UNIVERSITY OF GLASGOW
Court

Minute of Meeting held on Wednesday 10 December 2008
in The Senate Room

Present:
Mr David Anderson General Council Assessor, Ms Susan Ashworth Employee Representative, Dr Olwyn Byron Senate Assessor, Professor Muffy Calder Senate Assessor, Professor Andrew Christie Co-opted Member, Mr Peter Daniels Co-opted Member, Ms Susan Dunsmore General Council Assessor, Dr Robin Easton Co-opted Member, Professor Eleanor Gordon Senate Assessor, Rt Hon Charles Kennedy MP Rector (Chair), Mr Gavin Lee SRC President, Dr Martin Macaulay Senate Assessor, Mr Alan Macfarlane General Council Assessor, Mr Jim Mackechnie Glasgow City Council, Dr Laura Martin Senate Assessor, Professor Keith Millar Senate Assessor, Mr Alex Ross Employee Representative, Mr David Ross General Council Assessor (from item 19), Sir Muir Russell Principal, Professor Michael Scott-Morton Co-opted Member, Professor Mona Siddiqui Senate Assessor, Mr Kevin Sweeney General Council Assessor, Mrs Joy Travers Chancellor's Assessor (Vice-Chair), Mr Filippo Trevisan SRC Assessor

In attendance:
Professor Steve Beaumont (Vice-Principal Research & Enterprise), Mr Ian Black (Director of Human Resources), Professor Graham Caie (Clerk of Senate), Professor John Coggins (Vice-Principal Life Sciences & Medicine), Mr Robert Fraser (Director of Finance), Professor Neal Juster (Vice-Principal Strategy & Resources), Mr Jim McConnell (Director of Estates and Buildings), Ms Deborah Maddern (Administrative Officer), Mr David Newall (Secretary of Court), Professor Andrea Nolan (Vice-Principal Learning, Teaching and Internationalisation), Ms Susan Stewart (Director of Corporate Communications)

Apologies:
Members: Ms Barbara Duffner Co-opted Member

CRT/2008/12. Announcements
Court welcomed Mr David Anderson, General Council Assessor, Professor Eleanor Gordon, Senate Assessor, and Mr Filippo Trevisan, SRC Assessor, to their first meeting of Court.

CRT/2008/13. Search Committee
Mrs Travers announced that the Search Committee’s unanimous recommendation for the next Principal of the University was Professor Anton Muscatelli, the current Vice-Chancellor of Heriot-Watt University. Court approved the recommendation. The Rector thanked Mr Newall on behalf of the Search Committee for the exemplary way in which the appointment process had been run.
CRT/2008/14. Presentations

Professor Elizabeth Moignard, Dean of the Faculty of Arts, gave an overview of the Faculty’s strategic objectives and performance, as part of the series of presentations by Deans. The main strategic objectives of the Faculty were: to enhance and add to current international distinction in research; to continue to provide an education of the highest quality at undergraduate and graduate level; to develop and maintain a strong resource base; and to grow a sustainable level of support to allow all staff to develop and excel. To achieve the first of these the Faculty was increasing its recruitment of overseas students particularly in the undergraduate area, where students would also feed into postgraduate study in due course. The Faculty had strong practice-related research and teaching, particularly in Archaeology, Music and HATII (the Humanities Advanced Technology and Information Institute).

Highlights in research and teaching included 98% of research-active staff being entered in the RAE in 16 Units of Assessment; the highest value AHRC research grant holders in the UK; 5% of academic staff being AHRC Peer Review College members; 8 RAE panellists and a Panel Chair; and a third consecutive Teaching Excellence award.

Capital projects were in hand including the extension of the Hetherington Building for the School of Modern Languages and Cultures.

Opportunities existed for cross-disciplinary activity, new directions in more traditional subjects and enhanced relationships with the city and other partners. There were some challenges relating to space, and also arising from the very diverse nature of the departments in the Faculty.

Court thanked Professor Moignard for her presentation.

