University of Glasgow

University Court

Minute of Meeting held on Wednesday 17 December 2003 in the Senate Room

Present:

Mr Greg Hemphill (Rector)
  Mrs Joy Travers (Chancellor’s Assessor)
  Sir Muir Russell (Principal)
  Mr Henry Adams
  Dr Jacqueline Atkinson
  Professor David Bennett
  Mr Norman Berry
  Mr J Scott Cairns
  Professor Andrew Christie
  Dr Jocelyn Dow
  Mr Ronald G Graham
  Dr Alastair Hunter
  Dr Geoffrey Moores
  Dr Keith Nimmo
  Mrs Margaret RH Paxton
  Mr Craig Reedie
  Ms Ali Ritchie (President, Students Representative Council)
  Mr Ian Russell
  Mr Michael Sandford
  Professor John Sewell
  Judy Wilkinson
  Mr Ben Zielinski (Assessor, Student’s Representative Council)
In attendance:

Mr Dugald M Mackie (Secretary of Court)
Mr Kevin Cullen (Director of Research and Enterprise)
Mr Ian Hawkins (Administrative Officer)
Miss Jan Hulme (Academic Secretary)
Professor Robin Leake (Vice-Principal - by invitation)
Mr Ray Lewis (Director of Human Resources)
Professor Malcolm D McLeod (Vice-Principal - by invitation)
Professor Chris Morris (Vice-Principal - by invitation)
Professor Andrew Nash (Vice-Principal and Clerk of Senate – by invitation)
Mr Chris Rusbridge (Director of Information Services)
Mr Robert Wilson (Director of Estates and Buildings)
Mr Michael Yuille (Director of Finance)

Apologies:

Professor Peter H Holmes (Vice-Principal - by invitation)
Bailie Margaret McCafferty (City of Glasgow Assessor)

The University's Strategic Plan

There was a presentation by the Vice-Principal, Estates on behalf of the Vice-Principals, who had been working with the Academic Secretary to update the Strategic Plan. He informed Court of the Level 1 and Level 2 objectives of the University’s proposed Strategic Plan pointing out that the Plan was designed to be a simpler and more easily approachable document than in earlier years. There would eventually be three levels to the Strategic Plan, cascading down into more detailed objectives with those at level 3 being formulated on a SMARTER basis.

The Principal informed Court that one of the purposes of the Strategic Plan was to allow individuals within the Faculties a clear “line of sight” of the Institution’s high level objectives and relate their day to day work to the achievement of at least one of those objectives. He considered that the proposed Strategic Plan was helpful and achieved the right blend in relating the University’s overriding objectives with the individual roles of its staff.

Court thanked the Vice-Principal for his presentation.

There was a presentation by the Secretary of Court in which he set out the different areas of U21, referred to its history and achievements and highlighted the proposals for the future. He stated that U21 was a global alliance of 17 Higher Education Institutions with the following constituent parts each with its own governance arrangements:

i U21 LBG – academic alliance of 17 members
ii U21 Pedagogica – Licensing of names and Quality
Assurance material

iii U21 Global – Joint venture with the Thomson Corporation

iv U21 Equity – 14 shareholders in U21 Global

The Principal reported on a meeting of U21 he had attended recently with the Secretary of Court and stated that he was pleased with the focus on the conventional forms of partnership between the member Institutions such as student exchanges and international research issues. Although the business venture being pursued in partnership with Thomson International was an important part of U21 activities he emphasised that it was not the only area of co-operation among its members. He was of the view that it was sensible for the University to be part of the organisation as it increased the University’s brand strength around the world and, provided that the University made good use of them by communicating these internally to the relevant staff and students, increased the possibilities afforded by the co-operative relationships within U21. The Secretary of Court recognised that internal communication of the opportunities offered by U21 had been lacking in the past but he confirmed that steps were being taken to rectify this position.

