UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

Court

Minute of Meeting held on Wednesday 2 February 2005 in Room 248, Bower Building

Present:
Dr Jacqueline Atkinson Senate Assessor, Professor David Bennett Senate Assessor, Mr Norman Berry General Council Assessor, Professor John Briggs Senate Assessor, Mr Scott Cairns Co-opted member, Professor Andrew Christie Co-opted Member, Professor Mike French Senate Assessor, Dr Alastair Christie Co-opted representative, Mrs Margaret McCafferty GCC Assessor, Mr Robert McLaggan SRC Assessor, Dr Geoffrey Moores Senate Assessor, Mr J.A. Murray SRC President, Mrs Margaret Paxton General Council Assessor, Ms Kate Phillips Co-opted Member, Mr David Ross General Council Assessor, Sir Muir Russell Principal, Mr Ian Russell Employee representative, Mr Michael Sandford General Council Assessor, Dr Mona Siddiqui Senate Assessor, Mrs Joy Travers Chancellor's Assessor, Professor David Watt Senate Assessor, Mr Donald Wilson General Council Assessor.

In attendance:
Mr Bob Cunningham (Interim Director of Human Resources), Mr Ian Hawkins (Administrative Officer), Mr Robert Fraser (Director of Finance), Professor Peter Holmes (Vice-Principal), Miss Jan Hulme (Academic Secretary) Professor Robin Leake (Vice-Principal), Professor Malcolm McLeod (Vice-Principal), Professor Chris Morris (Vice-Principal), Professor Anton Muscatelli (Vice-Principal Strategy and Budgeting), Professor Andrew Nash (Clerk of Senate), Mr David Newall (Secretary of Court), Professor Andrea Nolan (Vice-Principal Learning and Teaching), Mr Chris Rusbridge (Director of Information Services), Mr Alastair Sim (Director of Planning Services), Mr Bob Wilson (Director of Estates and Buildings), Mr Simon Wilson (Human Resources Manager), Annie Vaz (Acting Director of Publicity Services)

Apologies:

Members
Dr Keith Nimmo General Council Assessor, Dr Craig Reedie Co-opted Member.

Attendees
Professor Steve Beaumont (Vice-Principal Research).

CRT/2004/26. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 15 December 2004

Court approved the minute of the meeting held on 15 December 2004.
CRT/2004/27. Matters Arising

27.1 Election of Rector (Minute 22.6)

The Secretary of Court reported that he, the Principal and the Clerk of Senate had all written to the Rector welcoming him to his new position and confirmed that, despite being unable to leave Israel, all the information necessary to fulfil his role would continue to be sent to him. Court noted that, in accordance with Standing Orders, where the Rector was absent meetings of Court would be chaired by the Vice-Chairman of Court (the Chancellor's Assessor).

Court otherwise noted the Matters Arising report.

CRT/2004/28. Future Academic Shape of the University

The Principal introduced the paper and reported that there had been general approval by Members for the approach suggested at the Court seminar held on 12 January 2005. He added that similar approval had been expressed at Senate the following week.

Court noted the report of the Court Seminar held on 12 January 2005 and agreed the broad conclusions set out therein.


29.1 Full Economic Costing

The Principal reported that the concept of Full Economic Costing was beginning to take root in people's minds both within and outwith the University. With regard to research grants from Charities he stated that south of the border the Funding Council had set aside £90M to help cover the shortfall between the value of grants and their full economic cost but it was not yet known what action would be taken in Scotland. Court noted that as the University had a high level of charity research funding it was a key player in discussions with SHEFC on this matter along with the Universities of Edinburgh and Dundee.

29.3 Balancing Income with Academic Development: the Estates Perspective

The Principal reported the announcement of the Science Research Investment Fund Round 3 (SRIF 3) and that Scotland's allocation was higher than that of the rest of the UK due to the relatively high levels of research north of the border. The funding would be made available in the same way as SRIF 2 and the University had been allocated £23M for the period 2006-08. With regard to the Learning and Teaching Infrastructure Fund (formerly TIF) the University was arguing for funding to be allocated by formula, rather than through a bidding process, and was hoping for a reasonable share of the £25M available in 2005-06.