Mr Gavin Lee, SRC President, gave a presentation on the Student Representative Council’s (SRC) Annual Report for 2007/2008. The representational role of the SRC was highlighted, showing it engaged with students, university stakeholders and external partners such as the local community. There had been a SRC survey on the Advisor of Study system, which had informed the wider discussions around the University review of student advisory needs. There had been some notable successes for the SRC arising from its involvement with CHESS, the coalition of HE students in Scotland, from its discussions with banks to improve the quality of service provided to international students, and in relation to unfair mobile phone contracts. The student media had had a very successful year in 2007/2008, winning a number of awards. Areas of growth for the SRC included the development of the campus to halls minibus service. Mr Lee noted that the SRC’s finances were carefully managed and that it was running a cost efficient service.

Court thanked Mr Lee for his presentation.

CRT/2008/15. Minutes of the meeting held on Wednesday 8 October 2008

It was agreed that Minute CRT/2008/8.2 Remuneration Committee should be amended so that the second bullet point of the second paragraph began “That no additional performance-related awards should be made to Professorial staff in 2008/2009.” It was agreed also that the issue of performance related awards would be considered further by Court in its discussion of the Principal’s report (see CRT/2008/17.2 below). The minutes were otherwise approved.

CRT/2008/16. Matters Arising

There were no Matters Arising.
CRT/2008/17. Report from the Principal

CRT/2008/17.1 Naval Architecture and Marine Engineering
Court noted that the Senior Management Group had approved a proposal, supported by the Dean of Engineering, that the University should begin discussions with the University of Strathclyde about withdrawal from involvement with the Department of Naval Architecture and Marine Engineering, which would no longer be badged as a joint department. The creation of the joint department had been successful in strengthening the position of what had been two under-performing departments, but the reality now was that the current joint department was for all practical purposes part of Strathclyde. The staff attached great importance to the University of Glasgow name and history, and wanted to explore the option of creating something more generally joint. This would be explored urgently, against a strict deadline of mid-January. A further report would be made to Court.

CRT/2008/17.2 Pay Award
Court noted that following Court's decision in October regarding the 2008 Pay Award, the Management Group had agreed as follows:

The Professorial (and Senior Administrative staff) review exercise, already underway in October, would run through to its conclusion. While no performance-related awards would be made, an assessment of each member of staff's performance would be agreed and recorded. This would keep open the possibility of performance being rewarded over a two year period if performance pay was re-instated in 2009/2010.

The Recognition and Reward exercise for Non-Professorial staff normally involved staff being invited in January to submit cases for additional incremental reward. SMG had decided that it was consistent with the Court’s views on Professorial performance pay that no such invitation should be issued in January 2009, but that performance over a two year period could be taken into account if and assuming Recognition and Reward were reinstated in 2009/2010.

Court approved this course of action.

CRT/2008/17.3 Staff Engagement and Wellbeing Survey
Court noted that the University had run two staff engagement and wellbeing surveys in recent years, in 2005 and in 2007, and that the Management Group had agreed that a further survey should be undertaken in the Spring of 2009.

CRT/2008/17.4 Research Assessment Exercise
Court noted that the basic results of the RAE would be made available to the University on 17 December, and would be advised to staff, and to Court members, as soon as possible thereafter, following some analysis. The financial implications of the exercise would not be known until the spring, following which research structures would be looked at to try to achieve optimal cross-disciplinary alignments, and appropriate investment would be made in key areas.

CRT/2008/17.5 Student Lifecycle Project
Court noted that the Project Board was reviewing the University's business processes for student administration. Where processes impacted on academic
policy, they would be reported to Senate for discussion. A due diligence exercise was under way with respect to the contract.

CRT/2008/18. Report from the Rector

Court noted that several surgeries had been held by the Rector and that he had been involved in a number of university events, including the launch on university campuses of the One Voice group which promoted dialogue between Israelis and Palestinians, and a UUK meeting at the House of Commons.

CRT/2008/19. Reports of Court Committees

CRT/2008/19.1 Finance Committee

CRT/2008/19.1.1 University Financial Statements

The Director of Finance, Robert Fraser, gave a presentation on the University’s financial statements for the year to 31 July 2008.

