UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW

Court

Minute of the Meeting held on Wednesday 10 May 2006 in The Senate Room

Present:
Dr Jacqueline Atkinson Senate Assessor, Professor David Bennett Senate Assessor, Mr Norman Berry General Council Assessor, Professor John Briggs Senate Assessor, Professor Susan Castillo Senate Assessor, Professor Andrew Christie Co-opted Member, Mr Peter Daniels Co-opted Member, Mrs Barbara Duffner Co-opted Member, Dr Robin Easton Co-opted Member, Professor Mike French Senate Assessor, Dr Martin Macauley Senate Assessor, Mrs Margaret McCafferty GCC Assessor, Mr Alan Macfarlane General Council Assessor, Mr Jamie McHale SRC Assessor, Professor Michael Scott-Morton Co-opted Member, Mrs Margaret Paxton General Council Assessor, Dr Mona Siddiqui Senate Assessor, Ms Sarah Tomlinson SRC President, Mr David Ross General Council Assessor, Mrs Joy Travers Chancellor's Assessor (Convener).

In attendance:
Mr Ian Black (Director of Human Resources), Professor Noreen Burrows (Dean of Law, Business and Social Sciences) Professor John Coggins (Vice-Principal), Mr Robert Fraser (Director of Finance), Mr Ian Hawkins (Administrative Officer), Miss Jan Hulme (Academic Secretary), Professor Robin Leake (Vice-Principal), Ms Deborah Maddern (Administrative Officer), Mr Jim McConnell (Director of Estates and Buildings), Professor Anton Muscatelli (Vice-Principal), Professor Andrew Nash (Clerk of Senate), Mr David Newall (Secretary of Court), Professor Andrea Nolan (Vice-Principal Learning and Teaching), Ms Susan Stewart (Director of Corporate Communications).

Apologies:
Members: Dr Alastair Hunter Employee Representative, Sir Muir Russell Principal, Mr Donald Wilson General Council Assessor, and the Rector.
Attendees: Professor Steve Beaumont (Vice-Principal Research).

CRT/2005/50. Announcements
Court welcomed Professor Michael Scott-Morton to his first meeting as a co-opted member of Court.

Court also noted with regret the untimely death of Dr Geoffrey Moores, a former Senate Assessor and good friend who had been battling against illness for some time but typically had remained at work up until the Easter break.

CRT/2005/51. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 22 March 2006
The Minutes of the meeting held on 22 March 2006 were approved as a correct record.
CRT/2005/52. Matters Arising

CRT/2005/52.1 Funding Letter from the Scottish Funding Council

Court noted that following an amendment by the SFC of its grant letter the University had been awarded an additional £774k in Main Quality Research Grant income. This resulted in the University's funding rising from 7.5% to 8.0% (compared to the Scottish average of 7.2%). This equated to a total grant of £147.52M.

CRT/2005/52.2 National Student Survey

Court was pleased to note the excellent performance by the University's students on a level of return to the survey of just under 70%. Court thanked both the SRC and the Academic Secretary for their considerable efforts in this regard.

CRT/2005/52.3 Working Group on Committee Structure

Court noted the discussion paper prepared by the Vice-Chairman of Court and the Secretary of Court which proposed that:

1. Court meet five times a year with a reduced number of Committees (Audit, Estates*, Finance*, Health, Safety & Environment, Human Resources*, Nominations, Remuneration) with those with an asterisk reporting within the same cycle.

2. The co-ordination of Court's business be assisted by each of the three main committees (Estates, Finance and HR) meeting around the same time in advance of Court; with the chairs of the three committees meeting two weeks before each meeting of Court to review the Court agenda and ensure effective coordination of committee business.

3. Court should adopt a small number of Key Performance Indicators that should relate to objectives set out in the strategic plan. These should include indicators relevant to Estates, Finance and HR, and the main committees should report on performance against these KPIs.

4. The Secretary of Court, liaising with the Chairs of the committees, should ensure a consistency in the quality of committee reports. Reports from Estates, Finance and HR Committees would be substantial, demonstrating that these bodies were addressing their responsibilities effectively and with reference to the University's strategic objectives.

5. A convention should be adopted at Glasgow whereby the Rector would formally preside at meetings of Court, in accordance with the requirements of the Universities (Scotland) Act 1966, but the business of leading the governing body through its business agenda would be delegated to a lay member elected by Court (the Vice-Chairman, currently the Chancellor's Assessor).