At the SMG meeting held the day before it was noted that the proportion of international students at the University was not particularly high compared to its Russell Group peers who were undertaking imaginative work in attracting such students. The Principal stated that international students would enhance the University's profile both at home and abroad. The SMG considered that increasing the proportion of international students at the University was strategically important and the development of a six to seven year business plan to tie in with the Future SHAPE exercise was being developed. This would need
to take account of a variety of factors including e-learning, physical resources, staff attitudes and student support. The Principal added that the question of whether the University's internationalist strategy needed a designated leader would be considered at the appropriate time.

Court otherwise noted the report.

**CRT/2004/30. Report from the Secretary of Court**

30.1 Governance Questionnaire

Court noted that current practice at Glasgow was consistent with the new *Guide for Members of Higher Education Governing Bodies* but that this would be an appropriate time to consider whether the University's governance arrangements may be improved. Court noted the questionnaire attached to the report which was to be completed by all members as a way of soliciting views on current practice.

In response to questions the Secretary of Court stated that the initial objective of the exercise was to develop a view of what Court itself thought of the governance arrangements at the University and that any widening of the exercise would not take place until after that process had been completed.

30.2 Joint School of Nursing and Midwifery

Court noted that it would receive a further report to its March meeting.

30.3 Non-Academic Staff Pension Scheme (NASPS)

At its November meeting, Court was briefed on the recent actuarial valuation of the Non Academic Staff Pension Scheme. The actuary's advice was that, in order to meet its obligations under the Government's Minimum Funding Requirement, the University must set aside £2.7M per annum, and in addition increase the annual contribution rate (employer plus employee) from 16.0% of annual salary to 19.0%. The increase in the contribution rate equates to £900,000, giving a total additional funding requirement of £3.6M per annum for each of the next ten years.

Court noted the appendix to the report which set out the broad options available, with a brief note on the financial and other consequences of each option. Court also noted that, whatever the decision about future pension arrangements, it had a contractual duty in respect of benefits already accrued by members of NASPS and that every course of action open to the University would be expensive. With regard to the scale of the cost, the most significant element, the £2.7M annual lump sum, was the figure over which there is most uncertainty, with the possibility that this could move significantly up or down from year to year.

Members discussed the range of options before them. Some members felt that, bearing in mind the University's financial position of operating close to break even and of having no reserves, there was a compelling argument for closure of the scheme and its substitution by a defined contribution scheme. Others considered that the recruitment and retention of key staff would suffer if the scheme was amended too drastically and the University's reputation as a good employer would be damaged. After much discussion there was a broad agreement that the Secretary of Court should explore further option 3.4 (broad comparability to USS) and revert to the March meeting of Court with more robust figures on its cost. He also undertook to report back on whether option 3.4 would be consistent with practice in competitor institutions. Court would consider this matter at its March meeting in the light of this information.
A concern was expressed that 90% of the assets of the Scheme were invested in equities, a relatively high risk option; it might be prudent in the future to spread that investment into lower risk options such as gilts and bonds. It was noted also that the USS scheme would be valued in the next few months and, in the current financial climate, might experience similar problems to NASPS.

30.4 Grants to Student Bodies

The Secretary of Court reported that the Review Group established by Court had come to a general consensus that the historical formula for funding the student bodies was no longer appropriate and that some form of activity based system would be preferable.

The President of the SRC undertook to send a copy of the SRC’s proposals for international support services to the Secretary of Court for consideration by the Review Group before it reported to Court in March. The Secretary of Court confirmed that the tax status of the student bodies would be taken into account in the Review Group’s deliberations.

30.5 Appointments to Committees

Court re-appointed Miss Margaret Anne McParland as the Unison-nominated Trustee on the Board of the Non-Academic Staff Pension Scheme for a further period of four years.