Court noted that the financial statements for 2008 showed a continuation of recent trends, with a third consecutive increase in operating surplus and further improvement in the cash position. There had been an underlying operating surplus of £6.9m delivered in 2008 which showed a £0.5m improvement against the year to 31 July 2007, a £2.5m improvement against original budget for 2008 and a £1.5m improvement against the forecast submitted to the Scottish Funding Council in June 2008. Court expressed its appreciation to the Faculties for this result.

Net assets had decreased during 2008 by £21.5m. The main adverse movements had been a reduction in the market value of endowment assets, an increase in the FRS 17 pension liability and a reduction in working capital. These movements had been partially offset by growth in both fixed assets and the cash and deposits position.

Cash and deposits had increased during 2008 by £27.0m to a closing balance of £67.1m. The main positive movements had been a strong operating cashflow, a reduction in working capital and the second instalment of £5.0m associated with the sale of the St Andrew’s campus. This had been offset by continued net capital expenditure in line with the estates strategy.

Court noted that the need to maintain growth was important. If present trends continued, there would be a deficit in 2008/2009 assuming investment in maintenance continued. The main contingencies in the coming year related to the impact of the wage settlement and increased USS contributions. In terms of achievements against the strategic plan, there could be challenges with respect to international student numbers.

Court noted that no audit adjustments had been proposed or made to the figures, and agreed that this reflected well on the robustness of the figures and on the Finance Office team, who were thanked for their work.

Court approved the University Financial Statements for the year to 31 July 2008.
CRT/2008/19.1.2 Universities Subsidiaries Financial Statements

Court noted that the Finance Committee had reviewed the financial statements of the University’s subsidiary companies for the year to 31 July 2008 and had agreed to recommend the statements to Court. Following the practice adopted last year, Court approved the financial statements of the subsidiary companies on the understanding that these had been considered in detail by the Finance Committee. Court also noted that the papers were available for inspection in the Court Office.

CRT/2008/19.1.3 University Trust Financial Statements

Court noted that the Finance Committee had reviewed the financial statements of the University Trust for the year to 31 July 2008 and had agreed to recommend the statements to Court. Court approved the financial statements of the Trust on the understanding that these had been considered in detail by the Finance Committee. Court also noted that the papers were available for inspection in the Court Office.

CRT/2008/19.1.4 Financial Regulations

The Financial Regulations were approved by Court.

CRT/2008/19.1.5 New Accounts

Court endorsed the Finance Committee’s approval of the opening of a 2 new bank accounts.

CRT/2008/19.2 Audit Committee

Mr Tom O’Connell, convener of the Audit Committee, attended to brief Court on the annual report of the Audit Committee.

The external auditors had issued an unqualified report on the 2007/2008 financial statements including those of the subsidiary companies. This was a positive outcome and the Audit Committee had appreciated the quality of the information from the Finance Office.

The Audit Committee had been pleased with progress in respect of Internal Audit, including a demonstrable commitment by the University to address recommendations, of which there had been notably fewer in the Priority 1 category. The Committee had also been pleased that risk management workshops had taken place in line with its suggestion.

Court thanked Mr O’Connell for his briefing, and recorded its appreciation to him for his chairmanship of the Audit Committee and for his contribution to the positive changes to the approach to internal audit.

CRT/2008/19.3 Human Resources Committee

CRT/2008/19.3.1 Absence Management Report

HR Committee had considered an Internal Audit report on absence management, and had been concerned that steps should be taken to improve the University’s practice in managing sick absence. The Committee intended to discuss the issue further in early 2009.
CRT/2008/19.3.2 Key Performance Indicators

Court noted that data for KPIs were being refined and would form the basis of a report to Court at its next meeting.

CRT/2008/19.3.3 September Weekend

Mr Black advised that the arrangements had been successful, in what were difficult circumstances, with very limited negative feedback having been received.

CRT/2008/19.3.4 Collective Consultation Forum Agreement

Court approved the Collective Consultation Forum Agreement, creating a central University-wide collective consultation forum to enable the University and unions to meet, discuss and facilitate collective consultation arising specifically from fixed term funded redundancies. The agreement would now be implemented.

CRT/2008/19.4 Estates Committee

CRT/2008/19.4.1 Capital Projects

Court noted that Capex applications had been approved in respect of the refurbishment of accommodation in Southpark Avenue and in the Boyd Orr Building.