6. That the shape of future Court agenda be fine-tuned to reflect the order set out in the report and to include a report from the Principal on strategic and topical issues (not necessarily those considered at Senior Management Group) and a report from a Faculty (see item 7 below)

7. With regard to the need to monitor the University's performance in Learning & Teaching and in Research, Court should:
receive reports from the Vice-Principal (Learning and Teaching) and from the Vice-Principal (Research) reviewing the University's performance against the targets set out in the strategic plan; and

over a two-year cycle, receive reports on the performance of each Faculty. This would involve each Dean (and, for central services, the Secretary of Court) reporting on performance against objectives - these reports would be accompanied by appropriate commentary from the Estates, Finance and HR committees.

The SRC supported the main thrust of the paper but took the view that careful consideration should be given to:

- any proposed changes to the role of the Rector and the potential effect on the level of representation afforded to students at Court, and
- the appropriate level of student representation on Committees within the proposed structure.

Subject to the discussion on the matter of Faculty reports to Court set out in Minute 53 below, Court broadly agreed the proposals from the Vice-Chairman and the Secretary of Court.

**CRT/2005/53. Presentation from the Dean of the Faculty of Law, Business and Social Sciences**

Court noted the presentation from the Dean of Law Business and Social Sciences who reminded Members that this was the University's newest Faculty having been formed as a result of a merger in August 2005. She set out its strategic aims and current academic shape as well as illustrating its strengths and weaknesses and illustrating the opportunities and threats it faced. She concluded with reference to how the Faculty was performing in the areas of Teaching, Research and Resource Management. Court thanked her for an impressive and interesting snapshot of the Faculty and the challenges it faced.

With regard to the proposal that Court should receive similar presentations from each of the Deans over a two-year cycle, Members expressed the following views:

- There should be more information on the outputs e.g. how many students gain employment or further study
- It was good to see the range of activities going on in the Faculty but it might be more appropriate to focus on its three most important strengths and weaknesses
- It would be helpful to have a template of matters for report for the Deans to refer to and thought should be given to what both Court and the individual Faculty giving the presentation will get out of the process
- The process should be one of Court holding the Deans to account
- There was no consensus on how often the presentations should take place reflecting the difficult balance between overloading members with detail and giving them enough information to be able to ask the right questions. Views ranged from two presentations at each meeting to one every second meeting. The possibility of having additional presentations by Deans outside of the normal cycle of meetings was also raised.
• Alternatively a dedicated Committee, with the possible assistance of external input, should be established to hear the reports of the Deans and this in turn should report to Court.

The Secretary of Court undertook to give further consideration to the issue of Faculty reports to Court in light of Members’ comments set out above and to report back to Court in due course.

CRT/2005/54. Report from the Senior Management Group

In the absence of the Principal, Vice-Principal Leake introduced the report.

CRT/2005/54.1 Announcements

Professor Leake reported that the Principal had been elected by Universities Scotland to succeed Professor John Archer as its Convener for a two year period from 1 August 2006. As such he would have a higher public profile, publicising both this University and other Scottish Higher Education Institutions.

He also reported that there would be a series of events to commemorate the 100th anniversary of the death of Lord Kelvin which members of Court were welcome to attend. Members were also invited to attend the Commemoration Day celebrations on 21 June 2006 when Sir Kenneth Calman would be installed as the new Chancellor of the University.

CRT/2005/54.2 AUT Action

Professor Leake reported that the Universities and Colleges Employers’ Association had made an offer of 12.6% over three years, considered to be the maximum the majority of Institutions could afford, and further talks with the Trades Unions were expected. With regard to the University’s own circumstances he informed members that all examinations to date had been held on time and this was expected to continue. Marking was going ahead and the University expected graduations take place on time.

CRT/2005/54.3 VAT on Buildings

In response to questions Professor Leake confirmed that the construction of the new Biomedical and Cardiovascular Buildings had been exempt from VAT on the basis that they were to be used primarily for Charity funded research. Any alternative use for the University’s core businesses such as teaching would only be permitted if it was considered to be de minimis. The question of what level constituted a de minimis use was for individual VAT Inspectors to decide but the Director of Finance considered that recovery of VAT might well be sought where the level of the intended use fell below 90%.

The report was otherwise noted.
Court Wednesday 10 May 2006

CRT/2005/55. Reports of Court Committees

CRT/2005/55.1 Finance Committee

55.1.1 Faculty Income and Expenditure Accounts

The Director of Finance introduced the appendix to the report which summarised the monthly Income and Expenditure Accounts for the Faculties and AIMS for January 2006. With regard to the year to date Court noted that all the Faculties were continuing to perform ahead of their budgeted targets. There were three main areas of better performance; salary costs reflecting better that expected Voluntary Severance savings and voids, Strategic Investment Fund monies not invested and savings in consumables. In response to questions he confirmed that the Faculty of Medicine was no longer forecasting an adverse variance with the budget but was showing a surplus and that therefore all Faculties were forecasting a better contribution than budget.