Court noted that the Secretary of Court acting under delegated authority and on behalf of Court had made the following appointments:

- Joint Court Manual and Ancillary Committee – Mrs Margaret Paxton to replace Ms Kate Phillips
- Board of Selection for the Chairs of Italian and Hispanic Studies - Mr Michael Sandford to replace Mr Ronald Graham as the General Council Assessor on the Board.

30.6 Deanship of the Faculty of Arts

Court approved the recommendation of its Committee of Recommendation that Professor Elizabeth A Moignard, currently Deputy Dean of the Faculty of Arts, be appointed as Dean of the Faculty of Arts with effect from 1 August 2005.

30.7 Procedures for the Appointment of Deans

Court agreed that the current procedures for the appointment of Deans be amended to include the following provisions:

- staff making nominations should be required to discuss their suggestions with the candidates, and the candidates should be required to indicate whether or not they are willing to be considered
- at the time of nomination the nominees should submit a single A4 page personal statement and CV for the information of the Committee of Recommendation.
- nominations should be supported by a seconder from within the Faculty.

The Secretary of Court noted the request that the procedure for the appointment of Deans, and of Deputy Deans, be subject to a thorough review.
30.8 Headship of Academic Departments

Court approved the following recommendations of its Appointing Committees:

- School of Business and Management – Mr Robert Paton, reappointment for the period 1 August 2005 to 31 July 2006.
- Department of Geography and Geomatics – Professor Trevor Hoey, for the period 1 August 2005 to 31 July 2009, to succeed Professor Chris Philo.

30.9 Student Appeals - Outcome of Hearings

Court noted the outcome of the following two appeals:

30.9.1 Student in the Faculty of Social Sciences

Dismiss the appeal by a student in the Faculty of Social Sciences against the decision not to raise the level of the undergraduate degree awarded from a 2:2 to a 2:1.

30.9.2 Student in the Faculty of Medicine (including Dentistry and Nursing)

Uphold the appeal against the decision to exclude the student from further study on the course leading to the degree of Master of Nursing (MN).

30.10 Outcome of Appeals against the Decisions of Disciplinary Panels

Court noted the outcome of the following two appeals:

30.10.1 Member of Staff in IBLS

Dr Doris Littlejohn, the appointed person in this case, noted that the Disciplinary Procedures provided that, following an earlier written warning, "...every reasonable assistance will be given to the member of staff, whether through counselling, advice or training, to improve his or her performance." Dr Littlejohn was not satisfied that such counselling, advice or training had been given. Moreover she noted that the Disciplinary Procedures also provided that the written warning "...will give details of the complaint, the improvement required and the time scale. It will warn that a complaint may be made to the Secretary of the University Court seeking the institution of charges to be heard by a Tribunal." Dr Littlejohn concluded that the warning letter in this case did not give the specific warning required by the Disciplinary Procedures and upheld the appeal.

The dismissal of the employee was therefore been rescinded

30.10.2 Member of Staff in the Faculty of Physical Science

Court noted that a Panel of members had heard initial evidence upon the charges that the conduct of the employee potentially constituted good cause for dismissal and that it would report its recommendations to the Principal in due course. Court was informed that events had overtaken this process in that the member of staff had resigned and the matter closed.
30.11 Bequest
Court noted the receipt of a bequest in the sum of £50,000 for research into Lupus from the late Mrs Agnes Reid Jamieson

30.12 SHEFC Visit
Noted.

30.13 Redundancy Committee
Court noted that the Secretary of Court acting under delegated authority and on behalf of Court and following recommendations from the Acting Dean of Social Sciences and the Principal had established the following Redundancy Committee and Structural Change Committee to look at matters relating to the School of Business and Management:

**Redundancy Committee**
Professor Chris Morris (Territorial VP and Convener)
Mrs Christine Lowther (ALC)
Professor Mike French (ALC)
Mrs Margaret Paxton (Lay Member of Court)
Mr Michael Sandford (Lay Member of Court)
Ms Rhona Little (Support Staff)
Mr Andy Sibbald (Support Staff)
Interim Director of Human Resources (or nominee)

**Structural Change Committee**
Professor Noreen Burrows (Acting Dean and Convener)
Dr Robbie Paton (Head of School)
Mr Paul Gray (Territorial HR Manager)

Court noted that it was likely that only one post would be included in the selection pool for the redundancy.

