office, Cathy Bell, was scheduled to provide a briefing to the February meeting of Court on Investing in Excellence, which was the title of the University's development campaign.
CRT/2007/14.5 THES World Rankings

Court heard that the Times Higher Education Supplement had published its world rankings in early November, showing that after a rise in rankings in each of the last three years, Glasgow’s position was now static, at 83 in the world, compared with 81 in 2006. Some other UK universities had improved their positions this year, and five Scottish universities now featured in the top 200.

CRT/2007/14.6 Universitas 21 Global

Court was reminded that as a member of the Universitas 21 Network, the University held equity shares in U21 Equity Ltd and that U21 Equity itself held 50% of the shares in U21 Global Pte. Limited, the online postgraduate course provider based in Singapore. The remaining 50% of the equity was held by Thomson Learning Inc., a division of the Thomson Corporation.

Court was updated on recent share ownership changes relating to Universitas 21 Global, which were that following the Thomson Group’s disposal earlier in the year of Thomson Learning, now re-named Cengage, notice had been given to U21 Equity by Cengage that it wished to dispose of its 50% shareholding in U21 Global. After discussions with a number of groups, the boards of U21 Global Pte Limited and U21 Equity Ltd had approved a proposal from Manipal Universal Learning International (MULI) to purchase Cengage's 50% equity shareholding.

Court was reminded that the University had previously decided to make no further investment in U21 Global, and that the shareholding in U21 Equity had been fully provided in the University’s accounts. The share ownership changes did not call into question that approach. Court noted that it would be kept updated on any further developments.

CRT/2007/14.7 Lord Kelvin Centenary

Court noted that the Principal and senior colleagues would shortly be participating in commemorative events to mark the centenary of the death of Lord Kelvin.

CRT/2007/15. Reports of Court Committees

CRT/2007/15.1 Finance Committee

CRT/2007/15.1.1 University Financial Statements as at 31 July 2007

The Director of Finance, Robert Fraser, gave a presentation on the University’s financial statements at 31 July 2007. Court noted the continued strengthening of the University’s financial performance, with a second consecutive operating surplus. Net assets had increased in the year with a growth in the Fixed Asset and endowment base as well as cash funds available. This growth had been partially offset by a reduction in working capital due to an increase in income in advance, accruals and trade creditors. The FRS 17 pension liability had increased primarily due to a change in mortality assumptions consistent with the formal valuation. The trend in the general reserve was upwards. Although margins were less than 2% of the total income, Court agreed that 2006/2007 had been an encouraging year.
Court thanked Mr Fraser and expressed appreciation for the high standard of information which he and his team had provided throughout the year.

Court approved the University Financial Statements as at 31 July 2007.

**CRT/2007/15.1.2 Universities Subsidiaries Financial Statements as at 31 July 2007**

Court noted that the Finance Committee had reviewed the financial statements of the University’s subsidiary companies and had agreed to recommend the statements to Court. Following the practice adopted last year, Court approved the financial statements of the subsidiary companies on the understanding that these had been considered in detail by the Finance Committee. Court also noted that the papers were available for inspection in the Court Office.

**CRT/2007/15.1.3 Credit Facilities Approval**

Court agreed the Finance Committee’s recommendation to continue the terms and conditions of the University’s credit facility with the Clydesdale Bank.

**CRT/2007/15.1.4 University Pension Scheme**

Court noted that Finance Committee had discussed the implications of a recent revaluation of the University of Glasgow Pension Scheme. Court approved the Finance Committee's recommendation to commit to an annual employer's payment of £5.8M per annum for 13 years, on the understanding that the University would endeavour to make additional payments to the scheme where possible.

**CRT/2007/15.1.4 Universitas 21 Global Accounts**

Court requested that the accounts of Universitas 21 Global be provided annually to the Finance Committee.

R Fraser

**CRT/2007/15.2 Audit Committee**

Mr Tom O’Connell, convener of the Audit Committee, attended to brief Court on the annual report of the Audit Committee.

Court noted that the external auditors had issued an unqualified report on the 2006/2007 financial statements including those of the subsidiary companies.

Court heard that the focus of the internal auditors in their first full year of appointment had been on corporate University systems. There were a number of key areas where there was scope for efficiencies through improvement and standardisation of processes. This was a challenge for the University management and the Audit Committee would be seeking reassurances that matters were being addressed. Court agreed on the importance of dialogue between Faculties and central services about what their respective needs and requirements were, in order to streamline processes.

Court noted that the internal audit plan for 2007/2008 had been approved. Court also noted that the Audit Committee considered risk management to be a core business process across all Faculties. Court further noted that the Audit Committee had looked at the adequacy and effectiveness of internal control and
had concluded that in general this was adequate, with some room for improvement.