The forecast for the year was showing an operating improvement of £2.7M and research was forecast to be £1.3M ahead of budget. Corporate overheads were forecast to be within budget and overall there would be an operating surplus of £3M on a recurring basis.

With regard to the position of the Crichton Campus Court noted that the level of losses experienced were not sustainable and that a report should be submitted to its next meeting on the options open to the University. The report should include the costs of the various options and an exit strategy.

Court otherwise noted the report.

CRT/2005/55.2 Human Resources Committee

55.2.1 Pay Modernisation

Court noted that approximately 20% of the job-matching process had been completed to date. It was reported that more jobs than originally anticipated had been ‘green-circled’, and as a result a joint Trades Union/Management Working Group had been established to look into Job Descriptions in more detail. The Director of Human Resources considered that the number of jobs eventually “green circled” would reduce and he expected the final figure to be less than 7%. Work on future promotion procedures was ongoing.

It was also noted that there are still some problems to be addressed before harmonisation of working hours could be achieved across campus, particularly in areas where shift-patterns were in place. Consideration was being given to whether to harmonise hours at 35 hours per week and Court noted that progress would be reported to the next HR Committee meeting.

55.2.2 HR Strategic Plan

Court noted the following themes set out in the report that would form the basis of the HR Strategic Plan:

- Facilitate an organisational culture of responsive leadership, open communications and good employee relations which motivates and
enables staff to deliver high performance and helps develop a climate of improvement

- Develop and implement strategies to attract and retain staff at all levels who are best suited to achieve the University’s objectives
- Develop and implement fair, robust, consistent and transparent reward structures which recognise and reward individual and group/team contribution
- Facilitate the necessary staffing and organisational planning required for the delivery of the University’s mission, and facilitate the associated change management process
- Imbed and help maximise the benefits of the “Modernisation agenda” for the University and its staff
- Place equality and diversity issues at the centre of planning and policy development, and fully integrate them into operations
- Facilitate and deliver individual and organisational learning for University staff which supports the achievement of the University’s objectives, more effective ways of working and staff’s own career aspirations
- Ensure the Human Resources function delivers high quality services to managers and staff, and works toward the continuous improvement of those services.

55.2.3 Key Performance Indicators

Court noted that Key Performance Indicators on the following themes would be developed for discussion by the HR Committee which would revisit them annually and report them to Court:

- demographics, e.g. age, race, gender, equal opportunities
- availability, e.g. sickness days, absence
- remuneration
- disciplinary & grievance issues.

55.2.4 Age Discrimination Legislation: Draft Policy on Retirement

Court noted that the University was taking measures to ensure that it fully complied with the requirements of the Employment Quality (Age) Regulations 2006. Court also noted the draft Policy on Retirement appended to the report which outlined the process to be followed with regard to retirements.

Court otherwise noted the report of the Human Resources Committee.

CRT/2005/55.3 Research Planning and Strategy Committee

55.3.1 Preparations for the RAE

Court noted that leavers under the University's recent Voluntary Severance (VS) scheme would be precluded from the proposed exercise to re-engage
retired academic staff for submission to RAE 2008. The Director of Human Resources confirmed that all posts removed under the VS scheme were highlighted on the Human Resources database and it had been made explicit that returns would not be permitted for eighteen months.

Court otherwise noted the report of the Research Planning and Strategy Committee.

**CRT/2005/55.4 Estates Planning and Strategy Committee**

Court received a presentation from the Director of Estates and Buildings on the Estates Strategy. Court thanked the Director of Estates and Buildings for the presentation which was much appreciated and well received.

Court otherwise noted the report.

**CRT/2005/55.5 Equality and Diversity Strategy Committee**

In response to questions the Clerk of Senate stated that he would seek to arrange a lunchtime seminar on Islamaphobia and Racism in Scotland to be held on the same day as a meeting of Court in the summer/autumn.

Court otherwise noted the report.

**CRT/2005/56. Report from the Secretary of Court**

**CRT/2005/56.1 Key Performance Indicators**

Court noted that a further report on this matter would be submitted to its June meeting.