The Secretary of Court reported that the drive for students by the business arm, U21 Global, was being targeted at South East Asia although it was also expanding into India which was proving to be a fertile market. A Membership Sub-Group had been established and was actively looking at recruiting members from among institutions in the Americas, India and Africa. He also reported that overall student recruitment was expected to reach the targets set in the business plan and he undertook to pass the reports on the Financial Statements of U21 Global to the Investment Advisory Committee when they had been approved (its financial year being due to end on 31 December).

c) 23 MATTERS ARISING

23.1 Review of Research and Enterprise (Minute 12.2)

Court noted that the decision to require Research and Enterprise to report regularly to the Research Planning and Strategy Committee, and through that body to Court, negated the requirement that R&E report every six months to Court (Minute 18 refers).

The Secretary of Court undertook to look into the membership requirements of the Research Planning and Strategy Committee now it had been designated as a Joint Committee of Senate and Court, with particular regard to the representation of Deans and members of Court.

23.2 Financial Position of the Faculty of Medicine (Minute 12.3)

The Director of Human Resources reported that discussions were continuing on the future of the Technician posts identified in the Medical Faculty for possible redundancy and Court noted that the matter would be the subject of a report to Court once those discussions have been completed.
Mr Russell reported an improved spirit of co-operation between AMICUS and the University in the discussions referred to above. He added that AMICUS was at least partly reassured that it could work with the University on this issue and hoped that the relevant parties could continue to seek a resolution.

23.3 Redundancy Committee (Minute 17.8)

See Minute 28.8

24 MINUTES AND REPORTS OF COURT COMMITTEES.

24.1 Finance Committee Meeting

24.1.1 Accounts for the Year to 31 July 2003

Court approved the Financial Statements for the Year ending 31 July 2003 subject to the inclusion of the memberships of the Remuneration and Nomination Committees into the list of key Committees on page 4.

In response to questions the Director of Finance reported that Court had adopted an Ethical Investment Policy in 2000 which underpinned decisions made by the Investment Advisory Committee. Equally the University’s Fund Managers all operated Socially Responsible Investment Policies. The Investment Advisory Committee, convened by Mr Craig Reedie, was made up of a mix of investment professionals and University representatives. The Director of Finance undertook to circulate a copy of the current Ethical Investment Policy, the Socially Responsible Investment Policies of the Fund Managers and the membership of the Investment Advisory Committee to the members of Court with a view to considering whether the University’s policy should be reviewed and whether there was a need for the Committee to seek views more widely across the University when making fundamental decisions about investment principles.

With regard to the proposed sale of the St Andrews campus the Director of Estates and Buildings reported that the Reporter had submitted his report on the East Dunbartonshire Local Plan but that his view on the possibility of a mixed use on the site was not conclusive in that the views of East Dunbartonshire Council would be materially relevant to any such possibility. The Director stated that the University’s contract with the housebuilding company retained to develop the site required the company to submit a planning application and that this action would de facto establish whether or not a mixed use development for the site would be acceptable to the Council or not.

The Principal reported that the Scottish Executive would be unlikely to be in a position to come to a view on the economic costing of teaching and the funding of Higher Education until after the completion of the current round of spending reviews.

In response to questions the Director of Finance undertook to provide the next meeting of Court with information on the covenanted income which the University had received from the Subsidiary Companies over the last five years.

Subject to the following amendments Court otherwise noted the Report of the Finance Committee held on 3 December 2003:

- The Committee agreed that, when setting dates of meetings for next year, a
meeting should be scheduled at a time which would allow the Committee to consider draft financial statements prior to their submission to the Audit Committee (and not the external auditors as stated in the report).

- With regard to the Financial Statements for the year to 31 July 2003 the Director of Finance stated that the University had received a clean audit opinion…. (and not bill of health as stated in the report)
- It was recognised that the non-payment of monies due to the University resulted in a loss of income to the Institution (rather than placed an enormous cost on the Institution as stated in the report).