Court agreed to consider the composition of the Audit Committee upon Mr O’Connell’s retirement as chair of the Committee in a year’s time, from the point of view of possibly having a Court member as chair.

Court requested that the internal auditors be invited to the April 2008 meeting to provide further detail on their work.

D Newall

Court thanked Mr O’Connell for his briefing and the Audit Committee for its work in the last year.

CRT/2007/15.3 Human Resources Committee

CRT/2007/15.3.1 Performance & Development Review (P&DR) Audit Report

Court noted that the Human Resources Committee had endorsed the recommendation of a recent Internal Audit report that Performance & Development Review (P&DR) should be implemented effectively throughout the University. Mr Newall confirmed that allowing for permitted local variations, for example in respect of timing of the Reviews, all areas of the University were required to undertake P&DR and that he and the Deans were required to report on progress to the Senior Management Group. Mr Black added that the Reviews would assist the promotions and the Recognition and Reward processes.

CRT/2007/15.3.2 Maternity Policy Amendment

Court noted that a proposal had been made to the Human Resources Committee regarding salary payments for ‘Keeping in touch days’ within the maternity policy. While it had been intended not to pay any member of staff more than a full time salary when on maternity leave, this had not been reflected in the policy. Consultation had begun with the trade unions on a proposed amendment. Court noted that the Human Resources Committee had approved the proposed change.

CRT/2007/15.4 Estates Committee

CRT/2007/15.4.1 Estates Development Process Review

Court noted the review currently being undertaken with regard to Estates Development. A presentation had been given to the Estates Committee, which had included an update on key projects and on procurement matters, and had provided some recommendations about areas including client meetings and post-construction matters.

CRT/2007/15.4.2 Library Building Envelope Cladding

Court noted that further improvements to the Library Building cladding envelope would be at significant cost and that operation of the building would be disrupted. Details would be considered by a future meeting of the Estates Committee.
**CRT/2007/15.4.3 MRI Facility at Gilmorehill**

Court noted that the Estates Committee had been briefed on a proposal for a new MRI Scanning Suite within the BHF/Glasgow Cardiovascular Research Centre building. The proposal would be examined through the recently established Capex process.

**CRT/2007/15.5 Health, Safety & Environment Committee**

**CRT/2007/16.5.1 Training in the Use of Evacuation Chairs**

Court noted that Safety & Environmental Protection Service were leading an initiative to ensure effective provision of, and training in the use of, evacuation chairs for use in emergencies.

**CRT/2007/16.5.2 Waste Recycling**

Court noted that mandatory recycling of paper had been introduced for all University departments.

**CRT/2007/16.5.3 HSE Committee Meetings**

Court noted that a review of the Committee in light of Court Standing Orders was under way and possible outcomes included a review of membership and of frequency of meetings.

**CRT/2007/15.6 Remuneration Committee**

Court received a tabled paper from the Remuneration Committee. Court heard that the Committee had to date been unable to conclude its review of Senior Management Group salaries. It had intended to complete this work in time to report to Court, but a delay in receiving the necessary information had led to the postponement, until 18 December, of a meeting originally scheduled for 23 November. As a result, Remuneration Committee wished, with Court's approval, to determine adjustments to the salaries of senior managers at its meeting on 18 December, on the understanding that the cost of the salary adjustments would be held within the budgeted sum and that the relevant members of staff would then be advised directly of the outcome. The Committee also wished to revisit the timetable for the senior management salary review with a view to ensuring that in 2008 the process was completed earlier in the year.

Court approved the requested approach.

**CRT/2007/16. Report from the Secretary of Court**

**CRT/2007/16.1 Scottish Council for Research in Education Centre (SCRE)**

Court had been asked to approve the Secretary of Court establishing a Redundancy Committee and Structural Change Committee to manage a redundancy consultation process for the Scottish Council for Research in Education (SCRE) Centre, the Senior Management Group having previously received and noted details of a serious and deteriorating financial position.

Following discussion Court agreed that the outcome of further consultation with the SCRE Centre and the Faculty of Education would be awaited prior to any
decision on the establishment of committees required under the management of organisational change policies. The Secretary of Court should report on the outcome of the consultation process to the February 2008 meeting.

D Newall

**CRT/2007/16.2 Higher Education Academy Subject Centre**

Court approved the Secretary of Court establishing a Redundancy Committee and Structural Change Committee to look at matters relating to the Higher Education Academy-funded Subject Centre for History, Archaeology and Classics, where there was one possible redundant post. The issues being considered arose from the withdrawal of funding for the post from the Higher Education Academy.