**CRT/2005/56.2 Russell Group Incorporation**

Court noted that the University's lawyers, the Secretary of Court and his counterpart at the University of Edinburgh were comfortable with the draft Memorandum and Articles of Association and Court agreed that:

- The Memorandum and Articles of Association be approved as the basis of the Russell Group's incorporation as a company limited by guarantee;
- The University become a member of the company; and
- The Principal become a director of the company

**CRT/2005/56.3 School of Modern Languages**

Court agreed that the Dean of Arts, Professor John Briggs and Professor Anton Muscatelli liaise on the future of the School of Modern Languages and Cultures and report back to the next meeting of Court with their initial thoughts.

**CRT/2005/56.4 University Representative on Council of Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons**

Court approved the re-nomination of Mrs Alison Bruce as one of the University's representatives on the Royal College of Veterinary Surgeons' Council (the other being the Dean, Professor Stuart Reid) for a further four year term, commencing July 2006.
CRT/2005/56.5 Headship of the Department of Sociology, Anthropology and Applied Social Sciences

Court approved the recommendation of its Committee of Appointment that Professor Nick Watson be appointed as the Head of the Department of Sociology, Anthropology and Applied Social Sciences for the period 1 August 2006 to 31 July 2010 in succession to Professor Harvie Ferguson.

CRT/2005/56.6 Headship of the Joint Glasgow School of Social Work

Court approved the recommendation of Mr I Smith (Dean of the Faculty of Education at the University of Strathclyde) and Professor Noreen Burrows (the Dean of Law Business and Social Sciences) that Professor Andrew Kendrick be made Head of Department of the Glasgow School of Social Work with effect from 1 August 2006 for a period of three years. Three years is the normal period of office for a Head of Department at the University of Strathclyde where Professor Kendrick is employed. A similar recommendation has been made to the University of Strathclyde in accordance with the Memorandum of Agreement.

CRT/2005/56.7 Associate Dean for Clinical Services

Court noted that the Secretary of Court, acting under delegated authority and on behalf of Court, had approved the appointment of Professor Stuart Carmichael as the Associate Dean of Clinical Services in the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine on the recommendation of the Appointing Committee. The appointment would be for two years from 3 April 2006 to 2 April 2008.

CRT/2005/56.8 Synergy Fund Board

Court noted that Professor Michael Scott-Morton had agreed to serve as a University Director on the Board of the Synergy Fund, in succession to Dr Keith Nimmo who had demitted office as a co-opted member of Court in December 2005.

CRT/2005/56.9 Bequests

The University noted the receipt of the following bequests:

- A gift of £220,000 from the US-based Friends of Glasgow University Inc., arising from a donation from the estate of the late Ruby Glenis FORBES of Philadelphia. The sum would be applied to the Small Animal Hospital and Rowardennan Field Station
- £3,943 from the late Miss MS BREMNER, which will be applied to the Small Animal Hospital and Rowardennan Field Station. This is in addition to funds received in December 2005, which were reported to Court at that time.
- £7,468 from the late Dr Joyce Gladys MINTON: to Crichton University College, Dumfries, to be used for the annual Muriel Carmichael Prose Prize. The sum is in addition to £250,000 received in January 2003 and £118,381.86 received in October 2003, bequeathed to Crichton University College, Dumfries to be used for academic staff appointments in the disciplines of environmental science and local studies.
Court noted that the Secretary of Court, acting under delegated authority and on behalf of Court, had approved the appointment of Mr James Carrigan as a Trustee of the Non-Academic Staff Pension Scheme in place of Mr George Gardiner. Mr Carrigan is the nominated representative from the craftsmen's union. The membership would therefore stand as:

Dr Craig C Reedie, Chairman
Sir Muir Russell, Principal
Mr David Newall, Secretary of Court
Mr Robert Fraser, Director of Finance
Mr John Speirs, Central Services
Ms M McParland, Library
Mr Robert Harkins, Department of Electronics & Electrical Engineering,
Mr James Carrigan, Estates & Buildings

**CRT/2005/57. Communications from Senate**

Court noted the Communications from Senate, which were tabled at the meeting.

**CRT/2005/58. Any Other Business**

Court noted that this was the last meeting of Court to be attended by Mr Ian Hawkins in his capacity as Clerk to Court. The Vice-Chairman thanked him for his support and wished him all the best for the future.

**CRT/2005/59. Date of Next Meeting**

The next meeting of Court would be held on 28 June 2006 at 14:00 in the lecture theatre on Level 2 of the Business School.

Prepared by: Ian Hawkins Clerk to Committee i.hawkins@admin.gla.ac.uk
Last modified on: Monday 3 July 2006
Version: 1