24.2 Audit Committee Meeting

24.2.1 Financial Statements for the Year to 31 July 2003

Court noted the Audit Committee recommendation to approve the Financial Statements. Members were unsure of the delineation of roles between the Finance Committee and the Audit Committee when it came to the consideration of the Financial Statements. The Secretary of Court undertook to arrange a meeting of the Conveners of the Finance and Audit Committees, the relevant officers and the external auditors to clarify the position.

24.2.2 Internal Audit Services - Annual Report 2002-03

Members questioned whether, in light of the apparent problems across the University regarding the recording and reporting of transactions and generally dealing with money, there should be a rethink of how these processes were undertaken. Court agreed that the matter be raised at the next meeting of the Audit Committee.

The Secretary of Court reported that Internal Audit investigations of individual work areas were undertaken about every five or six years, not annually. There was a follow up audit after a year to ensure that the recommendations had been implemented and, if this had not been done, a further follow up review was undertaken. Both the Secretary of Court and the Principal were kept informed of Internal Audit reports and where they considered recommendations had not been implemented explanations would be sought from the managers concerned. Both also had regular meetings with the Head of Internal Audit and operated an open door policy should he wish to raise any matters of concern.

Court otherwise noted the Internal Audit Services Annual Report.

24.2.3 Audit Committee Annual Report

Court agreed

- to approve the appointment of Mr Tom O’Connell as the Convener of the Audit Committee in succession to Professor Bob Jack who demitted office as a Convener and Member of the Audit Committee at its meeting on 26 November 2003.
- to approve the appointment of Mr George Taylor as a member of the Audit Committee.

Court otherwise noted the Annual Report of the Audit Committee.
24.2.4 Triennial Review of the External Auditors

Court agreed to extend the contract of Ernst and Young as the University's external auditors for a further two years to include the review of the Financial Statements for the year to 31 July 2005. Court noted that the contract would be subject to market testing in November 2005 in accordance with the provisions of the SHEFC Code of Audit Practice.

24.2.5 The Smith Report on Audit Committees

Following the recommendation in the Smith Report against such appointments Court agreed to remove the requirement from the remit of the Audit Committee that a member of staff engaged in a non-managerial capacity be appointed to the Committee.

Court otherwise noted the Report of the Audit Committee held on 26 November 2003

24.3 Estates Planning and Strategy Committee

The Principal commended the Policy for Sustainable Development to Court. In discussion the Convener of the Estates Planning and Strategy Committee drew members’ attention to the possible Combined Heat and Power Scheme being developed for the Boyd Orr Building as an instance where a scheme was not the cheapest option but where a case could be made for its introduction on the basis of good sustainability.

Court agreed to approve the Policy for Sustainable Development and otherwise noted the Report of the Estates Planning and Strategy Committee held on 17 November 2003.

24.4 Human Resources Committee

Court agreed to approve in principle the appointment of a part time Careers Adviser to support Contract Research Staff, subject to identification of additional resources to support the post.

Court otherwise noted the Report of the Human Resources Committee held on 26 November 2003

24.5 Health, Safety and Environment Committee

Court noted the Report of the Health Safety and Environment Committee held on 26 November 2003

24.6 Information Policy and Strategy Committee

Court agreed to approve the membership, remit and purpose of the Information Policy and Strategy Committee as set out in the report and otherwise noted the report of the Information Policy and Strategy Committee held on 7 November 2003.

25 MINUTES AND REPORTS OF JOINT COURT COMMITTEES

25.1 Resource Strategy Committee

The Vice-Principal, Staffing reported that, following the comments made at the meeting of Senate on 6 November 2003, the proposal to establish a small central Research Postgraduate Office was now the subject of further discussion within the University. Court otherwise noted the report of the Resource Strategy Committee held on 19 November 2003.
25.2 Joint Committee of Court and Manual and Ancillary Staff

Court noted the report of the Joint Committee of Court and Manual and Ancillary Staff held on 13 November 2003.

25.3 Joint Committee (Technicians)

Court noted the report of the Joint Committee (Technicians) held on 18 November 2003.