Court noted that the Structural Change Committee would act locally on behalf of the Redundancy Committee. The Redundancy Committee would consider the Structural Change Committee’s recommendations. It would be the responsibility of the Redundancy Committee to make recommendations to Court on a post that might be made redundant. In this case, the Structural Change Committee would comprise Professor Elizabeth Moignard (Dean), Dr Sonja Cameron, Manager of the Subject Centre for History, Archaeology and Classics (Head of Department) and the territorial Human Resources Manager, Christine Barr. The Redundancy Committee would comprise a Chairperson (normally a Vice-Principal), two lay members of Court, the Director of Human Resources or nominee, two members of Academic or Related staff, one of whom would be a Senate Assessor, and two members of support staff.

**CRT/2007/16.3 School of Modern Languages & Cultures (SMLC)**

Court was reminded that it had received a report on the School, and more particularly on the German Section, in June. Court was provided with an update, including information on the financial background to the Section and on staff issues, both of which remained difficult.

Court noted and recognised the achievements made in-year with regard to student recruitment and retention, and indicated its appreciation that this would not have been an easy achievement in the context of trends in Modern Languages study. Court welcomed the recent RAE submission, noting the hard work behind it and wishing the Section well with the result, given Court’s support for German to continue successfully at the University.

Court also noted the ongoing financial challenges facing the Section and requested that it continue to take every step to reduce costs, including considering the possibility of reducing staff levels. Were this not achievable through voluntary means, which Court hoped would be possible, Court agreed that it would approve compulsory measures, if necessary, as it had done in other parts of the University.

Court agreed that it would give its full support to the Dean of the Faculty of Arts to address the financial difficulties and to review the Section’s curriculum. It was noted that Professor Briggs and Mr Newall were scheduled to meet with members of the Section again before Christmas and would continue to meet on a monthly basis with the Dean and Head of Section to review the Section’s performance.

Mr Newall agreed to provide a further update to Court at its next meeting.

D Newall
CRT/2007/16.4 Dormant Endowments

Court was advised that endowments became 'dormant' when it was no longer possible to comply with the terms in which they were made out to the University. Court learned that approximately £4M of the University's endowment assets were in this category and could not currently be put to any use other than that of gathering interest. In light of these circumstances, Court approved the following draft Ordinance.

Whereas the University Court of the University of Glasgow deems it expedient to make provision for the use of the revenue of endowments provided for prizes or for particular purposes, where in either case these purposes are now wholly or partially inoperative:

Therefore the Court in exercise of its powers under Section 3 and Paragraph 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 2 to the Universities (Scotland) Act 1966 hereby statutes and ordains:

1. Where in any academic year the revenue of endowments provided for prizes or other particular purposes either cannot be used for the original purpose or exceeds the amount reasonably acquired for that purpose, it shall be in the power of the Court to determine as to the disposal thereof.

2. Where such an endowment is in the gift of a patron, the Court shall give notice to the patron who may, within such time as the Court shall fix, determine the disposal of such surplus revenue; failing which, the Court may determine the disposal of such revenue until the commencement of the next academic year, when the patron's rights shall revive.

Mr Newall agreed to take forward the formal process of consultation and notice periods with regard to the draft Ordinance, prior to a final version being sent for Privy Council consideration.

D Newall

CRT/2007/16.5 Scottish Funding Council Strategic Dialogue Meeting

Court noted that members and officials of the Scottish Funding Council had visited the University in November as part of the Council's programme of strategic dialogue with universities and colleges. They had met with the Chair of Court, two other lay members and representatives from the Senior Management Group. The topics covered had been: Governance, University Strategy, Employability and Research. There had also been a session at which student representatives talked to the Council members about their experiences at the University. The event had been an opportunity for University managers to brief SFC on how the University was run and what it was trying to achieve. Informal feedback had been positive and the Funding Council’s report on the event would be shared with Court members.

CRT/2007/16.6 General Council Nominations

Court was reminded of an earlier discussion on revising the nominations process for General Council Assessors on Court. Court heard that the Privy Council had been contacted suggesting that the Business Council of the General Council be used as a mechanism for nominating members of the General Council willing to serve as Assessors on Court. This had been with the aim of avoiding having to hold a postal ballot of all graduates where the number of nominees exceeded the number of vacancies for General Council Assessors. The Privy Council was
considering this request and had asked for information on the remit and constitution of the Business Committee.

**CRT/2007/16.7 Election of Rector**

Court noted that the University's students would elect a new Rector in February 2008 to succeed Mr Mordechai Vanunu. It also noted the University’s position that the Rector should preside at meetings of Court, as indicated in the statutes regulating the University’s governance. Responsibility for guiding the meeting through its business agenda would be delegated to a Vice-Chairman elected by Court (currently the Chancellor's Assessor).