CRT/2008/19.4.2 Student Residences Opportunity

Court agreed that a group comprising the Vice-Chair of Court, the Principal, Mr Christie, Mr Daniels, Mr Fraser and Mr Newall should take forward discussions about the possibility of acquiring additional student accommodation, on the basis that such accommodation would help with housing needs arising from increased international student numbers and would enable the University to dispose of some older property. Subject to satisfactory terms being negotiated, the group should have authority to acquire the property for the University.

CRT/2008/20. Report from the Secretary of Court

CRT/2008/20.1 Review of University Health Service

Court was reminded that in October it had received the preliminary report of the group established to review the nature and structure of the University Health Service (UHS). The group’s final report was now provided for Court’s consideration. The proposed model for the service was that student health and wellbeing services should be provided through a service level agreement with the NHS GP practice due to locate in the Fraser Building; that there should be expanded and improved Occupational Health Services as part of an integrated Staff Health and Wellbeing Service; and that there should be continued enhanced provision of psychiatry and clinical psychology services for staff and students.

Mr Sweeney, who had chaired the review group, explained that consultation with affected parties had begun and Court would receive a report on this at its
February 2009 meeting. The proposed NHS practice would provide a standard NHS-type service for students, with a wider range of facilities than presently available. The mental health services for staff and students would continue. The review group had visited a number of University-based medical practices in the UK and their Occupational Health Service models had informed the group’s report.

Court received submissions from Ms Ashworth on behalf of staff who had contacted her with some concerns. These were that the staff in the UHS felt they had had little time to respond to the proposals in the review group’s paper; that more consultation was needed; that a NHS service could not provide the bespoke service which the UHS currently provided; that there were defrayed costs because University staff would have to take time off to go to their local GP; that there were responsibilities to current users of the UHS; that the UHS was particularly effective in the area of mental health and that there would be an impact in this area; and that the Student Counselling and Advisory Service was concerned about the impact of any changes on its work.

Mr Ross endorsed the submissions from Ms Ashworth and added that while he acknowledged that the review group had spoken to campus trade unions, the present report had arrived very suddenly, and that there were questions about how the new service would operate.

Mr Lee advised Court that the SRC had contributed to the review and was supportive of the move to a NHS-provided service. He commented that it would be important for waiting times not to be longer, and noted several points of detail on which clarification would be sought.

Court approved the model proposed by the review group for the future provision of health services in the University. Court requested that staff and students should be consulted on the new model and should receive a message explaining how the future service would compare with the current one.

**CRT/2008/20.2 Glasgow University Rugby Football Club**

Court noted a report prepared jointly by the Glasgow University Sports Association (GUSA) and the University's Sport and Recreation Service (SRS), concerning behaviour by members of the men's Rugby Club. Court approved the following proposal:

1. to instruct the Sports Association to amend its constitution such that the GUSA Council would have the power in future to implement disciplinary action against members or clubs;
2. that the Glasgow University Rugby Football Club be advised that it was suspended by Court from representing the University and from using the facilities of the University with effect from 1 January 2009;
3. that this suspension should remain until the Club had satisfied Court that it had put in place measures to ensure it would in future operate as a well functioning and inclusive club; and
4. that the Club should have the right to submit an appeal to Court.

**CRT/2008/20.3 Deans’ Appointments**

Court was reminded that Deans were eligible to serve two terms subject to Court approval. Recommendations for Deans to serve a second term were based on performance and also involved consultation.
Court noted that Professor Stuart Reid would complete his first four-year term of office as Dean of the Faculty of Veterinary Medicine on 31 December 2008. On the Principal’s recommendation, Court approved Professor Reid’s appointment to a second and final term of office, for the period 1 January 2009 to 31 December 2012.

Court noted that Professor Jim Conroy would complete his first four-year term of office as Dean of the Faculty of Education on 31 July 2009. On the Principal’s recommendation, Court approved Professor Conroy’s appointment to a second and final term of office, for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 July 2013.

CRT/2008/20.4 Appointment of SRC Assessor on Court

Court noted that Filippo Trevisan had been appointed as SRC Assessor on Court until 31 October 2009.