25.4 Committee on Personal Professorships

Court noted that 12 of the 16 applications for Readerships and 17 of the 36 applications for Personal Professorships had established a prima facie case for promotion (stage one of the process) and that references were being sought as stage two. Decisions would then be made on the basis of such references. Court also agreed that the following be appointed Honorary Professors of the University:

IBLS

- Dr Margaret Frame, Director of the Beatson Institute

Clinical Medicine

- Dr David Goldberg Scottish Centre for Infection and Environmental Health
- Dr Robert Hunter, Greater Glasgow Primary Care NHS Trust, Gartnavel

Glasgow School of Art

- Professor Dean Hawke, Welsh School of Architecture, Cardiff University
- Mr Brian Jones, Human Factors in Complex Systems

25.5 Committee of Recommendation for the Deanship of the Faculty of Social Sciences and the Deanship of the Faculty of Accounting and Finance.

Court was informed that the SRC had adopted a policy of opposition to the re-appointment of Professor Muscatelli as Dean of Social Sciences based on its perception of his apparent unwillingness to represent the student view to oppose the proposed closure of the Adam Smith Library. The Convener of the Committee of Recommendation, the Vice-Principal, Staffing reported that there had been no reflection of such a view during the appointment process and that Professor Muscatelli had the full backing of the Faculty. Some members of Court expressed the view that the future of the Adam Smith Library, important though it undoubtedly was, was only a small part of the full spectrum of the Dean’s work and responsibilities and that it would be unreasonable to base a decision solely on that consideration. In addition, decisions about the library and other changes in the use of accommodation involved a number of people, not simply the Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences.

Dr Jocelyn Dow proposed and Dr Geoffrey Moores seconded the motion that Professor Muscatelli be re-appointed as Dean in accordance with the recommendation before Court. Court overwhelmingly agreed the re-appointment of Professor Muscatelli as Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences for a period of four years until 31 July 2008.
Court also **agreed** the re-appointment of Professor Noreen Burrows as Dean of the Faculty of Law and Financial Studies for a period of two years until 31 July 2006 to complete a normal four year period as Dean.

Court also **ratified** the appointment of Professor Burrows as Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences and Professor Muscatelli as Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Law and Financial Studies.

In response to questions the Secretary of Court undertook to investigate a means of ensuring that student views were made known to future Committees of Recommendation for Deanships.

### 26 COMMUNICATIONS FROM SENATE

#### 26.1 Recommendations for Honorary Fellowships

Court **approved** the following nominations:-

EMERITUS PROFESSOR BRIAN JOHN BLUCK (*nominated by the Faculty of Physical Sciences*) an internationally known research geologist who has had a long and distinguished career at the University of Glasgow, and has made a significant contribution to the formation and subsequent direction of the Division of Earth Sciences.

EMERITUS PROFESSOR CHARLES ARTHUR FEWSON (*nominated by the Faculty of Biomedical and Life Sciences*) was an innovative and reforming influence in the University over many years, not least in respect of the merger in 1994 of the eleven pre-clinical and biological departments which led to the establishment of the Institute of Biomedical and Life Sciences, now one of the leading life science departments in the UK.

HARRY COWAN WILSON (*nominated by the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine*) is a Glasgow graduate who has had a highly distinguished career in the veterinary profession and has been involved in significant public service. His private veterinary practice has been a prolific centre of learning for Glasgow veterinary students for more than forty years.

EMERITUS PROFESSOR JOHN ANTHONY WYKE (*nominated by the Faculty of Medicine*) was Director of the Beatson Institute for Cancer Research for 15 years. During that time he was instrumental in the enhancement of the University’s publication record and grant income. Since then he has continued in his personal commitment to the University and the high standards of its cancer research.

#### 26.2 Report from the Faculty of Arts: Proposed Centre for Atlantic Studies

Court **approved** the constitution of the Centre for Atlantic Studies as set out in the Appendix to the report.