**CRT/2007/16.8 Academic Quality Management / Key Performance Indicators**

Court heard that the Scottish Funding Council had been consulting with the Higher Education sector on a revised national approach to academic quality management. The approach currently employed was titled 'Enhancement-Led Institutional Review' (ELIR) and involved a review of quality management at an institutional level. It seemed likely that ELIR would continue in a similar form to the present. However, one change that the Funding Council wished to introduce would require a formal statement by the governing body that it had reviewed and approved the internal system of academic quality management. Court noted that in order to address this requirement, an annual report on academic quality management would be submitted in future to the October meeting of Court, and that this would be accompanied by a review of the University's performance against its Key Performance Indicators for Learning & Teaching.

**VP Learning & Teaching**

**CRT/2007/16.9 Induction Session for Court members**

Court was advised that it was intended to run the annual one-day induction session for Court members in February 2008. Although the session was intended principally for new members of Court, all members would be welcome to attend. Details of the induction day would be issued soon. Members were invited to contact Mr Newall if there were particular topics they wished to be covered.

**CRT/2007/16.10 Appointment of Senate and SRC Assessors on Court**

Court noted that Senate had approved the nomination of Dr Olwyn Byron, Division of Infection & Immunity in the Institute of Biomedical and Life Sciences, for the vacant position of Senate Assessor on Court in the Biomedical and Life Sciences, Medicine, Veterinary Medicine territory. She would serve on Court from 1 November 2007 until 31 July 2011.

Court also noted that at the Students’ Representative Council’s (SRC) meeting on 8 November 2007, Ms Jennifer Wightwick had been elected as SRC Assessor on Court until 31 October 2008.

**CRT/2007/16.11 Stage 2 Grievance Committee**

Court noted that a stage 2 grievance had been received from a member of staff in the School of Modern Languages. Under the University's grievance procedure a Court committee would be set up, and the outcome would be reported to Court in due course.
CRT/2007/16.12 Management Appointment

Court noted that Mr Newall had approved the following management appointment on Court's behalf:

Headship of the Department of Economics

Professor Farhad Noorbakhsh would continue as Head of Department until 31 March 2009. Professor Ronald Macdonald would assume the Headship on 1 April 2009 and remain in post until the end of July 2012, in order to bring the headship cycle in line with other headships in the Faculty of Law, Business & Social Sciences.

CRT/2007/16.13 Appointing Committees for the Headships of Various Departments

Court noted that the following Appointing Committees had been approved for Headships of Departments and Divisions where the current Heads would demit office on 31st July 2008 unless indicated otherwise; in each case the outgoing Head was indicated:

School of Law (Tom Mullen)
Professor Elizabeth Moignard (Convener)
Dr Olwyn Byron (Senate Assessor)

Division of Cardiovascular & Medical Sciences, Medicine (John Reid)
Professor David Barlow (Convener)
Dr Olwyn Byron (Senate Assessor)

Department of Adult & Continuing Education (Brian Finsden) (3.08)
Professor James Conroy (Convener)
Professor Mike French (Senate Assessor)

CRT/2007/16.14 Draft Resolutions relating to Degree Regulations

Court noted that the following Resolutions had been approved. They had been drafted following comments from the Senate and General Council, then reported to Court as having been approved in draft form, and no further comments had been received during the notice period for public comment. A copy of the Resolutions was available from the Court Office.

507-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 507 - DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

507-2 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 507 - DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

526-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 526 - DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF ACCOUNTANCY

569-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 569 - CODE OF DISCIPLINE

570-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 570 – APPEALS CODE
Court noted that the following Resolution had been approved. It had been reported to Court as having been approved in draft form, and had been amended in format, rather than substantive content, following comments from the General Council. No further comments had been received during the notice period for public comment and for Senate comment. A copy of the Resolution was available from the Court Office.

581 - FOUNDATION OF THE CHAIR OF ANAESTHESIA, PAIN AND CRITICAL CARE.

CRT/2007/16.15 Disability Equality Scheme Annual Report

Court noted that as required by legislation, a report had been prepared outlining progress on the Disability Equality Scheme Action Plan approved by Court in 2006. The report would be received and considered on Court's behalf by the Equality & Diversity Strategy Group, which reported to the Human Resources Committee. A copy of the report was available from the Court Office and would be placed on the University website.

CRT/2007/17. Communications from Senate

Court noted the Communications from Senate.

CRT/2007/18. Any Other Business

There was no other business.

CRT/2007/19. Date of Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Court will be held on Wednesday 13 February 2008 in the Senate Room.

The other Court meeting dates for the 2007/2008 session are:

- Wednesday 16 April 2008
- Wednesday 25 June 2008
- Both at 2pm in the Senate Room