CRT/2008/20.5 Redundancy Appeal

Court was reminded that in June 2007 it had been advised that an appeal against redundancy had been received in respect of a post related to IT support for students with disabilities. An independent person had been engaged to hear the appeal and had now reported. Court noted that the appeal had not been upheld.

CRT/2008/20.6 Redundancy Committee - Department of Computing Science

Court was reminded that at its October meeting, it had approved 3 redundancies in the Department of Computing Science. Court noted that following this decision, the Principal and Secretary of Court, acting under authority delegated by the Remuneration Committee, had agreed the terms of voluntary severance payments to be offered to three members of staff for whom no suitable alternative employment opportunity had been identified.

CRT/2008/20.7 Management Appointments

Court noted that the Secretary of Court had approved the following management appointments on Court’s behalf:

**Headship of the Department of Accounting & Finance**
Professor Kwaku Opong to continue as head for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 July 2011

**Headship of the Department of Adult & Continuing Education**
Mr Rod Purcell to continue as head for the period 1 April 2009 to 31 July 2012

**Headship of the Dental School**
Professor Jeremy Bagg to continue as head for the period 1 January 2009 to 31 July 2011

**Headship of the Department of Economic & Social History**
Dr Duncan Ross for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 July 2013, in succession to Dr Neil Rollings

**Headship of the Department of History**
Dr Simon Ball for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 July 2013, in succession to Dr Donald Spaeth
Headship of the Department of Statistics
Professor John McColl for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 July 2013, in succession to Professor Marian Scott

Headship of the Department of Urban Studies
Professor Ken Gibb to continue as head for the period 1 August 2009 to 31 July 2011

Deputy Deanship of the Faculty of Information and Mathematical Sciences
Dr Ian Strachan for the period until 31 July 2010.

CRT/2008/20.8 General Council
Court was reminded that there had been earlier discussion on revising the nominations process for General Council Assessors on Court. The Privy Council had been contacted last year suggesting that the Business Council of the General Council be used as a mechanism for nominating members of the General Council willing to serve as Assessors on Court. This had been with the aim of avoiding having to hold a postal ballot of all graduates where the number of nominees exceeded the number of vacancies for General Council Assessors. Court noted that in the event the General Council had decided not to proceed with this matter.

CRT/2008/20.9 Amendment to Constitution of Hetherington Research Club
Court noted that the Secretary of Court had approved amendments to the constitution of the Hetherington Research Club, relating to affiliate memberships, the timings of elections and the chairing of the disciplinary committee.

CRT/2008/20.10 Resolutions
Court noted that the following Resolutions had been approved. They had been drafted following comments from the Senate and General Council, then reported to Court as having been approved in draft form, and no further comments had been received during the notice period for public comment. A copy of the Resolutions was available from the Court Office.

RESOLUTION NO. 507-3 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 507 - DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY
RESOLUTION 515 – DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF VETERINARY MEDICINE AND SURGERY
RESOLUTION 557-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION 557 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF RESEARCH
RESOLUTION NO. 558-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 558 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
RESOLUTION NO. 562-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 562 - DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF MEDICINE
RESOLUTION NO. 563-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 563 - DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF DENTAL SURGERY
RESOLUTION NO. 572 – DEGREE OF BACHELOR OF ARTS IN COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT AND LEARNING.
RESOLUTION 574 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE IN LEADING SUSTAINABLE CHANGE.

RESOLUTION NO. 575 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

RESOLUTION NO. 575-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 575 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

RESOLUTION NO. 576 – DEGREE OF MASTER OF LETTERS.

RESOLUTION NO. 576-1 – AMENDMENT OF RESOLUTION NO. 576 - DEGREE OF MASTER OF LETTERS

CRT/2008/21. Any Other Business

There was no other business.

CRT/2008/22. Communications from Meetings of Senate held on 16 October and 27 November 2008

The ‘Baseline’ Report for the Funding Council, with regard to Quality Arrangements was approved.

The Communications from Senate were otherwise noted.

CRT/2008/11. Date of Next Meeting

The next meeting of the Court will be held on Wednesday 11 February 2009 in the Senate Room at 1.30pm

Other dates for the 2008/2009 Session are

Wednesday 22 April 2009

Wednesday 24 June 2009