#### 26.3 Report from the Faculty of Education: Proposed Centre for Research and Development in Adult and Lifelong Learning

Court **approved** the constitution of the Centre for Research and Development in Adult and lifelong Learning as set out in the Appendix to the report.

#### 26.4 Restructuring of the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine

Court **approved** the proposal from the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine for the restructuring of the
Faculty on a single Department model with six divisions as set out in the Appendix to the report.

26.5 Faculty of Information and Mathematical Sciences: Proposed Bioinformatics Research Centre

Court approved the constitution for the Bioinformatics Research Centre as set out in the Appendix to the report.

Court otherwise noted the Communications from Senate.

27 REPORT FROM THE MANAGEMENT GROUP

Court noted the report from the University Management Group.

28 REPORT FROM THE SECRETARY OF COURT

28.1 Appointments

28.1.1 Head of the Department of Chemistry

Court agreed the recommendation of its Appointing Committee that Professor Chris Gilmore be re-appointed to the Headship of the Department of Chemistry for a further period of two years, from 1 August 2004 to 31 July 2006.

28.1.2 Head of the Department of Accounting and Finance

Court noted that the Secretary of Court, acting under delegated authority and on behalf of Court had extended Professor Shackleton's Headship for the Department of Accounting and Finance for the period 1 August 2003 to 31 December 2004. The extension regularised Professor Shackleton's position following his appointment as Professor of Accounting History.

28.1.3 Visiting Professorship

Court noted that the Principal, on the recommendation of the Dean of Veterinary Medicine, had exercised his delegated authority to act on behalf of the Committee on Personal Professorships and Readerships and approved the appointment of Professor David Argyle as a Visiting Professor in the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine with effect from 1 January 2004 for a period of five years.

28.2 Draft Resolution of Court

Draft Resolution 505 – Change of Title of the Professorship of Community Care Studies (Nuffield Chair)

Paragraph 5, Part II, Schedule 2 of the Universities (Scotland) Act 1966 provides that the power to alter the title of existing professorships is exercisable by Resolution of Court. Court noted that the Secretary of Court, acting under delegated authority and on behalf of Court has approved a Draft Resolution changing the name of the above Professorship to the following:

a) The Nuffield Trust Professor of Community Care

A copy of the Draft Resolution has been placed on deposit in the Court Office and sent to the
General Council and the Senate for comment.

The Secretary of Court undertook to pass copies of Draft Resolutions to Mrs Margaret Paxton for her information.

28.3 Calendar of Actions

Court noted the Calendar of Actions.


Court noted the interim report of the Review Group attached as Appendix 2 to the report and that Annexes A (the remit and scope of the review) and C (the working methods of the review group and the evidence considered) were not attached to the interim report but copies were available from the Court Office on request.

Court agreed to adopt the following recommendations of the Review Group:

1. With effect from 1 January 2004, the University of Glasgow Business School and the Department of Business and Management should be brought together into a single Departmental unit.

2. The new department should be a single budgetary unit within the Law and Financial Studies and Social Sciences resource unit.

3. The proposed name for the new unit should be ‘The Business and Management School’.

4. The current Head of the Department of Business and Management should be appointed as Head of the Business and Management School, and act as Head of Department for the new unit for the remainder of his current term of office. The use of the term ‘Head’ as opposed to ‘Director’ brings the Headship of this unit into line with the titles used by other departmental units in the Faculties. The Faculties should review the performance of the School and its relations with cognate departments over the next 12-18 months, and consider whether an external appointment to succeed the current Head would be in the interests of the School in delivering on its mission.

Court noted that following consideration of the interim report by Court, the Joint Faculty Management Group and Senate, the Review Group would be reconvened prior to a final report being prepared for approval by the Faculties of Social Sciences and Law and Financial Studies. Court also noted that the name of the Business School was being reconsidered by the Dean.