30.14 Deputy Deanship of the Faculty of Education
Court approved the establishment of the following Committee of Recommendation to consider the Dean designate's nomination of a Deputy Dean for the period 1 August 2004 to 31 July 2008.

- Professor Chris Morris (Territorial VP and Convener)
- Dr James Conroy (Dean designate)
- Mrs Margaret Paxton (Member of Court)

Court otherwise noted the report of the Secretary of Court.

**CRT/2004/31. Policy on Fixed Term Contracts**
Court approved the policy document, *Fixed Term Contracts: Policy* set out in the report.

In doing so Court noted the intention to move steadily to a position where, by July 2006, fixed-term contracts would be used only in certain specific circumstances, as set out in the policy.

Court noted the concern of AMICUS that, in managing a redundancy situation, the University should ensure that the redundancy pool was drawn sufficiently tightly, and
that there should robust criteria for redundancy and equity of treatment. Court was assured that this would be the case and that implementation of the new policy would be accompanied by refined processes for financial management, performance management and redundancy management.

CRT/2004/32. Communications from Senate: 20 January 2005

The Communications from Senate were noted.

CRT/2004/33. Minutes and Reports of Court Committees

CRT/2004/33.1 Human Resources Committee

The report of the Human Resources Committee was noted.

CRT/2004/33.2 Equality and Diversity Strategy Committee

Court agreed the recommendation that all University Committees, where possible, meet a gender balance of at least 30% female membership.

The report of the Equality and Diversity Strategy Committee was otherwise noted.

CRT/2004/33.3 Remuneration Committee

The report from the Remuneration Committee was noted.

CRT/2004/33.4 Estates Planning and Strategy Committee

In response to questions the Director of Estates and Buildings reported that the loss of 70 exam spaces associated with the upper floor of the Sir Charles Wilson Building, 1 University Avenue was not hugely significant to the overall picture and confirmed that arrangements had been made for all examinations this year. He also confirmed that the lower floor of this building would be able to provide 70-80 exam spaces at the start of the summer term.

The report of the Estates Planning and Strategy Committee was otherwise noted.

CRT/2004/33.5 Board of Review

Court approved the recommendations for the promotion/advancement of the Academic and Related staff set out in the report and to homologate the Board of Review’s recommendations for those cases which have been deferred pending receipt of referee reports.

CRT/2004/33.6 Finance Committee

Court noted the position regarding the capital projects at the Hub and at the Small Animal Hospital as set out in the report. They agreed that Garscube Phase 3 had to be put on hold, until the wider position on the nature and affordability of the capital programme was clearer. In response to questions the Principal confirmed that the possibility of some private sector involvement in Garscube Phase 3 would be explored.

Court otherwise noted the report of the Finance Committee.
CRT/2004/34. Any Other Business

34.1 Farewells

Court noted that this would be the last Court meeting of the Director of Estates and Buildings and of the Director of Information Services. Court joined the Chancellor’s Assessor in paying tribute to these officers. Court expressed its thanks for everything they had done for the University and wished them well in their new posts.

The Chancellor’s Assessor also reported the announcement at the last meeting of the General Council of the retirement of Sir William Kerr Fraser as Chancellor of the University after ten years of service. Court endorsed her statement that both she and the University would miss him enormously.

CRT/2004/35. Date of Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Court would be held on Wednesday 23 March 2005 at 14:00.

Prepared by: Ian Hawkins Clerk to Committee i.hawkins@admin.gla.ac.uk
Last modified on: Thursday 24 March 2005
Version: 1