28.5 Honorary Teaching Fellow and Honorary Senior Teaching Fellow

Court agreed to the request of the Faculty of Education to establish two new designations of honorary status, Honorary Teaching Fellow and Honorary Senior Teaching Fellow.

The Secretary of Court undertook to inform members of the difference between the designations of Honorary Teaching/Honorary Senior Teaching Fellows and Honorary Lecturers/Senior Lecturers.

28.6 Summary of Key Statistics

Court noted the Summary of Key Statistics attached as Appendix 3 to the report and that because the figures used in the Tuition Fees section of the report had been rounded up (or down) this had produced inaccuracies in the indicated totals. It was agreed that this should be
rectified in the future.

The Director of Finance undertook to discuss with Mr Ronald Graham possible additions to the information set out in the report.

**28.7 Review of the Department of Economics**

Court noted the findings of informal review of the Department of Economics and in respect of the following recommendations agreed to:

1. Improve the management structures by delegating authority to departmental committees, making decision making inclusive and transparent, improving communications and changing the style of management by the HoD.

2. Refer a deferred recommendation for the appointment of the Head of Department to the Principal and Secretary of Court for promulgation after the December meeting of Court with the decision being reported to the February meeting of Court.

3. Create a new applied microeconomics cluster to focus particular attention on micro-labour economics, the economics of R&D and productivity, and public economics.

4. Draw up job specifications only after an initial search of the potential market to reflect the expectation that the new group would become involved in one or more of the research areas of the Centre for Public Policy in the Regions (CPPR) as well as add to the Department’s RAE profile.

5. Make four appointments in the first instance. Two of these would be at the Chair level, and two at a more junior level (probably Lecturer A/B, although there might be some flexibility in this depending on the discussions with potential Chair applicants about forming a new research group in Glasgow). The other vacancies should be held in reserve and might be deployed depending on the success of the hiring strategy.

6. Place the selection process in the control of the Deans and Associate Dean (Research), in consultation with the Head of Department.

7. Ensure that there is a consistent discussion about the appropriate University strategy, by establishing a close liaison between the new Head of Department, the Dean of the Faculty, and the Associate Dean (Research) in any discussions which take place between Scottish Universities on the potential formation of a cross-University Institute.

Court noted that the Dean of Social Sciences had agreed that the small search Committee to be set up to advise on the initial search process for two appointees at Chair level and two more junior staff would include a female professor from a cognate department so as to help preserve the gender balance of that Committee.

Court agreed the recommendation of the Vice-Principal, Staffing that the report of the Review Group be included in the package of documents to be sent to the external reviewer of the Arts Side Research Sub-Group.

Court also noted that the Review Committee would continue as established and revisit the outcome of the review in due course and report back to Court at an appropriate time.

**28.8 Report of the Redundancy Committee**

Court received a report from the Redundancy Committee established at its meeting on 12
November 2003. It agreed that the Department of Orthopaedics be closed and the remaining post in the Department be made redundant from 31 December 2003 but that the Faculty of Medicine be encouraged to retain the post holder for a period sufficient to allow the question of funding for a Technician within the Centre for Rheumatic Diseases and Immunology to be decided but in any event for not longer than 3 months.

Court also agreed that the post of the Senior lecturer in Cardiac Surgery be terminated from a date to be agreed with the BHF, and the postholder be made redundant no later than 31 March 2004.

29 THE RECTOR

Court noted that the Rector was due to demit office in March 2004 and because he would be unable to attend the February meeting this would be his last meeting of Court. Court joined the Chancellor’s Assessor in paying tribute to the dedication of Greg Hemphill to the University, the students and Court during his term of office as Rector. Court recorded its gratitude to him and for his diligence and efforts during his term of office and wished him all the best for the future.

Court also noted the announcement from the Chancellor’s Assessor that the Secretary of Court had tendered his resignation from his post at the University and had been appointed to the post of Secretary and Registrar of the new combined University of Manchester.

30 DATE OF NEXT MEETING

The next meeting of Court would be held on Wednesday 11 February 2004 at 2:00pm.